A Study of Missionary Activity in the Diocese of Athabasca, 1884-1903

George Michael Brandak

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholars.wlu.ca/etd

Part of the History of Religion Commons

Recommended Citation
https://scholars.wlu.ca/etd/1483

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by Scholars Commons @ Laurier. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses and Dissertations (Comprehensive) by an authorized administrator of Scholars Commons @ Laurier. For more information, please contact scholarscommons@wlu.ca.
A STUDY OF MISSIONARY ACTIVITY IN THE DIOCESE OF ATHABASCA,
1884 - 1903

A Thesis
Submitted to the Council of Graduate Studies
In Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements
For the Degree of
Master of Arts
in History

Waterloo Lutheran University

by

George Michael Brandak
Waterloo, Ontario
December, 1972
ABSTRACT

The historical advantage the Roman Catholic Church held over its Anglican counterpart in the Athabasca region militated against the latter's success. Owing to the dominant position established by the Oblates a generation prior to a resolute effort by the Church Missionary Society to evangelize the native population, the Anglicans were at a distinct disadvantage. Bishop Richard Young's policies were shaped not by a master plan but rather by the necessity of having to react to the activities of the Catholics. Despite expansion, the Church of England was able to establish a firm base only in those areas which, initially, the Romanists had virtually ignored.

Continuous missionary activity was brought to the Athabasca region in the 1840's with the coming of the Oblates. Upon acquiring a satisfactory degree of proficiency in the native languages and becoming knowledgeable in the customs and traditions of the Indians, the Roman Catholic priests set forth to baptize the adult natives inhabiting the vicariate of Athabasca-Mackenzie. The Indian population, for a variety of reasons, embraced the teachings of the Oblates, were converted to Catholicism, and established a certain rapport with the Oblates.

The Church of England, on the other hand, did not enter this region until the late 1860's. Although the Anglican Diocese of Athabasca was established in 1874, little missionary activity was undertaken during the episcopacy of W. C. Bompas. With the elevation of Richard Young to Bishop of Athabasca in 1884, a new era dawned for Anglican missionary
work in the region. The Anglican missionaries set about learning the language, customs and traditions of the native peoples. They were men who possessed what appeared to be the requisite characteristics for bringing Christianity and civilization to the Indians. And yet, despite their dedication and perseverance, they enjoyed little success in bringing the native population into the Church of England.

A thorough examination of the Letterbooks of Bishop Young and the Incoming and Outgoing Correspondence of the Church Missionary Society and the Diocese of Athabasca was undertaken in order to discover a legitimate explanation for the relative failure of the Anglicans to obtain converts among the native population in the Diocese of Athabasca. Although the development of the thesis was not dependent upon as thorough an examination of Oblate sources, pertinent information on Catholic missionary activity was obtained from the works of E. J. Champagne, Fernand-Michel, E. Grouard, and A. G. Morice, and Missions de la Congrégation des Missionaires Oblates de Marie Immaculée, a periodical published by the Oblates of Mary Immaculate.
The missionary activities of the Church of England in the Diocese of Athabasca has received little attention, with the exception of some rather glowing accounts appearing in a few official Church publications and a brief treatment in T.C.B. Boon's *The Anglican Church From the Bay to the Rockies*. This thesis represents an attempt to remedy the deficiency by reporting and examining the activities of the Anglican missionaries in the diocese and analyzing those factors operative in the Anglicans' failure to convert the native population to the precepts and beliefs of the Church of England. Emphasis has been placed on the use of sources relating to Anglican missionary activity in the diocese. Information of various aspects of Roman Catholic missionary activity has been utilized only to illustrate to what extent their activities affected the efforts of the Anglicans.

A discussion of the initial missionary activities of both the Oblates and Anglicans prior to 1884 poses the question "Can the Anglican missionaries overcome the historical advantage of the Roman Catholic Church in the diocese in their attempt to secure converts for the Church of England?"

This study will examine and evaluate the abilities, duties, and responsibilities of Richard Young, Bishop of the Diocese of Athabasca. The various Anglican missionaries who served in the diocese will also be discussed and evaluated. In the ensuing chapter, a general comparison of the goals, attitudes, resources, and educational activities of both
the Catholic and Anglican Churches will be undertaken to ascertain the significance of these factors in the Anglican failure to obtain a greater number of native converts. Because specific conclusions are drawn throughout the thesis, the concluding chapter will be dedicated to a discussion of the most significant reason for the Anglicans' rather dismal failure to bring Christianity and European civilization to the native population.

A mass of contradictory statistics and conflicting reports makes it extremely difficult to formulate firm conclusions on the number of converts to the Anglican faith and the number of Indian children attending Church boarding schools. If the success of missionary work is to be determined on the basis of numbers, the statistics submitted by Oblate and Anglican alike must be reconcilable. Unfortunately, such is not the case, and so it has been necessary to rely primarily on the somewhat dubious figures provided by the Canada Department of Indian Affairs.

The author wishes to express his sincere gratitude to Dr. W. H. Heick for valuable assistance and thoughtful guidance. The author is also indebted to Mr. S. D. Hanson, University of Saskatchewan Archivist, who read the several drafts and whose suggestions and criticisms enhanced the quality of this study, to the staff of the Provincial Museum and Archives of Alberta for their kind assistance and cooperation, and to Ms. Karen Robson, who typed the final draft.

Finally, the author wishes to express his special appreciation to his wife Anne for her patience, understanding and encouragement.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter I. A Modest Beginning</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II. Richard Young as Bishop</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III. Bishop Young's Missionaries</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV. Christianizing and Civilizing</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter V. Conclusion</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sources

T.C.B. Boon, The Anglican Church From the Bay to the Rockies (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1962)

Emile Jean Baptiste Marie Grouard, Souvenirs de mes soixante ans d'apostolat dans l'Athabaska-MacKenzie (Lyon: Oeuvre Apostolique de O.M.I., 1925)

Ernest Voorhis, Historic Forts and Trading Posts (Ottawa: King's Printer, 1930)
CHAPTER I
A Modest Beginning

Prior to 1884, the Roman Catholic Church had carried out a more intense proselytizing program among the native population inhabiting the area between Fort Chipewyan and Athabasca Landing, and between the Athabasca River and the Rocky Mountains than had the Church of England. This chapter will trace the development of the missionary activities of both groups and assess the opportunity for Anglican expansion under the leadership of Rt. Rev. Richard Young, Bishop of Athabasca. The socio-economic position of the Indian population will also be discussed.

Initially, Anglican missionary work tended to bypass the territory within the present Diocese of Athabasca for work further north. In 1858, James Hunter, the first Anglican minister to journey through the Athabasca district, had stopped only briefly at Fort Chipewyan on his way to Fort Simpson.¹ Two other clergymen arrived at Fort Simpson in 1859 and 1862 to assist in the Anglican missionary activity north of Fort Chipewyan. William Carpenter Bompas², after wintering at Fort Chipewyan in 1867-68, became the first Anglican clergyman to travel up

the Peace River to Fort Vermilion where he initiated Anglican missionary activity in the Peace River district.

After another visit to Fort Vermilion in 1870-71, Bompas wrote:

If I have to leave this district a second time unoccupied, the Indians will lose all confidence in the permanence and reliability of our instruction, and will be thrown more completely than ever into the arms of Rome.3

However, as a clergyman in the Diocese of Rupert's Land4, also responsible for ministering to the needs of the natives north of Fort Chipewyan to the Arctic Ocean and west to the Rocky Mountains, Bompas could not give the Peace River and Athabasca districts the proper attention to promote the development of Anglicanism. Owing to his constant travelling over the boundless northland, Bompas has been described as "Indisputably the most self-sacrificing bishop in the world." Nevertheless, even after his consecration as Bishop of Athabasca in 1874, a major factor for the arrested development of missionary work was the necessity of Bompas to itinerate continually throughout the large diocese. Dictated by circumstances as well as his own personal preference, Bompas was more of an active missionary rather than a supervisor and coordinator of missionary activity. By 1884, the Anglican contingent in the southern portion of

3 Cody, p. 134.

4 The original Diocese of Rupert's Land, created in 1849, had been subdivided into the Dioceses of Moosonee, 1872, Saskatchewan, 1874, Athabasca, 1874, and Assiniboia, 1883. For a map of the Ecclesiastical Province of Rupert's Land, 1883, see Boon, p. 116.
the Diocese of Athabasca consisted only of Alfred Campbell Garrioch\(^5\) and Erastus J. Lawrence\(^6\) at Fort Vermilion, J. Gough Brick\(^7\) at Dunvegan, and William Day Reeve\(^8\) at Fort Chipewyan.

As Bishop of Athabasca, Bompas's most significant decision relating to the southern portion of the diocese was to increase Anglican influence in the Fort Vermilion region. After the Diocesan Synod of 1876, Bompas transferred A.C. Garrioch from Fort Chipewyan to Fort Vermilion, charging him with the responsibility of establishing an Anglican mission at the southern fort. Bompas expected that the development of a mission field in the south, which included both a school and a farm, would act as a

---

5 Alfred Campbell Garrioch was stationed at Fort Chipewyan, Fort Vermilion and Dunvegan respectively between 1874 and 1891. For an autobiographical account of some of his experiences see: A.C. Garrioch, The Far and Furry North (Winnipeg: Douglass-McIntyre Printing & Binding Co., 1925); and A.C. Garrioch, A Hatchet Mark in Duplicate (Toronto: Ryerson Press [c. 1929].

6 Erastus J. Lawrence was the principal of the Anglican training school at Fort Vermilion from 1880 to 1891. Afterward, he became fully engaged in farming in the area. For the activities of the Lawrence family in the Fort Vermilion area, see: Eugenie Louise Myles, The Emperor of the Peace (Edmonton: Co-op Press, 1965).


8 The Most Reverend William Day Reeve began his missionary work at Fort Simpson in 1869. After serving as archdeacon of Athabasca, Reeve was consecrated Bishop of Mackenzie River in 1891. Reeve resigned his position in 1907 to become the Assistant Bishop of Toronto from 1907 to 1924. W.A. Burman, "The New Bishop of Mackenzie River", The Rupert's Land Gleaner, 1 (December 1891), pp. 1-2; Mockridge, pp. 364-368; and Boon, pp. 220-234, passim.
panacea to the current problems of both the native population and the Church of England. He anticipated that a training school would eventually play an important role in the extension of Anglican influence in the Peace River district. A mission farm, he believed, would diminish dependency on the Hudson's Bay Company for supplies by providing food for the mission's inhabitants. After Garrioch completed the construction of the mission house, Bompas granted him a furlough in 1878 to travel to Eastern Canada where he was to solicit funds for the proposed boarding school, as well as hire a teacher and a farmer.

Planning for further Anglican expansion in the south, Bompas sent Thomas Bunn, formerly a teacher at Fort Chipewyan, to the Peace River district to establish a mission at Dunvegan. Finding the work discouraging, Bunn resigned and was replaced by J. Gough Brick, a man enthusiastic about the area's agricultural potential.

In a diocese which seemed so vast that one traveller simply stated that "It is a large country," many possibilities for missionary activity were available to the Church of England. In an attempt to reach the Indians, missions could initially be developed at the most central

10 Garrioch, Hatchet Mark, p. 35.
locations in most areas -- the fur trading posts. The following will examine the possibilities for Anglican missionary activity that existed in 1884 at Athabasca Landing, Fort Chipewyan, Fort Vermilion, Fort Dunvegan, and Lesser Slave Lake. The Church of England would have to establish its priorities before attempting to expand its influence in the diocese.

The future of Anglican missionary activity in the diocese would be greatly influenced by accessibility and the changing economic patterns produced by the influx of white settlers to the region. With the exception of certain portions of the Peace River district, Athabasca was a wooded region interspersed with rivers, streams and lakes; an ideal hunting and fishing ground. Entry to and travel in this vast territory was facilitated by the Peace and Athabasca Rivers, which drained the area on their way to Lake Athabasca. Entry to the diocese from the south was gained through Athabasca Landing, a fledgling community founded by the HBC as a distribution point for supplies being transported to and from the northern areas. Its ability to receive as well as dispatch mail more rapidly than other northern posts gave Athabasca Landing a communication advantage over the rest of the diocese and consequently warranted careful consideration as a future Church of England mission site. That many Indians, rather than deal at other posts, came directly to Athabasca Landing to exchange their furs, was yet another important consideration.

In the northern portion of the diocese, the question whether to maintain and attempt to expand Anglican work was a difficult one to
answer. The Anglican mission at Fort Chipewyan enjoyed little success.\textsuperscript{12} Garrioch reported that during the winter of 1874-75 there were only six Protestant families at the fort with children of school age\textsuperscript{13} and the situation had not improved. The location of Fort Chipewyan, on the other hand, made it an excellent centre for communication with missions on the Mackenzie River. Since the headquarters of the HBC and the Roman Catholic Church for the Athabasca district were represented at Fort Chipewyan, the lack of Anglican representation at such an important post could weaken whatever prestige they had obtained among the native population. However, if a mission at Fort Chipewyan were to be maintained, missionary activity in the area would have to be expanded to justify operating expenses.

The Church of England appeared to be in a somewhat better position at Fort Vermilion where they had a mission house, school, farm, and a church in the final stages of construction.\textsuperscript{14} The school failed to

\begin{enumerate}
\item To the west of Fort Chipewyan, facing the lake, was a row of small houses occupied by those who were dependent on the fur traders for support. The Anglican mission was located at the end of this row. J.B. Tyrrell and D.B. Dowling, "Report on the Country Between Athabasca Lake and Churchill River", Geological Survey of Canada, VIII, n.s. (1895), p. 55D.
\item Garrioch, \textit{Hatchet Mark}, p. 12.
\item Originally, the mission farm was established in 1880 near the confluence of the Peace and Smoky Rivers. The farm was relocated at Fort Vermilion owing to the advantages of having the school and farm together. Garrioch, \textit{Hatchet Mark}, p. 139.
\end{enumerate}
fulfill the Church's, or rather Bompas's, expectations. In December, 1881, E.J. Lawrence, the principal, had estimated that the school could board twenty children, but it never obtained that number of students for any one teaching year. Even allowing for the westward movement of the Beaver, leaving the area primarily occupied by the Wood Cree, the school should have acquired more boarders than it did.

Nevertheless, the likelihood of further Anglican activity at Fort Vermilion was a distinct possibility. The Anglicans desired to develop a strong boarding school program at Fort Vermilion, an agricultural area, because it was felt that an expanding training school would expedite conversion of the Indian and facilitate the ministering to his needs if he were to have a settled rather than nomadic life. The Indian was considered capable of being transformed into a farmer if he were trained from his childhood toward that end. It was generally agreed:

That individual enterprise in the agricultural line, even among the Indians of the North-West Territories, has been shown, is proved by the many instances of competition at the exhibitions held in the towns and villages, and by their success in carrying off prizes, notwithstanding the keen competition on the part of white settlers, which they had to encounter.

Possibly, extended missionary activity in the Fort Vermilion area could achieve one of the desired goals of the Church of England.

---

15 Leaflet stating the work of the Ft. Vermilion Training School, Feb. 5, 1883, Anglican Diocese of Athabasca Papers (ADA), accession no. 68.242, microfilm reel no. 30, Provincial Museum and Archives of Alberta (PMAA). All Anglican Diocese of Athabasca papers referred to were available at PMAA.

16 Canada, Sessional Papers, Department of Indian Affairs, XXI, No.13, 1888, p. Ixxx. Only Canadian Sessional Papers are referred to in the thesis.
A likelihood of the transformation of the Peace River district into a huge agricultural region could grant the Church of England the opportunity of assisting the Indian toward a new way of life. The growing scarcity of game indicated that much of the Indian population would have to adopt a way of life differing substantially from that of the traditional and nomadic life of the hunter. Dunvegan, the major fur trading post in the region, was in decline. By the 1880's, the beaver population represented only one-eighth of what it was in 1830.17 The HBC, facing an ever-increasing loss of trade, moved its headquarters from the Peace River district to Lesser Slave Lake.

The agricultural potential of the district, however, was impressive. Observers suggested that the rich land and mild climate assured future settlement of the district.18 It was favorably compared with Manitoba,

an area once virtually barren of settlement, and then suddenly teeming with settlers. An optimistic Bompas stated that the region was becoming more accessible and would be "Shortly within three weeks of a railway, and within a fortnight of a telegraph station." Reports were so enthusiastic that the Church Missionary Society anticipated that it would no longer be responsible for the bishop's entire salary. CMS apparently assumed that the difference would be made up through the contributions by the new settlers. If this anticipated influx transpired, Anglican expansion would be essential if the Church's aims in the region were to reach fruition. Surely the one missionary stationed in the area could not be expected to attend to the current needs of the Indians, establish an agricultural settlement, and administer to additional white settlement.

Other regions in the diocese afforded an opportunity for Anglican expansion. Fort St. John, in the western portion of the diocese, was a possible mission site from which to serve the Beaver population on its trek westward in search of more productive hunting grounds. Fort


20 Bompas to Church Missionary Society (CMS), October 21, 1882, CMS Records, microfilm number A-121, PAC. All CMS records referred to were available at PAC.

21 C. C. Fenn, secretary of the CMS, to A. Cowley, November 15, 1883, CMS/A-121.
McMurray, visited only infrequently by missionaries from Fort Chipewyan, was another possibility, owing to its geographical location. At the confluence of the Clearwater and Athabasca Rivers, Fort McMurray served as a fur trading post for the HBC.

However, Lesser Slave Lake and its hinterland was probably the most favorable region for Anglican expansion. The presence of a marsh-land covered with wild hay and a small prairie near Lesser Slave Lake was conducive to a small agricultural settlement.¹² Then too, the Cree Indians scattered around the lake would probably be easier to teach than many of the Indians in the diocese because they were already semi-nomadic, supplementing their staple diet of fish and game with potatoes and turnips. North of Lesser Slave Lake, between the Peace and Athabasca Rivers, was a fertile area for future missionary work among the Wood Cree population. Its forest belt of spruce and aspen, concealing large muskegs and swamps, had left it virtually untouched by missionaries of any religious faith.²³

In any case, there were areas for Anglican expansion. The direction in which expansion would move and the availability of funds were another

---

²² Dawson, p. 50B. Horetzky also reported, "Unlimited quantities of wild grass around the Lesser Slave Lake post". Horetzky, p. 25.

²³ For a description of the area see: R.G. McConnell, "Report on a Portion of the District of Athabasca comprising the country between Peace River and Athabasca River North of Lesser Slave Lake", Geological Survey of Canada (Ottawa: Queen's Printer, 1893), p. 6D. Owing to its terrain, the area was an ideal trapping country from which traders had taken over twelve thousand beaver pelts in 1878. Dawson, p. 91B.
matter. Even if Anglican missionaries were to obtain adequate financing for additional endeavours in the Athabasca diocese, they would find their work severely restricted in the face of opposition from the Roman Catholic Church, which looked upon the Athabasca and Peace River districts as its private domain.

The Roman Catholic Church held a profound historical advantage over the Church of England, having made extensive inroads in the diocese several decades before the arrival of the Anglicans. Founded in 1842 at Lac St. Anne, some forty-five miles west of Edmonton, St. Anne's mission had been used as a base for travel to the Peace River and Lesser Slave Lake by Reverend Fathers Jean Baptiste Thibeault and Joseph Bourassa during the 1840's. The Oblates continued their visits to the Peace River district and strengthened their work considerably with the establishment of a mission at Dunvegan in 1867 by Father F. Tissier, and a permanent resident at Lesser Slave Lake as early as 1872.  


25 Ibid., pp. 39-41.

26 Horetzky found Father Remas, sent from Lac la Biche, in a log house serving the purpose of chapel, dwelling, and school at Lesser Slave Lake in 1872. Horetzky, p. 26.
Henri Faraud, the first resident missionary in Athabasca, established himself at Fort Chipewyan in 1849, two years after Bishop Alexander Taché's initial visit to Lake Athabasca. The Mission of the Nativity at Fort Chipewyan was completed in 1851 and used as a base for northern missionary work. Proselytizing journeys not only extended down the Mackenzie River, eastward to Ile à la Crosse and Fond du Lac, and westward to the Liard River, but also up the Peace River to Forts Vermilion and Dunvegan.

In addition to their earlier contact with the Indian population, strong organization gave the Oblates a considerable advantage over the Anglicans in Athabasca. The Roman Catholic Church consolidated northern missionary work with the consecration of Mgr. Henry Faraud as the Vicar-Apostolic of Athabasca-Mackenzie in 1862, twelve years before Bompas became the first Anglican Bishop of Athabasca. As early as 1856, the Oblate priests Maisonneuve and Tissot arrived at Lac la Biche and established the mission as a supply depot and a base for a transportation system to the northern missions with a view to curtailing expenses and

27 Alexander A. Taché, Vingt Années de Missions dans le Nord-Ouest de L'Amérique (Montreal: Eusèbe Senécal, 1866), pp. 21-34, passim.

ensuring a measure of independence from the HBC. Then too, with the exception of some English *metis*, the *metis* were of the Roman Catholic faith which placed the Anglican Church in a difficult position. Their number within the diocese, as the issuing of nearly two thousand *metis* scrips during the course of the negotiations for Treaty No. 8 indicated, was sizable in comparison to the total population. They lived by the fur trade or adopted a semi-nomadic way of life, frequently intermingling with the Indian population. This enabled the Oblate priests to exercise not only their own influence, but also that of the *metis* on the Indian.

The Anglican missionaries were obliged to justify not only the expansion of missionary work in a territory strongly dominated by the Roman Catholic Church but also the expenditure of large sums in a vast but sparsely populated area. Questionable statistics make it difficult to ascertain the Indian population of Athabasca in the nineteenth century. Census returns for most of the 1880's estimated the resident and nomadic Indian population in the Athabasca district at 8,000 and 2,038 in the Peace River district. That these estimates were greatly exaggerated is clearly evident when they are compared with the 1892 returns which placed the Indian population of both districts at only 3,394.

29 Morice, I, pp. 252-253. Lac la Biche was later placed under Mgr. Faraud's management until 1889 when it reverted to the Diocese of St. Albert. Morice, II, p. 88.


31 *Sessional Papers*, Department of Indian Affairs, XXVI, 1893. Population stated above does not include Hay River, population 122.
However, despite the inaccuracy of the estimates of the 1880's, there can be little doubt that the Chipewyan, Wood Cree and Beaver, who comprised the majority of the Indian population in the Athabasca diocese, decreased during the latter half of the nineteenth century, owing to disease and the scarcity of food. Their susceptibility to disease prompted an official of the Department of Indian Affairs to comment that:

It has been necessary year after year to reiterate the statement that scrofula and pulmonary diseases, more particularly phthisis with its correlative hemorrhage, have been the scourge of the Indian population. Disease was particularly rampant among the Beaver population. Unable to comprehend the nature of their sickness, they were observed returning to their hunting grounds, taking with them individuals "who still had the measles out upon them". When advised by Rev. A.C. Garrioch of the scrofulous condition of the Beaver, Montreal physicians stated that nothing could be done to save them from extinction. Cases of tuberculosis and related diseases were more numerous among those Indians completely dependent upon the fur trade or who became semi-nomadic,

32 In addition, about three hundred Iroquois were said to inhabit the area south of the Upper Peace River. Senate Journals, Appendix, 1888, p. 164. The Slave Indians touched upon the northern portions of the diocese, trading often at Fort Chipewyan and some posts on the Peace River. Diamond Jenness, Indians of Canada (Ottawa: National Museum of Canada, 1960), p. 390.

33 Sessional Papers, Department of Indian Affairs, XXXV, 1901, p. xix.

34 Richard Young to Fenn, November 25, 1886, ADA/30.

35 Garrioch, p. 59.
settling near the major posts. A dietary change occasioned by the increased consumption of bacon and flour and a tendency to inhabit wooden cabins made them more susceptible to disease than the nomadic Indian population.\textsuperscript{36}

Contemporaries rated the scarcity of food as important as disease in contributing to the decrease in population. The Commissioner for Treaty No. 8 submitted that: "The health of the Indians in the district seems to vary with the times. When game is plentiful it is good, when scarce, it is bad."\textsuperscript{37} While admitting that two hundred deaths in the fall of 1886 were caused by measles, an Anglican clergyman observed that: "The principal 'sickness' is a want of food."\textsuperscript{38}

Several factors contributed to the scarcity of food in the Athabasca district. Because the rabbit was the main small game staple, years in which its numbers declined drastically represented years of severe hardship for the Indian.\textsuperscript{39} The expansion of the fur trade into the Athabasca and Peace River districts brought with it intense competition from American free traders,\textsuperscript{40} competition which endangered many species of fur-bearing animals yielding both pelts and food. Another important

\textsuperscript{36} Zaslow, Opening of the Canadian North, p. 94.

\textsuperscript{37} Sessional Papers, Department of Indian Affairs, XXXV, 1901, p. x1.

\textsuperscript{38} Senate Journals, Appendix, 1888, p. 195.

\textsuperscript{39} Ibid., p. 101 and p. 195.

\textsuperscript{40} Emile Jean-Baptiste Marie Grouard, Souvenirs de mes soixante ans d'apostolat dans l'Athabaska-Mackenzie (Lyon: Oeuvre Apostolique de O.M.I., 1925), p. 204. Free traders are also mentioned as energetically competing against the HBC in: Alfred C. Selwyn, "Report on Exploration in British Columbia in 1875", Geological Survey of Canada (1877), p.63.
staple of the region's Indian population diminished with the invasion of southern Cree and métis intent on harvesting the Peace River Valley berry crop. The impact of these factors was compounded by a developing mode of transportation — the dog team. The necessity of using dogs, additional mouths to feed, to travel in search of game further increased the need of further fish and game for each family.42

A common reason for the decrease in game placed the blame on the Indians themselves. One surveyor stated:

... the reckless slaughter of wild animals habitually indulged in by the Indians and half-breed Iroquois trappers of the Smoky River, will surely bring its own retribution; and some years hence the Indians will be obliged to resort to other means of livelihood than the chase.43

Others considered the Indian as lacking in preparation for lean times, of living either in a state of affluence or in want.44 Both Isadore Clut, a Roman Catholic Bishop, and Bompas, drawing on their own experiences, accused the Indians of being improvident and of killing game animals when it was unnecessary.45

41 Ibid., pp. 56-57.
43 Horetzky, p. 55.
44 John Macoun, p. 551.
45 Senate Journals, Appendix, 1888, p. 163; and William C. Bompas, Northern Lights on the Bible (1893), p. 13. These judgments may seem harsh, but Clut and Bompas had no motive for deceiving their readers on Indian hunting habits. Also, excessive habits are not reserved only for the Indian.
The majority of the Indian bands in the northern portion of the
diocese were Chipewyan. By 1884, the Chipewyans, divided by two ways
of life, were dispersed across the northern portion of Athabasca diocese.
One group, dependent on the fur trade, chose to live in rows of houses
near Fort Chipewyan; the other moved into new territory in search of
game.  

The Chipewyans have been described as possessing a weak
culture, imitating the feasts and dances of the Cree. This description
is partially substantiated by Bishop Clut, who concluded that the Chipewyans were not as difficult to manage as the Cree because "They are not as solid in their way." Perhaps it was this characteristic that prompted Roman Catholic missionaries to comment much more favorably on the Chipewyan than on either the Wood Cree or Beaver Indians. Mgr. Grouard commented that in common sense the Chipewyans were on a par with any civilization in the world. Mgr. Faraud no doubt agreed with Grouard, for he commented that they would gladly renounce their nationality to become French.

The Wood Cree, although not native to Athabasca, were successful in invading the area and displacing the Beaver west and south and the Chipewyan north. As late as 1880, H. Moberly, factor of Fort Vermilion,  

46 For a description of the Chipewyan way of life on their winter and summer hunts, see: Fernand-Michel, pp. 302-307.  

47 Jenness, p. 388.  

48 Senate Journals, Appendix, 1888, p. 165.  

49 Fernand-Michel, p. 43.  

50 Ibid., p. 344.
reported that bands of Cree were invading hunting grounds that previously belonged to the Beaver Indians. The Wood Cree, adapting themselves to the forest environment, remained in the woodlands, venturing south of the North Saskatchewan River only infrequently. With the expansion of the fur trade, their growing dependence on the white man for food and clothing diluted their culture.

The Beaver Indians gradually moved westward from the Fort Vermilion and Dunvegan areas until by the 1890's their favorite hunting grounds lay within the country between Pouce Coupe's prairie and Pine Pass. Described as slight in build, lithe and active but comparatively weak, they possessed no tribal unity, but were divided into a number of independent bands which roamed over separate hunting territories. Faraud, after his first visit among them in 1859, depicted the Beaver as a people who enjoyed horseback riding and lived almost exclusively by the hunt. Like the rest of the native population, the decrease in

51 H. Moberly to D. Laird, May 23, 1880, Department of Indian Affairs, Black Series 19502, PAC.


54 Dawson, p. 50B. For a detracting description of the Beaver which begins by describing them as "Small, angular men, and most repulsively ugly...", see: Somerset, p. 49.


56 Fernand-Michel, p. 366. The Beaver's pride in their horses was substantiated by a letter from H. Moberly to D. Laird, May 23, 1880, Department of Indian Affairs, Black Series 19502, PAC.
game had a profound effect on them. They had to adapt and take greater advantage of all available food sources, especially the chokecherries that grew in abundance in the Peace River valley. 57

Several factors were operative among the Indian population of the diocese which weakened their resistance to cultural change and provided an opportunity to develop missionary work within the diocese. 58 First, the Indian population generally lived and travelled in small bands considered most suitable for hunting in the northern environment. The absence of a strong political unit resulted in a greater susceptibility to European ways. Second, with the European desire to obtain goods available in Indian territory, the Indian acquired his first extended contact with the white man, a contact which unexpectedly brought with it a strong stimulus for cultural change. Contact with the trader served to not only modify the environment, but also make the individual critical of the status quo and more receptive to novelties. 59 Third, recognizing the potential usefulness of missionaries to their own interest,

57 Alfred C. Selwyn, "Report on Exploration in British Columbia in 1875", Geological Survey of Canada (Montreal: Dawson Brothers, 1877), (iv), p. 60. Selwyn mentioned how the berries were utilized.

58 The opportunity for successful missionary work in the Athabasca district, especially among the Chipewyan, was acknowledged by the Oblates. Owing to the impossibility of providing missionaries at each post in the West, they had to take into consideration the nature of the Indians in choosing the location of a mission. Consequently, the Oblates opted for greater concentration on the northern areas where, in their opinion, there was more hope for conversion than on the prairies. Joseph-Etienne Champagne, Les Missions Catholique dans l'ouest Canadien (1818-1875) (Ottawa: University of Ottawa, 1949), pp. 191-192.

the Indians welcomed them into their bands. By proffering medical services and gifts of fish nets, hooks and other supplies, the missionary reinforced the beneficial aspects of his coming and enabled him to win the confidence of the Indians. Although the Anglican missionaries' primary duty was to bring spiritual, not material, wealth to the Indian, they realized that material assistance would aid them to some extent in receiving acceptance among the Indian population in their attempt to offset the historical advantage of the Roman Catholics in the diocese.

As a prelude to the expansion of Anglican missionary activity in Athabasca, Bompas recommended subdivision of the diocese and the appointment of a second bishop. The provincial synod of the Church of England in Rupert's Land, meeting in August 1883, acceded to the Bishop's request. The Diocese of Mackenzie River was to comprise that region extending westward from Fort Chipewyan to Alaska and northward from the Fort to the Mackenzie Delta. The newly constituted Diocese of Athabasca was bounded by the Athabasca River on the east, the Rocky Mountains on the west, Fort Chipewyan on the north, and Athabasca Landing on the south. The CMS accepted the synod's proposal that the appointment of a bishop for the Diocese of Athabasca rest jointly with the Archbishop of Canterbury, the Primate of the Province of Rupert's Land, and the CMS.

---

60 Bompas to CMS, May 16, 1882, CMS/A-121.

61 C.C. Fenn to A. Cowley, Nov. 15, 1883, CMS/A-121. The same letter was also sent to Young.
Reverend Richard Young had been considered as a potential candidate for the episcopacy of the Diocese of Athabasca. In his letters to the CMS in 1882, Bompas referred to Richard Young's acceptability as bishop but cautioned the nomination "should not be pressed as Mrs. Young and the children are too delicate for a life in the wilds." Robert Machray, Bishop of Rupert's Land, shared Bompas's assessment of Young's abilities and was confident that Young would be the unanimous choice of the provincial synod if the CMS were to support his nomination.

Born at South Park, South Lincolnshire, England in 1843, Young early decided to pursue a religious career. Graduating with a Bachelor of Arts degree in theology from Clare College, University of Cambridge, at the end of the Easter term, 1868, Young was ordained deacon and given a curacy at Halesowen the same year. He was ordained priest at Coventry in 1869 and served as rector of Fulstow until 1872. He began

62 Bompas to CMS, Aug. 7, 1882, CMS/A-121.


64 Mockridge, p. 346.
his association with the CMS as an assistant secretary for West Yorkshire in 1872.  

Rev. Richard Young came to Canada in 1875 as associate secretary for the CMS at St. Andrew's parish in Manitoba. His achievements in three areas impressed the CMS. First, the Society had asked Young, in conjunction with Bishop Machray and the local finance committee of the Diocese of Rupert's Land, to inaugurate a scheme providing for the gradual withdrawal of the Society from St. Andrew's and those surrounding missions which the Society felt should be self-supporting. Despite Machray's plea that the population had not greatly changed since 1865 and that Indians and Metis living on small, narrow holdings would be unable to support the surrounding parishes, the CMS insisted on discontinuation of all grants. Young's suggestion that the salaries of the clergy of St. Andrew's, St. Clement's, and St. Peter's be paid to the Home Mission Fund of the Diocese of Rupert's Land after December 31, 1885, was again rejected.

65 Letter received from the registry of the University of Cambridge, January 14, 1971, reference number E.16/345. Further information on Young's early career in England has been obtained from a photographic extract of the Alumni Cantabrigienses, Crockford's Clerical Directory, 1885, and Mockridge, p. 346.

66 St. Andrew's parish at that time was about twelve miles north of Winnipeg, embracing an area of 64 square miles. James Taylor, "St. Andrew's Parish, Manitoba", Canadian Church Magazine and Mission News, (February, 1888), p. 33.

67 St. Andrew's Mission was founded in 1829 among the Indian population. Eventually the area, also known as Grand Rapids, was settled by retired employees of the HBC. Retired employees and their descendants, together with recently arrived settlers, formed the majority in Young's parish from 1875-1884.

68 Draft report by Bishop Machray of Rupert's Land relating to and relieving the CMS of the expense of pastoral stations, 1881, CMS/A-77, p. 450.
1882 and that a twenty per cent reduction be instituted in 1884, was acceptable to the Society. Although this reduction in payments did not affect Young's salary, the Society's policy of working only among non-Christian populations assured that his position at St. Andrew's would be temporary.

Secondly, Young was given the responsibility of acting as commissary to Rev. W.D. Reeve. By assisting Reeve in obtaining supplies for the isolated diocese and handling cheques for its missionaries, Young quickly became aware of the financial problems surrounding missionary work in Athabasca. Despite his desire to see an expansion of the work, he was careful to keep all expenditures within the allotted estimates. For example, the annual grant to the Athabasca diocese in 1883 was 2500 pounds. Of this, 2200 pounds were spent on salaries, leaving only 300 pounds for contingencies. Unless the CMS increased its grants to Athabasca, additional missionaries could be added to the work only if they were willing to accept room and board in lieu of salary.

Thirdly, Young exhibited individual initiative in attempting to establish a missionary spirit within the parish. Missionary activity

69 Extract from the minutes of the corresponding committee of the CMS, October 18, 1881, CMS/A-77.

70 Rev. W.D. Reeve was in charge of handling accounts within the diocese. Bompas gave this secular work to Reeve in 1881 after having overdrawn the account to the extent of three thousand pounds during his first eight years as bishop. Bompas to CMS, October 14, 1881, CMS/A-121.

71 Young to CMS, July 18, 1883, CMS/A-121.
was impossible in St. Andrew's parish; the majority of the residents already had been converted. In his own way, though, Young attempted to impress the importance of this activity upon his parishioners. The parish's Sunday Schools were reorganized with all children in attendance becoming members of the missionary club he formed. On the first Sunday of every month, the usual lessons were cancelled and the class time was used to make the children aware of the missionary work being undertaken in other parts of the world. Young involved the children in a form of missionary work by encouraging them to donate money toward the education of an African boy, Andrew Manitoba, at a CMS school in Frere Town, Africa. It was carefully explained that Andrew, upon completing his studies, would return to his native village and continue the Christianizing process begun by white missionaries.

It was difficult to assess Young's future capabilities as Bishop of Athabasca in the light of his performance at St. Andrew's Mission. Young's obvious asset was his missionary experience obtained in Western Canada compared to the neophyte status of any individual from England who could be appointed as Bishop of Athabasca. Young had shown himself to be capable in following the directives of the CMS relating to financial matters. As a commissary to W.D. Reeve, he obtained a working knowledge of the financial problems inherent in the development of an isolated diocese. Proselytizing in an agricultural area of Manitoba

72 Taylor, p. 35.
73 Ibid.
alerted him to the potential of the Peace River district for rehabilitation work among the natives. Also, Young became familiar with educational work among Indian and métis children. His recognition of the importance of working with children would be an asset in the development of an overall missionary program for the diocese.

On the other hand, Young's work at St. Andrew's had not given him ample opportunity to labor in circumstances similar to those he would experience in Athabasca. His itinerant work had been limited. He worked mainly among a settled population that contained many more white settlers than he would initially find in Athabasca. Also, since Young was careful to work within a budget, there was a possibility that he would be hesitant to explore some opportunities for Anglican expansion owing to the lack of financial resources. It remained to be determined how successful Young would be in obtaining the financial resources necessary for further missionary work.

When Young's nomination as Bishop of Athabasca was presented in June 1883, the CMS resolved that:

Rev. R. Young be requested to supervise so far as possible, while still retaining his post at St. Andrew's, the Society's missions in the central and southern parts of the Athabasca diocese, ... and that the sum of 50 pounds be added to the annual allowance of the Rev. R. Young, this addition and any necessary travelling expenses being met if possible from the existing grant to the Athabasca Mission.74

74 F.E. Wigram, secretary of the CMS, to Young, June 6, 1883, CMS/A-121.
Young informed the Society that if it wished him to visit the Peace River district in the absence of Bishop Bompas, he was prepared to do so.\textsuperscript{75} Apparently reluctant to achieve the status of bishop, Young suggested that his consecration be delayed until 1886 to enable him to accompany his family to England for a one or two year visit and to allow time for the appointment of his successor at St. Andrew's.\textsuperscript{76} His hesitancy and reluctance are understandable; he faced a monumental task. Propagating the Anglican faith among a starving, disease-ridden and predominantly Roman Catholic Indian population in the diocese represented an onerous responsibility. Could the Rev. Richard Young, as Bishop of Athabasca, transform the Church of England's modest beginning into a position of power and dominance?

\textsuperscript{75} Young to CMS, August 6, 1883, CMS/A-121.

\textsuperscript{76} Young to CMS, March 13, 1884, CMS/A-121.
CHAPTER II
Richard Young as Bishop

Richard Young's primary function as Bishop of Athabasca was to oversee the propagation of the Anglican faith among the native population. If the standard of effectiveness were simply the number converted, Young could be designated as an ineffective bishop because the vast majority of the converted natives were of the Catholic faith at the end of Young's episcopate. In Young's case, that standard is not reliable. The fact that he entered a diocese that was already strongly Catholicized must be taken into consideration in judging Young's efforts. A much fairer evaluation would assess the effort Young exerted to obtain Indian converts for the Church of England. A thorough examination and analysis of Young's episcopacy will demonstrate whether or not any deficiency in the man's character or ability was responsible for the Anglican Church's relative ineffectiveness in the Diocese of Athabasca between 1884 and 1903. His general, spiritual, and administrative duties, with an emphasis on his financial responsibilities, will be discussed. One administrative function -- the selection of missionaries for the diocese -- will be studied in the next chapter.

W.C. Bompas, the first Bishop of Athabasca, has been criticized for neglecting the general duties that accompany the position of bishop. He attended few Provincial Synods of Rupert's Land. Except for his visit to the Pacific Coast in 1878 to examine the spiritual conditions of a missionary village for the CMS, Bompas spent most of his time
either proselytizing or writing in his diocese.

Unlike Bompas, Young could not be accused of lacking an interest in the broader affairs of the Church of England in Canada. He was a delegate to the Winnipeg Conference in August, 1890, and to the First General Synod which met at Toronto in 1893. Concerned about missionary problems that were common throughout Western Canada, Young attended five of the six Provincial Synods of Rupert's Land held during his episcopate. Especially interested in Indian education, he was a member of a committee charged with investigating Indian education. Young preached a sermon before the 1896 Synod, elaborating on the functions of the Church and the priorities of missionary work. Young also toured the Diocese of Saskatchewan in 1897 during Bishop Pinkham's absence and, despite rapidly deteriorating health, felt it his duty to visit the Diocese of Mackenzie River shortly before his retirement in 1903.

Young's activities outside the diocese did not seem to detract from the performance of his regular obligations within the diocese. He

---

1 The Winnipeg Conference drafted a proposal for the consolidation of the Church of England in Canada. Consolidation was achieved in 1893 at the First General Synod. For a summary of the proceedings at the Winnipeg Conference and the General Synod see: Philip Carrington, The Anglican Church in Canada (Toronto: Collins, 1963), pp. 191-204.


3 C. Pinkham, Bishop of Saskatchewan and Calgary, to CMS, November 11, 1897, CMS/A-121. Enclosed was a letter from Young describing his visit to the Saskatchewan diocese.

4 Young to CMS, July 27, 1903, CMS/A-121.
continued to cover extensively the diocese by annual tours. Every three years from 1888 to 1903, with one exception, he convened a diocesan synod to discuss the various matters which concerned Athabasca. Moreover, his contact with church officials in settled areas of Canada possibly contributed to material assistance by various associations, such as Women's Auxiliaries, to the financially dependent diocese. Also, discussions with other clergy in Canada on his missionary problems possibly were of some assistance to Young.

One of Young's first decisions was deciding on the location of the bishop's headquarters in the diocese. Owing to Fort Vermilion's central location, Young initially established his office there, believing that a strong mission there would "Insert a wedge in the almost unpenetrable influence of Rome from Athabasca to the Rocky Mountains." However, finding the mail service extremely slow and unreliable, he changed his residence to Athabasca Landing in 1894. Although Athabasca Landing did not offer many advantages for missionary work, it was considered the most favorable point for effective supervision, owing to its communication advantage with points in and out of the diocese. His movement to Athabasca Landing indicated that Young placed a priority on his work as a supervisor and coordinator of missionary activities rather than as an active proselytizer in the diocese. Young would not overstress

5 Young to Wigram, October 21, 1884, ADA/30.

6 Church of England, Report of the Diocesan Synod of Athabasca, 1900, pp. 9-10; and Young to CMS, March 28, 1893, CMS/A-121.
his own proselytizing activities to the detriment of his other episcopal duties.

Although his general and administrative duties were onerous and time consuming, Bishop Young nevertheless actively participated in the spiritual aspects of missionary activity. Proselytizing journeys, usually combined with supervisory visits to the various missions, were common with Bishop Young. Encountering Indian families camped along the rivers and beside the lakes of the diocese, he would read them prayers, give instruction, perform the baptismal service, and administer to the sick. During his first winter in the Diocese of Athabasca, he travelled some thirty miles from Fort Vermilion to read prayers and render medical aid to the measle-afflicted inhabitants of a Wood Cree camp. Young's approach to proselytizing usually consisted of teaching the Indians a prayer, such as "O God give me Thy Holy Spirit for Jesus Christ's sake", in their native tongue and encouraging them to recite the prayer around the campfire. With the completion of additional instruction, he attempted to "Impress upon them the present darkness of

7 For Young's first major journey as bishop, see: Young to Fenn, November 25, 1886, ADA/30. On his camp work from Fort Chipewyan to Fort McMurray see: Young to Fenn, December 4, 1888, ADA/outgoing correspondence; and Young to CMS, December, 1891, CMS/A-117. For a description of his camp work in other areas, such as Battle River see: Young to Fenn, November 6, 1889, ADA/32, pp. 198-206. Although Bishop Young's letterbooks were studied on microfilm, #30-#32, much diocesan correspondence was studied prior to microfilming at PMAA. These records are now on microfilm: Accession number 70.387, #79-#84, Incoming correspondence, 1884-1903, Outgoing correspondence, 1881-1902, #84.

8 Young to Fenn, December, 1887, ADA/outgoing correspondence.

9 Young to Fenn, December 4, 1888, ADA/30, p. 211.
their hearts and their need of a new heart.\footnote{10}{Young to Bishop Baldwin of Huron, February 18, 1890, ADA/32, p. 255.} Having given them a "new heart", Young then performed the adult baptismal service. After reading the prayers in both English and the native language, he instructed the Indians on "Man's fall, sin what it is, God is the creator of all men, and what God requires."\footnote{11}{Young to Baldwin, January 14, 1888, ADA/30, p. 182.} The new converts were then asked:

Dost thou believe in God the Father? Dost thou believe in Jesus Christ His only Son? Dost thou believe in Him as the Saviour? Dost thou believe in the Holy Spirit. Do you ask Him to give you another heart?\footnote{12}{Ibid., p. 182. The service described above took place in December, 1887 in the Little Red River district where Young baptized a Cree, Keewatin, and his wife. Although no other descriptions are available, it would appear reasonable to assume Young conducted all baptismal services in a similar manner.}

Statistics on the number of natives converted and the number that remained loyal to the Church of England, even if they were available and precise, could not properly evaluate Young's efforts as a proselytizer. His efforts indicated that he was sufficiently concerned with Christianizing the Indian that he would not place himself in an ivory tower and devote all his attention to the administrative aspects of his position. That Young was able to establish priorities and arrange his schedule in order to allow for his general, administrative, and spiritual duties, and perform adequately on the latter, was a testimony to his abilities as bishop.

Young's ability to apply his observations in proselytizing toward
a program designed to improve Anglican missionary work in the diocese was a testimony to his abilities as an administrator. His own initiative and perseverance was responsible for the development of a program designed to facilitate conversion of the Indian. He had for some time entertained the thought that "we are prone to trust too much to our own talks and explanations instead of relying more on the simple reading of the gospels." As an inducement to the Indians to read the gospels, Young sought the publication of a syllabary, the gospels, a primer, and a manual of devotion containing a selection of hymns, in large syllabic characters. Unable to obtain the requisite materials from the English societies, he arranged, during his stay in Toronto in the winter of 1893-94, for a type to be cast in syllabic characters by the Toronto Type Foundry Company. In spring, 1895, having taken a few lessons in the art of printing while wintering at Winnipeg, Young returned to Athabasca Landing with a hand press and an assistant, Gordon Weston. The following year the first manuals printed by the "mission press" were distributed to the Indians. The manuals contained the Creed, the Lord's Prayer, the Ten Commandments, a selection of hymns and prayers, and passages of scripture. The Gospels of St. Mark and St. John, as translated in Mason's Bible and revised by Rev. George Holmes with the

13 Young to Charles Weaver, June 17, 1897, ADA/30.

14 Report of the Diocesan Synod of Athabasca, 1900, p. 17; and Young's annual letter, 1896, ADA/outgoing correspondence.

15 Ibid.
assistance of several interpreters, were released in later years. The final offering, a hymn book in Cree syllabics compiled by Young and an assistant, Benjamin De Coteau, came off the press in 1901.16 Thus, Young's efforts increased the availability of religious reading material among the native population. Only time would tell whether his efforts would result in more Anglican converts.

In an attempt to further the Anglican cause in the diocese, Young guided the Anglicans away from the traditional policies of the CMS on baptism and education.17 By following CMS instructions and not re-baptizing Indians that were already baptized by the Roman Catholics, Anglican missionary activity would have been extremely limited, owing to the high percentage of natives already baptized by the Oblates. Yet initially, Young was discriminative in adult baptisms, deferring baptism of those natives whom he considered insufficiently instructed to thoroughly comprehend the rite.18 However, with experience in the diocese, 


17 The CMS placed great emphasis upon baptismal rite as the major "aim and object" in evangelical work, only to be performed when the Indian had thoroughly understood the Anglican faith. Also, the CMS did not expect their missionaries to re-baptize children of which there was reasonable evidence that they were already baptized by another religious denomination. On education, the CMS emphasized that conversion of the adult population took precedence over educational work among native children. Ian Getty, "The Church Missionary Society among the Blackfoot Indians of Southern Alberta, 1880-1895", (unpublished M.A. thesis, University of Calgary, 1970), pp. 90-110, passim; and Young to Garrioch, April 11, 1891, ADA/32, pp. 415-418.

18 Young to Baldwin, January 17, 1888, ADA/30, p. 182.
his policy underwent a transformation. In 1898 he wrote Henry Robinson, saying "Where there is a readiness on the part of an Indian for you to baptize him and his family, do so. For if the priest by baptizing can once get hold of them, they are as good as lost to us." In his pursuit of a policy which would negate the strength of the Roman Catholic Church, Young insisted his missionaries not wait at their missions for Indians to come to the fur trading posts, but undertake proselytizing journeys and baptize whenever possible.

In developing an educational program for the Indian children in the diocese, Young did not follow the CMS policy of de-emphasizing educational work among native children in preference to the conversion of the adult population. Again, Young based his decision upon a realistic appraisal of the existing situation in the diocese. Owing to the number of Catholics in the diocese, educational work among the children, who had less contact with the priests, was essential.

His education policy in the Diocese of Athabasca, particularly in the post-1891 period, was undoubtedly influenced by his experiences at St. Paul's School in Fort Chipewyan between 1889 and 1891. Assisted

19 The wholesale baptism of the Wood Cree in the Little Red River area by the Oblates shortly before Young's proselytizing journey in the fall of 1887 undoubtedly had a strong effect upon him.

20 Young to Henry Robinson, May 8, 1898, ADA/30.

21 In granting W.D. Reeve a two year furlough to England, Young was left without a missionary at Fort Chipewyan and had to take Reeve's place from 1889 to 1891.
by Tom Melrose, Young taught thirty children during the winter of 1889-90, ten of whom were either Cree, Slave, or Chipewyan. Because the remaining twenty students were predominantly metis, the Indian children were taught separately. Young's limited knowledge of the Chipewyan language necessitated his teaching the Indian children entirely in Cree, using syllabic characters and lantern slides as modes of instruction. Young, assisted by his wife, carried the full teaching load during the winter of 1890-91.

As Young performed his various duties at Fort Chipewyan, the headquarters of the Roman Catholic Church for the Vicariate of Athabasca-Mackenzie, Young observed that the Church of England was a very minor force in the region compared to the strength of the Church of Rome. Unable to speak French, Young had difficulty communicating with much of the adult population. In many instances, Young taught more children throughout the week than the number of adults he received for a Sunday service. Young realized that only a long-range program would be able to increase Anglican influence among the native population. Intensive work with the children might possibly achieve such an objective. For the Church of England to increase its membership, many of the children

22 Young to Fenn, February 28, 1890, ADA/32, pp. 265-266.

23 The class was divided because the Indian pupils attended the school only during the winter months; the metis were regular students in summer and winter.

24 Young to fellow workers, November, 1890, ADA/32.
taught by Young and future missionaries at Fort Chipewyan would have to adhere to the Anglican faith in their later years.

That his experience at St. Paul's Mission would influence future work in the diocese was obvious from Young's remarks to the Diocesan Synod of 1891. Stating that the teaching of the young had gone hand in hand with other missionary operations from the inception of Anglican missionary work in Western Canada, Young expressed the belief that education of the children of métis or white settlers in the immediate vicinity of the Anglican missions should not be sacrificed to the demands of itinerant work among the Indians. "Only in exceptional cases", Young told his missionaries, "should I consider a missionary justified in neglecting this branch of missionary work." 26

Before the 1891 Diocesan Synod met Young also believed that the most satisfactory way to work with the Indian children was by way of boarding schools. Young felt that the opportunity was much greater for Europeanizing as well as Christianizing the children within the boarding school. The children were away from the influence of their parents, camp life, and the priests. To Young, the boarding school was a training school in which the teacher endeavoured: "to win Indian children from idle, lazy and vicious habits by Christian influences and scriptural instruction and at the same time to train them in truthfulness, honesty,

26 Ibid., p. 12.
decent and orderly habits." The constant personal supervision of the teacher both in and out of school was essential, according to Young, if the objectives of the missionaries were to be advanced.\

Educational work among native children expanded through an increase in boarding schools during Young's administration. Although George Holmes boarded pupils at St. Peter's mission house from 1887, the Lesser Slave Lake mission did not receive a boarding school until 1892. A new wing was added to the school in 1900. St. John's Mission was opened at Wapuskaw in 1894 with the express purpose of providing a boarding school for Indian children. At the end of Young's episcopate, a boarding school was opened at Whitefish Lake, 45 miles from Lesser Slave Lake, to strengthen Anglican work in that area. The schools at Fort Chipewyan, Fort Vermilion and Shaftesbury, although treated by the

27 Young to F. Giles, February 25, 1891, ADA/32; and Young to Giles, November 5, 1890, ADA/32. For example, it was acceptable for the children to play soccer at Lesser Slave Lake. Toboggan slides were considered to provide good exercise for the girls. Young to C.H. Mackintosh, 1897, March 4, ADA/30, p. 395.

28 Ibid.; and Young to E.J. Lawrence, December 27, 1889, ADA/32, pp. 245-248.

29 Annual letter of G. Holmes to C.C. Fenn, 1897, ADA/30; Sessional Papers, Department of Indian Affairs, XXVI, No.9, 1893, p.52; and Sessional Papers, Department of Indian Affairs, "Report of Lesser Slave Lake Boarding School, July 19, 1902", XXXVII, No.11, 1903, p. 340.

30 Also referred to as Wabiscow, it is presently called Wabasca.

31 Young to David Laird, September 25, 1900, ADA/31.

32 Whitefish Lake will be cited hereinafter by its present name, Utikuma Lake, to avoid confusion with Whitefish Lake, about thirty miles to the southeast of Lac la Biche, where a Methodist mission was founded in 1859. The location of the mission founded at Utikuma Lake will be cited hereinafter as Atikameg.
Department of Indian Affairs as day schools, boarded as many Indian children as they could obtain. Young's guiding efforts resulted in an Anglican boarding school attendance of 110 in 1903, with a peak attendance of 130 in 1901, compared to approximately 15 in 1884.  

Although statistics illustrate the expanded educational effort of the Church of England, data is unavailable to indicate the amount of success obtained in boarding pupils.

Young hoped that an increasing number of Indian parents would eventually send their children to the schools, not only to increase Anglican membership, but for the social welfare of the native population. The importance he placed upon education was demonstrated by his response to the question "Do the Indians in the diocese really need financial support?" He replied:

Not if the government help us to educate and train the rising generation. Suitable instruction may prepare the rising generation to seek some more reliable source of livelihood than the precarious living they have at present by hunting. But it cannot help the present generation or say all above fifteen or even fourteen years of age; even if a general system was established throughout the country as has been done south of the Saskatchewan.

Expansion of missionary activity, introduction of an education program for Indian, metis, and white children, and utilization of a

33 The statistics, obtained from the Sessional Papers and Anglican correspondence, do not differentiate between the number of metis and Indians boarded at the schools.

34 Young to H. Reed, April 13, 1892, ADA/32.
printing press for the publication and dissemination of religious materials in syllabic form were only facets of Young's administrative responsibilities in the Diocese of Athabasca. Regardless of whether the social or spiritual well-being of the population was involved, the economic feasibility of the requisite activities had to be taken into consideration. As a result, one of Young's major duties entailed the careful management of all diocesan funds. Upon his arrival in the diocese, Young formulated rigorous regulations governing the disbursement of CMS funds.\(^{35}\) To prevent the incurring of a deficit, Young disallowed any claims for credit which exceeded the initial allotment.\(^{36}\)

Throughout his episcopate, it was almost an obsession for Young to keep his estimates of the financial requirements at an absolute minimum. Realizing that the CMS was not an endless resource for financial aid and that heavily populated regions of Asia and Africa also relied on the Society for assistance, Young felt very strongly that Athabasca should not draw on the Society's resources more than was "absolutely needful."\(^{37}\) His opinion that no expansion work entailing


\(^{36}\) Throughout his correspondence Young continually reminded his missionaries, especially Robinson, Weaver and Holmes, of the need to curtail their expenditures. For examples of his "suggestions" to Weaver on how to reduce his expenditures to $1,000 a year, until some of his debts were extinguished see: Young to Weaver, July 22 and August 1, 1896, ADA/30.

increased expenditure should be undertaken without serious consideration was mainly responsible for the lack of strong missions among the Beaver Indians near Fort St. John and the Cree at Sturgeon Lake. Young seemed less hesitant to expand missionary activities in the development of agricultural missions and boarding schools, which obtained financial assistance from other sources, rather than in strictly proselytizing work among the Indians that required CMS funds. A realist, Young understood that the Society was not overly enthusiastic about providing funds for proselytizing work among Catholic Indians. Young also realized that even if he had asked in the estimates for greater financial assistance for expansionary work, the CMS committee in London evaluating financial commitments would view his claim with skepticism owing to the scanty population of the diocese compared to other claims on the Society's resources.

The CMS grant system itself represented an obstacle to sound financial administration of the diocese. At the time of its creation in 1884, it was Bompas's considered opinion that to operate the Diocese of Athabasca, Young would require £2,000 per year, an endowment, a diocesan fund, and church building grants. Yet during Young's entire episcopate, the CMS annual grant remained at £975 while the number of missions more than doubled between 1884 and 1903. Based upon Bompas's

38 Bompas to Young, September 11, 1884, ADA/incoming correspondence.
39 In 1884, Anglican missionaries were stationed at Fort Chipewyan and Fort Vermilion and one was assigned to Dunvegan. By 1903, they were stationed at Fort Chipewyan, Fort Vermilion, Lesser Slave Lake, Utikuma Lake, Wapuskaw, and Athabasca Landing, with another stationed near Peace River Crossing and another assigned to visit Fort St. John.
estimates, either he had greatly miscalculated the financial needs of the diocese or Young had handled the situation extremely well.

Young was critical not only of the inadequacy of the allotment to the Diocese of Athabasca, but also the rigidity of the grant system itself. The CMS grant failed to defray the travelling expenses incurred by the missionaries itinerating among the Indians within the Diocese and to take into consideration the expense involved in supplying provisions to needy Indians who came to the various missions.\(^40\) By regulating the apportionment of the diocesan grant among the individual missions, the CMS adopted a scheme which precluded the transfer of surplus funds either for the expansion or stabilization of missions.\(^41\) Young's criticisms indicate that he believed the bishop, not the CMS, should control the distribution of the grant within the diocese.

In addition to the grant, the diocese, through the bishop's efforts, obtained certain other considerations from the CMS. A flour mill was purchased for Fort Vermilion with a £250 loan made by the Society.\(^42\)

\(^41\) Young to Fenn, May 15, 1891, ADA/32, p. 426.
\(^42\) Young to Wigram, October 21, 1884, ADA/30. Later, Young loaned the £250 at 2% interest to E.J. Lawrence and Melrose to purchase the mill and received a deed of mortgage as security. Church of England, Minutes of the Finance Committee of the Church Missionary Society for 1888, ADA/24. The flour mill did have an effect on the price of flour, reducing it from $25 to $8 a sack. Charles Mair, Through the MacKenzie Basin -- A Narrative of the Athabasca and Peace River Treaty Expedition of 1899. (Toronto: William Briggs, 1908), p. 93.
and funds were obtained from the Finlayson bequest for missionary work at Wapuskaw. However, the financial assistance provided by the Society was insufficient and the diocese turned to other sources in search of funds.

Contributions by white settlers helped to defray church expenses but the donations by no means made any one church self-supporting. Traders and those financially able were expected to pay a nominal fee for their children's education.

Additional support was tendered by the Missionary Leaves Association which donated bales of goods to the diocese and from the British Colonial and Continental Society which provided a small grant for operation of the mission at Shaftesbury. Individual subscriptions and

43 The Finlayson bequest consisted of a payment of £110 annually to be divided among the dioceses in Western Canada for the establishment of new missions among the Indians. Fenn to Young, June 19, 1892, CMS/A-108. Young received $240 for the work at Wapuskaw in 1894.

44 For a list of donations in 1896 see: Little, p. 4.

45 The collections were quite small, being about $90 in 1896. Surprisingly, $28.60 was contributed toward the Indian Famine Relief Fund, in a diocese where the Indians were on the brink of starvation on many occasions. Young's annual letter, 1896, ADA/30.

46 One child was denied admission to the school owing to his father's refusal to donate one hundred fish. Young to James Lucas, July 10, 1896, ADA/30.

47 The Missionary Leaves Association was founded to provide an agency through which missionaries could obtain many things necessary for their work that were not provided by the CMS, such as church furniture and bells, etc., as well as contributions for the support of orphans and other children in boarding schools. Young corresponded frequently with H.G. Malaher, secretary of the Association.
donations from Canada and England also assisted the work. Young maintained a list of donors and sent them annual letters detailing the progress and future needs of the diocese.

By the 1890's the English societies reached the conclusion that the Church of England in Canada could support missionary work throughout the nation and that it was time for them to withdraw their financial aid. Young arrived at a different conclusion and wrote to England stating that it was too much to expect the Church of England in Canada to support its own expanding urban areas and missionary work in Northern Ontario as well as the work in Western Canada. Statistics, at least for the year 1896, appear to confirm Young's conclusion. Whereas English societies provided $5,115.00 for Indian work, the Women's Auxiliary for Eastern Canada donated $337.56 and the Domestic and Foreign Missionary Society donated $119.71. Although contributions from Eastern Canada gradually increased over the years, they failed even to approach those of the English societies.


49 In 1902 the Domestic and Foreign Missionary Society of the Ecclesiastical Province of Canada was enlarged into the Missionary Society of the Church of England in Canada (MSCC). For a summary of its organization see: L. Norman Tucker, Western Canada (Toronto: Musson Book Co., 1908), pp. 50-52.

50 Little, p. 4.

51 The Domestic and Foreign Missionary Society contributed $600 in 1901. The Women's Auxiliary, formed in 1885, was especially helpful in raising funds. For example, St. Peter's Church, Toronto, contributed thirty-two cases of food and clothing to missions in the diocese. For a list of bales and cases received by Young in 1902 see: ADA/31, p. 465.
By 1900 the Diocese, despite Young's efforts, found itself in a precarious financial position. The addition of boarding schools seriously increased expenses at the missions where they were established. The Anglicans did receive grants toward teaching salaries at Fort Vermilion, Fort Chipewyan, and Lesser Slave Lake. However, building costs were not paid by either the CMS or the Dominion government, causing a severe strain on the diocese's financial resources. Although the Church of England received a per capita grant of $60 from the Dominion government in 1896 toward temporarily alleviating the financial crisis at Lesser Slave Lake, it had to provide food and clothing at its other boarding schools. In 1898, the situation at Wapuskaw was so critical that Young ordered the school closed for all but the few pupils that could be fed from the mission's garden and farm produce because the mission was already overdrawn by $1,300 and could not bear any additional expense. To make matters worse, the Klondike gold rush inflated the price of goods and services in the diocese. Moreover, after the signing of Treaty No. 8, the government's policy of paying room and board only for Indian children whose parents had signed the treaty was a severe handicap to Anglican boarding school work.

52 Food expenditures could be prohibitive. Supplies for the Lesser Slave Boarding School for the year June 30, 1895 to June 30, 1896 totalled $824.00 with $210.00 for 40 sacks of flour and $128.00 for 4,000 fish as the major expenditures.

53 Young to H. Reed, September 28, 1898, ADA/31; Young to Clifford Sifton, Superintendent General of Indian Affairs, September 28, 1898, ADA/31; and Young to Weaver, September 7, 1898, ADA/31. Wapuskaw eventually received a per capita grant for fifteen Treaty children, beginning July 1, 1902. Young to Weaver, October 17, 1902, ADA/31.
At Lesser Slave Lake, Holmes commented on the school's situation in December, 1899:

About six of our thirty-four scholars are supported by friends in England, and about six more, we might be able to support with the help of the clothing received through Missionary Leaves and the "Woman's Auxiliary" of Canada, but how the remaining twenty-two will be supported is at present a matter of faith and not of knowledge.54

In the last years of his episcopate, Young wondered whether or not past results and future prospects warranted the large expenditures incurred by missionary activity in the diocese.55 Because Bishop Emile Grouard served as Vicar Apostile of Athabasca-Mackenzie, Young stated that it would be possible for one man to act as Bishop of both the Athabasca and Mackenzie River dioceses by stationing himself at Athabasca Landing and visiting each diocese in alternate years.56 A severe illness the previous year prompted Young to return to England in 1899 for a year of rest and recuperation.57 Before returning to Canada, he stated that if the Society wished he would continue in charge of the diocese

54 Holmes to Young, December 26, 1899, ADA/32. Later, Holmes appealed to the public to assist him with funds. Holmes to Christian Friends and Supporters, March 30, 1900, ADA/32.

55 Young to Machray, March 11, 1898, ADA/30.

56 Ibid. However, while the CMS was considering one bishop for both dioceses, the Roman Catholic Church appointed separate bishops for each district in 1902.

57 On the nature of the illness see: Young to Holmes, March 3, 1899, ADA/30; and Miss E. Young to CMS, January 16, 1899, CMS/A-121.
for two or three more years or until ill health necessitated his resigning. 58

Realizing the CMS was intent on transferring its funds to the more densely populated areas of Asia and Africa, Young agreed to tender his resignation whenever the Society wished to reduce further expenditures in the diocese. 59 Owing not to the decline of missionary activity in the Diocese of Athabasca, but rather to a question of priorities and the availability of funds, the CMS had to reduce expenditures on its missions in northwestern Canada. 60 Having asked "How far is it right that the Society's funds should be spent in work among the Roman Catholic Indians?" as early as 1899 61, the CMS was relieved to withdraw from the Diocese of Athabasca. After the plan for withdrawal was finalized, 62 Young commented that: "The plan proposed appears wise and suitable, though it will necessarily imply reduction in both men and stations,

58 Young to CMS, March 26, 1900, CMS/A-121; and Young to CMS, April 22, 1900, CMS/A-121.

59 Young to CMS, January 1, 1900, CMS/A-121. For reasons presented by the CMS for withdrawal, see a CMS report presented on November 8, 1901, CMS/A-121.

60 The Church Missionary Intelligencer and Record, XXVII, n.s., February, 1902, pp. 147-148.


62 The grant to each diocese was reduced by one-twelfth yearly, beginning in January, 1904, so that by December 31, 1920, the grants would be terminated. For further information see: The Church Missionary Intelligencer and Record, XXVII, n.s., May, 1903, p. 387. In 1920, with a parting gift of $25,000 to the Missionary Society of the Canadian Church, the CMS officially withdrew from Canada.
notwithstanding any additional private help.63 Young's resignation on December 31, 1903 coincided with the Society's initiation of its plan for withdrawal of financial support in Western Canada. Anglican missionary work among the Indians of Athabasca was reduced, never again to achieve the stature it enjoyed during Bishop Young's episcopate.

Despite the CMS's withdrawal of financial support, future missionary work in the Diocese of Athabasca was assured by the Clergy Endowment Fund. While in England in 1885, Young actively solicited subscribers to an endowment which would guarantee in perpetuity salaries for missionaries labouring in Western Canada. Seven years later, individual subscriptions totalling in excess of $3,500.00 were invested to form the nucleus of the fund.64 The Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge (SPCK) having in 1891 agreed to donate £100 for every £700 to the sum of £3500 obtained from other sources, paid, under the conditional grant, the final £100 to the Clergy Endowment Fund in 1902.65

A review of Young's administration reveals the extent to which he dominated the policies of his diocese. The local finance committee, which directed the expansion of the missions and appointed the missionaries to

63 Young to CMS, February 26, 1902, CMS/A-121.

64 Young to Baring Gould, January 7, 1892, ADA/30; and circular letter on the Diocese of Athабаска, January 7, 1892, CMS/A-117. Most of the funds were private subscriptions solicited by Young and his missionaries.

65 Young to W. Allen, October 10, 1902, ADA/31.
various posts, and through which missionaries were to direct all matters of business, had one member, Richard Young, since 1891. Although flexible in handling CMS policy on baptismal procedures and educational work with native children, Young tended toward authoritarianism in handling his missionaries, believing that "nothing should be done without the Bishop." As an administrator, he expected immediate compliance with his every pronouncement on religious, social and financial matters.

At a first glance, it seems probable that Young's situation required such an approach. The distance of the missions from one another together with the expense of travelling hindered the formation of a local finance committee. Thus, the responsibility of making decisions fell solely on the bishop. Travel and expense difficulties also militated against frequent synod meetings. Also, Young's opinion that the Diocese of Athabasca was small and insignificant in the world-wide chain of CMS missions demanded that he minimize the cost of the Athabasca missions in order that the Society had more funds for work in greater populated areas. What better way to minimize the cost of the Athabasca missions than to monopolize the local finance committee, the decision-making body in the field?

66 For the functions of the local finance committee see: Getty, pp. 40-41.
68 Synods were used much more frequently in North America than in England. Young participated in the synods called by Bishop Machray of Rupert's Land for discussing the many facets of missionary work in the West. Young held diocesan synods in Athabasca every three years from 1888 to 1903 with a six year interval between 1894 and 1900.
Upon further examination, there is greater evidence to suggest that Young tended toward authoritarianism because he believed only his decision could be correct rather than because the situation dictated his actions. Young travelled frequently through the diocese and could have convened a local finance committee of at least two people if he desired. Instead, Young preferred his men to rely on his own judgment. In appointing a teacher to the Irene Training School at Fort Vermilion, Young stated "Like all other institutions of a similar character, everything will be done by rule and order as to times, meals, under my direction." On the addition of a new wing to the Lesser Slave Lake Boarding School, Young sent Holmes precise instructions, including minute details, rather than relying on Holmes for any decision-making in the building of the school. Young exerted his authority to the extent of cautioning A.J. Warwick, on furlough in England, against being "tempted to criticize the work out here or to air what seems to you its failing." He even advised one of his missionaries not to marry until his finances were in a better situation and another that the woman in which he was interested would not be suitable for a missionary.

Nevertheless, Richard Young adequately fulfilled his duties and responsibilities as Bishop of Athabasca. He played an active and important role in the affairs of the Church of England in Canada; performed his spiritual duties willingly and effectively; successfully prosecuted

69 Young to Giles, February 25, 1891, ADA/32, p. 389.
70 Young to Holmes, March 21, 1898, ADA/incoming correspondence.
71 Young to Warwick, September 21, 1898, ADA/30.
the general administrative duties; advanced the educational work of the Church within the diocese; and managed the diocese's meagre finances responsibly and efficiently. His experience, initiative, and perseverance guided Anglican expansion in the Lesser Slave Lake and Peace River regions. While focussing his attention on the spiritual and social requirements of the native population, Young did not neglect the needs of the white and métis settlers. A thorough examination and analysis of Young's episcopacy clearly demonstrates that no deficiency in the man's character or ability was responsible for the Anglican Church's relative ineffectiveness in the Diocese of Athabasca between 1884 and 1903.
CHAPTER THREE

Bishop Young's Missionaries

In order to present a fair evaluation of Young's work in the diocese, the effort he expended -- not the number of natives converted to the Anglican faith -- must be judged. In attempting to ascertain an explanation for the inability of the Anglicans to obtain a greater number of converts in Athabasca, the efforts of Young's missionaries must be assessed. This chapter will attempt to demonstrate whether or not a lack of effort by the Anglican missionaries was responsible for the Church of England's difficulties in the diocese.

Although Young was evaluated according to his performance of the spiritual and administrative duties of a bishop, the missionaries will be evaluated on the basis of those six attributes Young believed to be prerequisite to successful missionary work in the diocese -- spiritual conviction, scriptural knowledge, missionary training, adaptability, self-reliance, and good health. In order that the work of the missionaries be assessed satisfactorily, the attributes designated by Young as necessary for successful missionary work must be shown as relevant criteria. Because the selection of missionaries for the Diocese of Athabasca was an important administrative function, Young's competence as an administrator can be questioned should his criteria prove irrelevant in assessing missionary performance. By examining in some detail the
attributes Young believed desirable, an attempt will be made to prove not only that Young's criteria were relevant but also that in the majority of cases the work of his missionaries was satisfactory.

The nine years he served in Manitoba afforded Young an opportunity to study individual performances and to determine the importance of specific traits in successful missionary activity. In the Diocese of Athabasca, the missions were distant not only from each other but also from the bishop's headquarters at Fort Vermilion and subsequently Athabasca Landing. The individual in charge of each mission, owing to his semi-autonomous status, exerted considerable influence on Anglican missionary activity within his district. As a direct result of his experience, Young established a set of criteria that, if possessed by a missionary, would enable him to cope with the spiritual and secular requirements of the native population in the Diocese of Athabasca.

In establishing his criteria, Young expected potential missionaries to be fully endowed with spiritual conviction and eager to acquire scriptural knowledge and missionary training. Believing that work in the diocese demanded men of firm spiritual conviction, Young, in an address to the 1894 Diocesan Synod meeting, emphasized two essential characteristics:

1. We ourselves must be partakers of the divine life. We must be able to say my life is hid with Christ in God.

2. We must have a clear grasp of the simple truths that constitute our salvation -- repentance toward God and faith in our Lord Jesus Christ, with a humble reliance on the work of the Holy Spirit.

---

1 Report of the Diocesan Synod of Athabasca, 1894, p. 16.
A thorough knowledge of the scriptures was also necessary. Before accepting Henry Robinson into the deacon's order, Young stated:

I shall require of him a good knowledge of the Gospels, the Acts of the Apostles, the Epistoles [sic] to the Romans, the i & ii Apostles [sic] to Timothy, also to be able to answer questions on the thirty nine articles and to know the order of the morning and evening prayers.²

Young also preferred men possessing an adequate education and sound missionary training. In his first diocesan synod address in 1888, he stated:

We need to combine with these experiences and qualifications men who have enjoyed a fair amount of educational advantages, and the gentlemanly tone and bearing which can only be acquired by a course at some college or institution of good standing ... will bring them into contact with men and things, expanding their minds, enlarging their interests, and serving as an antidote against the selfish contraction and narrowness an isolated life so tends to produce.³

Young's concept of an ideally trained missionary was one who received a two or three year apprenticeship in the mission field with a few years of training to be provided at a later date at St. John's College in Winnipeg or Wycliffe College in Toronto for those who had performed capably in the diocese.⁴ This procedure had some advantages over preparatory training at the CMS school at Islington before missionaries

² Young to Holmes, October 25, 1890, ADA/32, p. 298. Also see: Young to Centenary Review Committee, March 25, 1897, ADA/30.
⁴ Young to Gould, November 11, 1896, ADA/30.
came to Athabasca. The CMS school prepared its students for assignments to all parts of the world and there were no courses designed specifically for those students who would be sent to northwestern Canada. Although the students received theological training and lectures on general missionary duties, they were unable to study the languages of the regions that they would be assigned. Realizing the difficulties inherent in such a general training program, Young suggested that one aspect that could be improved was the teaching of the English language. Upon learning of the experience of a lay worker in the diocese who was made fun of by Indian pupils who compared his language and accent with that of the English of the missionary in charge, Young advised Rev. W.J. Oldfield, a teacher at St. Paul's Missionary College, that more attention should be given to English speech.\(^5\)

Fully realizing that spiritual conviction, scriptural knowledge, and missionary training alone did not guarantee proselytizing success, Young sought three additional qualities -- adaptability, self-reliance, and good health. Ability to adapt to both circumstance and environment was essential. His own experience in the diocese had taught that a missionary had to be able:

To make bread, to cut up and cook meat, to wield the broom in the church and mission house, to scrub a floor, to dress and wash little Indian children, to cut wood and carry water, to assist in the work of the farm or the garden...\(^6\)

On adaptability, Young realized that the missionary would be concerned with proselytizing and educational activities among the metis

\(^{5}\) Young to Rev. W.J. Oldfield, December 7, 1892, ADA/32.

\(^{6}\) Ibid.
and white settlers as well as the Indian population in a region where the Roman Catholic faith predominated. Therefore, Young desired men who were "not only earnest and spiritual, but of good abilities and not necessarily highly educated, but possessed of firmness, tact, and common sense."  

His tenure as financial secretary for the CMS had strengthened his conviction that self-reliance was a prerequisite for missionary endeavour. Addressing the diocesan synod in 1894, Young asked:

Is it not a nobler thing to follow in the footsteps of our great leader in the Missionary field, St. Paul, who laboured with his own hands at the uninteresting and arduous task of a tent-maker (Acts xviii 3) that he might not be a too heavy burden on the church, than to dip our hands to the fullest extent we can into the CMS pockets.8

He wanted men who already had some insight into the work, who had the ability to acquire the Indian languages, and who were flexible enough to master most trades and occupations in a country where mission stations were few and far between.

Mission work in the Diocese of Athabasca in the decades immediately preceding the twentieth century required men of strength, stamina, and even temperament. To ascertain the qualities of one Charles Burton, Young sent a questionnaire to a third party asking:

7 Young to Wigram, January 21, 1891, ADA/32, p. 382.
1. Are his lungs sound?
2. Is his ill-health only due to over-work or irregular hours, or is it constitutional?
3. Is he cheerful in temperament?
4. Is he capable of enduring hardships whilst not injurious to health are often trying.
5. Is he willing to turn his hand to anything?
6. What age is he? 9

Finding the answers acceptable, Burton was engaged as Young's personal attendant.

Having discussed those attributes which Young deemed prerequisite to the successful propagation of the faith, let us now turn our attention to the Anglican missionaries who served in the diocese in an attempt to ascertain whether or not their individual performances fulfilled Bishop Young's expectations and validated his criteria for the selection of missionaries.

Three agents, Reverends W.D. Reeve, A.C. Garrioch and J. Gough Brick, had served in the diocese prior to Young's consecration as Bishop of Athabasca in 1884. Upon completion of an elementary education in Lincolnshire and a business training course, Reeve enrolled at the CMS College in Islington. 10 After completing his junior year, he travelled to Winnipeg in 1869 and was ordained. For the following ten years he served as missionary in the Fort Simpson and Fort Rae districts.

Reeve's business training stood him in good stead as a missionary in the North-West. Although the accounts of the Dioceses of Athabasca

9 Charles Burton to Young, January 21, 1886, ADA/incoming correspondence.
and Mackenzie River were maintained separately after January 1, 1885, he served as financial secretary to both dioceses.\textsuperscript{11} He also, together with Young, comprised the finance committee for the CMS in the Diocese of Athabasca until 1889. Young, obviously pleased with the thoroughness and conscientiousness with which Reeve discharged his duties, commented that: "What he does, he does methodically and well."\textsuperscript{12} Nevertheless, Young questioned whether or not Reeve possessed "just those almost undefinable qualifications necessary to achieve the attachment and call out the hearty and vigorous cooperation of those who would labor under him ..."\textsuperscript{13}

Alfred Campbell Garrioch, born in Portage la Prairie in 1848, had taught at St. John's Parish School in the Diocese of Rupert's Land, partially completed his studies at St. John's College, and engaged in mixed farming prior to his appointment as lay agent in 1874.\textsuperscript{14} After spending a few years in the northern part of the diocese, Garrioch was transferred to Fort Vermilion where he served until 1886. He was then

\textsuperscript{11} Little, p. 22.
\textsuperscript{12} Young to Fenn, March 30, 1888, ADA/30.
\textsuperscript{13} Ibid., p. 202. Young expressed his opinions on Reeve in reply to Fenn who had asked whether or not Reeve was capable of replacing the Rt. Rev. Horden as Bishop of the Diocese of Moosonee. Rev. A. Spendlove, a missionary in the Diocese of Mackenzie River, commented negatively on Reeve's work. If similar sentiments prevailed among Reeve's other missionaries, Spendlove's remarks confirmed Young's opinion. Spendlove stated: "The Reeves have never taken an interest in the Indians so that we can see in them no example for us, unless it be for reading and so much time wasted at games with Godless people. Are we not supported and sent to preach to the natives?" Spendlove to Young, August 25, 1896, ADA/incoming correspondence.
\textsuperscript{14} Garrioch, \textit{Hatchet Mark}, p. 8.
stationed at Dunvegan from August, 1886 until he departed for Portage la Prairie in 1891 to recover his health.  

Shortly after his arrival at Fort Vermilion, Garrioch undertook the compilation of a Beaver-English-Cree dictionary. Young proposed that in addition to working on the dictionary, Garrioch should translate the Gospel of St. Mark and also portions of the Book of Common Prayer into the Beaver language. With the assistance of an interpreter, Missiskiyasio, the translations were completed. Young's assistance also was instrumental in the publishing of Garrioch's translations.

With the completion of the final translations and their publication assured, Garrioch contemplated retirement after 1884. Young, opposed to Garrioch's retirement, stated that "his knowledge of the Beaver language and his fitness for itinerating makes this undesirable." In a personal interview, the Bishop succeeded in persuading him to return to the Diocese of Athabasca.

15 Fenn to Young, March 9, 1892, CMS/A-108, pp. 150-152.
16 Garrioch, Hatchet Mark, p. 158.
17 Ibid., p. 166.
18 The following were published: Garrioch, A vocabulary of the Beaver Indian Language, Part I - Beaver-English, Part II - English-Beaver-Cree (London: SPCK, 1885); The Gospel according to St. Mark translated into the language of the Beaver Indians of the Diocese of Athabasca (London: SPCK, 1886); and Manual of devotion in Beaver (London: SPCK, 1886).
19 Young to CMS, April 16, 1884, CMS/A-121.
20 In listing the healthy climate, his experience in the work, and freedom from family ties as his reasons for returning to the diocese, in his book Garrioch contradicted his previous letter correspondence. Garrioch, Hatchet Mark, p. 204.
Although Garrioch considered his transference from Fort Vermilion to Dunvegan a demotion because the Hudson's Bay Company had moved its regional headquarters to Lesser Slave Lake, Young believed Garrioch's knowledge of the Beaver language and previous experience as a mixed farmer and teacher would be invaluable in administering to the Beaver Indians. Garrioch's major task at Dunvegan was to provide for the physical needs of the starving and destitute Beaver population. The removal of some women and children to Lesser Slave Lake in 1887 and 1888 to be fed by the Hudson's Bay Company had only partially solved the problem.\textsuperscript{21} Two years later, thirty Beaver Indians, too weak to leave the fort, obtained relief at the mission.\textsuperscript{22} When game was scarce and the berry supply exhausted, the mission's "soup kitchen", open for four months during the winter, served the area's hungry, destitute Indians.\textsuperscript{23}

Garrioch also attempted to provide for the spiritual needs of the Beaver Indians. Assuming that the Oblates were denying the Scriptures

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{21} Garrioch to John Murray, November 30, 1888, Correspondence of Alfred C. Garrioch, Toronto, Anglican Church of Canada Archives (ACC).

\textsuperscript{22} Garrioch to Roderic Macfarlane, December 15, 1890, Correspondence of Roderic Macfarlane, II, PAC.

\textsuperscript{23} A donation of one hundred pounds of canned meats by an anonymous donor in England prompted the creation of a soup kitchen. The soup also included cabbage, rice and flour, as well as potatoes from the mission garden. Ibid., pp. 247-248; Garrioch to Murray, Nov. 30, 1888, ACC.
\end{flushleft}
to the Indians, Garrioch read three hours a day, five days a week, the Gospel of St. Mark to those at the fort. In addition, he conducted a short service following the mission's daily meal. However, among those Indians who came to the mission, Garrioch could count only two Beavers and four Crees as staunch adherents.

Sending Garrioch to administer to the physical and spiritual needs of the Beaver race was indeed a wise decision. The prevalent view of the Beavers as a dying race and the expectation that white settlers would soon arrive in the Dunvegan area necessitated the appointment of a man acquainted not only with the language of the Beaver Indians but also the region they inhabited. Garrioch possessed a thorough knowledge of both. In fact, his proficiency in the Beaver language should have given the Anglicans a distinct advantage over the Roman Catholics at Dunvegan. Owing to the language barrier, Father Tissier found it exceedingly difficult to communicate with the Beavers. Judged in terms of effort, Garrioch, an industrious missionary, served the Church of England well in the diocese despite his lack of success in securing converts.

J. Gough Brick, formerly a Methodist minister and farmer in Eastern Canada, was the only other missionary in service in the diocese prior to Young's arrival. Engaged by Bishop Bompas, Brick arrived at Dunvegan

24 Young to ___, 1889, ADA/32, p. 180.
25 Garrioch to Macfarlane, December 15, 1890, Macfarlane Papers, pp. 1292-1295.
27 J. Gough Brick to Bompas, December 14, 1881, CMS/A-121. On his background also see: Bompas to CMS, October 1, 1882, CMS/A-121; and Brick, p. 3.
in 1881 and was ordained deacon at St. Saviour's Mission the following year. In 1883, together with his two sons, Brick established a farm at Old Wives Lake, approximately four miles west of the present location of Berwyn, Alberta. During the next two years, he occasionally visited the Dunvegan post to work among the Indians.

Discouraged not only by his inability to acquire the requisite proficiency in the Cree language but also by the collapse of a number of schemes designed to promote settlement in the area, Brick wrote a letter of resignation to Young in the fall of 1885. However, he reconsidered his resignation and, having spent two years in eastern Canada and England soliciting funds, returned to the diocese and founded the Shaftesbury Settlement, fifteen miles upstream from Peace River Crossing. Considerable private donations and a $2,000 grant from the Canadian government financed the construction of a farm and school on the Peace River. By 1890, the mission farm produced 250 bushels of grain, mostly wheat, annually, and the grist mill which Brick had obtained in eastern

28 Old Wives Lake was chosen owing to the abundance of hay in the area. *Ibid.*, p. 4. Mrs. Brick did not arrive until later.

29 Young to Reeve, August 18, 1885, ADA/30, p. 66.

30 Pierce, pp. 20-21; and Report of the Diocesan Synod of Athabasca, 1888, p. 10. For Brick's transactions with the Dominion Government see: Department of Indian Affairs, Black Series, 39478, 1886-1895, PAC. All other correspondence listed as Department of Indian Affairs is available at PAC.
Canada could produce twenty pounds of flour in less than nine hours.\textsuperscript{31} Two years after it had been founded, the Shaftesbury Settlement had expanded to include some twelve families, most of them Indian.\textsuperscript{32} As the years passed, many of the Indians at the settlement departed and Brick, realizing that his venture had become more colonial than "pure" missionary work, surrendered his CMS grant, leaving himself solely dependent upon the Anglican Church in Canada.\textsuperscript{33} When poor health forced him to resign in 1894, Brick left the diocese to become rector of a parish located on an estate near Barrytown, New York.\textsuperscript{34}

During his years at Shaftesbury, Brick was severely criticized for his inability to attract more natives to the settlement, for his inability to master the Cree language, and his alleged dislike of Indians and lack of interest in providing for the education of native children. Bishop Young had accepted Brick's plan to establish and operate the mission farm because he believed "We must do what we can to bring the Indians under the influence of the gospel truth."\textsuperscript{35}

---

\textsuperscript{31} For a description of the Bricks' journey to Shaftesbury with the machinery see: Brick, pp. 11-12. The expense of the outfit, including freight charges was $3,453.00. Burman to Young, September 3, 1888, ADA/30.

\textsuperscript{32} Garrioch to Macfarlane, December 22, 1890, Macfarlane Papers. Initially, the settlement consisted only of Brick, his two sons, and Alexander Mackenzie, a retired HBC employee.

\textsuperscript{33} Pierce, p. 21.

\textsuperscript{34} Young to CMS, September 19, 1894, CMS/A-121; Brick to Young, December 24, 1894, and January 21, 1895, ADA/32.

\textsuperscript{35} Young to Brick, August 8, 1894, ADA/outgoing correspondence.
Young even advised Brick to measure his success by the number of Indians he could persuade to join the colony. To compensate for Brick's lack of ability to learn the language, Young provided an annual grant to retain a translator. The bishop also denied a traveller's charge that Brick had stated: "I don't allow any of those damned Indians around my place." In light of Brick's generous hospitality and a letter received containing a petition signed by Protestants, Roman Catholics and Indians asking Young to persuade Brick to reconsider his resignation, Young found the charge beyond belief. The remaining charge, that Brick was neglecting the education of Indian children, was disproven by a report in which Brick stated that "the school has fourteen scholars with four more to come."

Young's continued support of Brick was commendable. Unfortunately, that support was misguided. The Bishop should have paid more heed to the

36 Young to _____, May 18, 1891, ADA/32, p. 438.

37 Somerset, pp. 35-36. On this point see: Somerset to Brick, December 15, 1895, CMS/A-119. Somerset regretted having quoted the remarks, but claimed that he quoted from memory. For Young's denial of Somerset's remarks see: Young to Gould, September 24, 1895, CMS/A-119.

38 For examples of Brick's hospitality see: Garrioich, Far and Furry North (Winnipeg: Douglass-McIntyre Printing and Binding Co., 1925), pp. 224-225; and Somerset, p. 35.

39 Alex Mackenzie to Young, January 21, 1895, ADA/32.

40 Young to _____, May 18, 1891, ADA/32, p. 438.
advice of his commissary at Winnipeg, W.A. Burman, who suggested that:

... in view of the importance of the future work at Shaftesbury, the value of the costly outfit and also the accessibility of the place as compared with Vermilion, it seems very desirable... you should either live at Shaftesbury yourself or have a really responsible person there ... I know you devoutly wish your school to succeed and I do not see how it can without proper and responsible supervision. Frankly, I do not think it will get this from the Bricks, at least not from Mrs. B. and the juniors. In view of the fact that the government has given a grant it will look for early results and much of the future of your educational work in respect to government grants may depend on the success or otherwise of the present effort.41

Young must be faulted in that, in this case at least, he tended to over-emphasize the importance of self-reliance in a missionary.

Despite his protestations that "If I could have the biggest farm in the country I should not be satisfied unless I could have real parish work with it," and "It is true I could find employment in farming, but I shall never give up the ministry for farming,"42 Brick was a colonizer, not a missionary. Although there was much truth in Young's belief that "It is not only preaching and teaching but by encouraging the Indians by example that they may be won from a roving way of life and brought under Christian influence and instruction,"43 Brick was not the type of man to bring this about. His agricultural ability, cheerful personality,44

41 Burman to Young, August 6, 1888, ADA/30.
42 Pierce, p. 20.
43 Young to CMS, February 27, 1886, CMS/A-121.
44 Garrioch was impressed by Brick's personality. He stated: "And being also plenteously endowed with sentiment, wit and humour, he surpassed any man at that time in the country as a conversationalist and orator." Garrioch, Hatchet Mark, p. 156.
and effective appeals for funds were utilized in founding Shaftesbury Settlement, not in saving Indian souls. That Young failed either to realize or accept Brick's unsuitability for missionary work not only decreased the likelihood of Anglican success in the Smoky River region, but also jeopardized future educational work in the diocese; work upon which so much of Young's overall plans for the Diocese of Athabasca depended.

An increase in the number of missionaries in Athabasca, from three to five in 1886, indicated a greater Anglican attempt to obtain converts in the diocese. One of these men was George Holmes. Rev. George Holmes, educated at the Church School in Reading and the Church Missionary College at Islington, was appointed to the Diocese of Athabasca in 1883 and designated for service in the Peace River district. Prevented from proceeding immediately to the diocese by the events of the Saskatchewan Rebellion, Holmes was despatched to Rainy River after his temporary detention in Winnipeg in 1885. His one year residence at Rainy River provided Holmes with much practical experience, but the necessity of studying the language of the Saulteaux delayed his acquiring a satisfactory

45 Although other missionaries educated at Islington, such as Reeve and Lucas, were considered on European connection by the CMS after their placement in Western Canada, Holmes was hired by Young on local connection. The missionary on European connection had his salary guaranteed by the Society; whereas the missionary on local connection received his salary from the lump grant assigned to his diocese. Also, a missionary on local connection did not receive the same privileges from the Society as one on European connection. For example, his children's education and his travelling expenses outside the diocese were not paid by the Society. Holmes was continually upset with this arrangement.
working knowledge of Cree.  

Upon his arrival in Athabasca in 1886, Holmes was assigned to the Lesser Slave Lake area, a new territory for the Anglicans. His choice of a site for St. Peter’s Mission impressed both Grouard and Young as an ideal location for promoting Indian settlement.  

A zealous missionary, Holmes announced shortly after his arrival that within three years there would not be a Roman Catholic left in the district -- a boast which was at least partially responsible for the Oblates’ establishing St. Anthony’s Chapel near his mission. Holmes travelled extensively in his region, quickly mastered the Cree language, and translated several hymns into Cree, thereby enhancing his influence among the Indians with whom he came into contact. In 1888, he warned the CMS that unless they established a station at Sturgeon Lake, south and west of Lesser Slave Lake, a good opportunity would be lost to the Roman Catholics.  

Although the lack of sufficient funds and a suitable agent

46 The Church Missionary Intelligencer and Record, September, 1886, p. 711.
47 The mission site was on the opposite side of Buffalo Lake facing toward the HBC fort on Lesser Slave Lake.
48 Grouard, p. 248 and p. 268.
49 Holmes to CMS, October 8, 1888, CMS/A-121. Sturgeon Lake received its first school grant in 1909. By 1923 the Sturgeon Lake School had established itself as one of the most highly attended Catholic schools in Athabasca.
precluded the establishment of a station at Sturgeon Lake, Young credited Holmes with promoting the creation of both the Atikameg and Wapuskaw missions. 50

Although he confessed to Young that he could not conscientiously teach because he felt his time was being wasted as long as the children were not boarded in a school away from the influences of camp life, Holmes did not neglect the education of native children. 51 The inability to obtain sufficient funds from the CMS for the construction of a church and a school of sufficient size could not defeat a man of his initiative. St. Peter's Church was built in 1890, with the first sermon being preached in December. 52 For teaching, an Indian dwelling near the mission was rented and Holmes' own home was opened to house Indian children attending classes. Having instituted these temporary measures he then set out to obtain the requisite funds for St. Peter's boarding school,

50 Young to Wiggins, December 26, 1894, ADA/32. Holmes visited the Wabiskaw Lakes during the winter of 1890-91 and reported that the Roman Catholic priests had not started missionary activity among approximately fifty families that lived in small log houses near the lakes. Holmes strongly recommended Anglican missionary activity in the area. Also see: Young to fellow workers, December 1891, CMS/A-121; Young's annual letter, 1891, CMS/A-121; and Young to CMS, March 28, 1893, CMS/A-121.

51 Holmes to Young, June 4, 1891, ADA/incoming correspondence.

52 Young to Holmes, February 26, 1891, ADA/32.
Initially in eastern Canada and later in England. The school, a compact square log building of two stories, was opened in 1892.

Although Holmes had finally obtained a boarding school, his problems did not end. Lack of accommodation and provisions was a continual problem. In the winter of 1894 a trader reported that Holmes "seems in a hard plight, 15 boys and nothing to clothe them." During that same winter an epidemic occurred in the Lesser Slave Lake area which caused about forty deaths. Despite these conditions, all the boarders at the school survived the epidemic of scarlet fever and diphtheria, owing mainly to the nursing of Holmes. Throughout his career at Lesser Slave Lake, Holmes assumed the responsibility of supporting a crowded home, being reluctant to turn away any children.

Concerned about the social welfare of his converts, Holmes was appalled at the widespread use of alcohol that was prevalent in the Lesser Slave Lake community. In his opinion, "To place 'fire water' before an Indian is like placing an attractive toy before a tiny child,

53 On his furlough to England in 1897, Holmes' determination played a major role in obtaining badly needed funds for the diocese by his deputation work during a year in which much of the financial assistance usually given to missionary work was either donated to the Indian Famine Fund or spent on the celebrations of Queen Victoria's Diamond Jubilee.

54 Leslie Wood, HBC trader, to Young, December 12, 1894, ADA/32.

55 Holmes to C.H. Macintosh, Lieutenant-Governor of the North-West Territories, March 30, 1894, Archives of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon Office.

56 For other examples of the alcohol problem in Athabasca see: Young to MacIntosh, December 8, 1897, ADA/30, p. 30; and Sessional Papers, XXXVI, D. Laird's report, September 19, 1901.
but placing a fire between the toy and the child. The Indian goes through the fire for the whiskey." Holmes estimated that it would not be possible to find more than a dozen male natives over fifteen years of age who had not spent most of their income on alcohol. To combat the problem, Holmes organized a total abstinence society which, although not a great success, managed to enroll a few of the followers of Bacchus.

Young, impressed with Holmes' ability and dedication, wrote frequently to the CMS requesting that he be granted full connection with the Society. Despite his arguments that it was unfair to immediately grant graduates of Islington an European connection while denying the same consideration to a missionary who already had proven himself in the field, Young's applications met continued rejections. Finally, as a personal favor, the Bishop asked that Holmes' services at least be recognized by the admission of his daughter to the Society's Children's Home in England. Holmes eventually received the status of European connection from the CMS in 1898, subject to Rev. J. Lucas being withdrawn from the diocese. By placing him in charge of Christ Church Mission in the troubled Shaftesbury Settlement and elevating him to the

57 Holmes to Young, November 8, 1899, ADA/30.
58 Young to CMS, December 26, 1894, CMS/A-121; and Young to CMS, May 8, 1895, CMS/A-121.
59 Young to CMS, June 14, 1897, CMS/A-121.
60 Young to CMS, September 13, 1898, CMS/A-121; and Ibid., September 20, 1898, CMS/A-121.
position of archdeacon on July 9, 1901, Young further demonstrated his faith in and appreciation of Rev. George Holmes.  

Although he was the most effective Anglican missionary to serve in the diocese, there are indications that Holmes did not possess the qualities of adaptability and self-reliance to the degree that Young desired. Writing to Young in 1891, he stated: "I dread the idea of spending another winter alone. To live in this unsettled state of mind is good neither for body or [sic] soul." Nor did he possess a complete mastery of the financial aspects of his duties. When he openly complained that it was impossible for him to make ends meet, Young dismissed his appeal with the explanation that "Being English he is not quite so well able to make the best of things around him as our native missionaries. He is also a little wanting in economy and management." This shortcoming prompted the bishop to conclude that Holmes was "A good fellow and fighting the Romanists but some check must be put on his expenditure."  

61 Young to Holmes, March 19, 1901, ADA/31.  
62 Holmes to Young, June 4, 1891, ADA/incoming correspondence. Although Holmes was dissatisfied with Charles Burton's work as a lay teacher during the year, his difficulty in adjusting to the harsh winter environment made him receptive to anyone who would share the mission work with him during the winter months.  
63 Young to Fenn, May 15, 1891, ADA/32, pp. 425-426. By "native" Young meant agents from Canada and not Indians.  
64 Young to Cowley, February 26, 1891, ADA/32, p. 396.
Holmes' zealous missionary activity more than compensated for these shortcomings. His forte was proselytizing. The zeal he demonstrated in 1888 was equally evident in 1901 when he again visited the Indians at Sturgeon Lake. While not attempting to hold services -- the Indians being of the Roman Catholic faith -- Holmes visited each individual, preached the Gospel, and attended to the sick.\(^{65}\) Generally, his missionary efforts were recognized to the extent that even an observer critical of Anglican missionaries commented that "The pity of the thing is, that they are not all like him."\(^{66}\)

Malcolm Scott, the first clergyman appointed in the diocese by Bishop Young, had previously served under Young as superintendent responsible for Sunday schools in St. Andrew's parish.\(^{67}\) It was undoubtedly this experience which prompted Scott to transfer the family farm in southern Manitoba to a younger brother and enter St. John's College, Winnipeg. Evaluating Scott's abilities, a teacher at St. John's remarked that Scott possessed "the best ability for hard work and rapid learning of any of our students. Add to this that he is over thirty years of age and a good practical farmer and I think with his known Christian character he will be a valuable addition to our staff."\(^{68}\) Upon graduation, Scott was summoned to Fort Vermilion where, during fifteen years of service, he demonstrated true missionary zeal and dedication to the

\(^{65}\) Holmes to CMS, January 20, 1902, CMS/A-121.

\(^{66}\) Somerset, p. 17.

\(^{67}\) Taylor, p. 35.

\(^{68}\) Young to Reeve, Nov. 18, 1885, ADA/outgoing correspondence.
Anglican cause in Athabasca. His effectiveness in proselytizing was attested to by Rev. J.R. Lucas who in 1897 observed that all the Beaver Indians were Roman Catholics with the exception of those around Fort Vermilion that were reached by Scott. Anglican membership in the region declined after Scott's resignation in 1900 owing to ill health.

During his tenure at Fort Vermilion, Scott made many journeys to Indian camps in the area, establishing temporary stations at the Caribou Mountains, Little Red River, and other points near Fort Vermilion. Young's own description of Scott's itinerancy best describes the man and his efforts:

Though afflicted with much bodily infirmity, subject to rheumatism, sciatica, and great nervous frustration, he continues to prosecute on foot in winter and by canoe in summer journeys sometimes of two or three hundred miles, visiting the Indians in their camps and feeling amply rewarded for the fatigue whenever he comes in contact with those who are thirsting for instruction or give evidence of a genuine work of grace going in their hearts.

Charles Burton, formerly a railway conductor, was engaged by Young in 1888 as his personal attendant. Assisted by a young lad who came to

69 James Lucas to CMS, August 14, 1897, CMS/A-121.

70 Several families were re-baptized by the Roman Catholic priests after Scott's departure. Young to A.S. White, 1901, ADA/31, p. 321. A.S. White also commented that "The attendance at the Irene Training School has been so low that it is not clear that it is worthwhile keeping the school open." Department of Indian Affairs, Black Series, Vermilion Irene Training School file 17336.

71 Little, p. 77.

72 Young to Gould, November 15, 1897, ADA/31.
Fort Vermilion once a week to spend an afternoon instructing him, Burton quickly acquired a working knowledge of both the Cree and Beaver languages. 73 Young, looking forward to Burton's becoming a missionary to the Beaver Indians, intended to ordain him into the deacon's order after a few years. The Bishop also planned to send Burton, who had won the Lord Wharton Prize in scriptural knowledge while still in public school, to St. John's College on a grant from the SPCK.

However, owing to a number of indiscretions on the part of Burton himself, Young's plans were never realized. Unfavorable reports from Scott, Brick, Garrioch, and others prompted Young to write Burton saying: "I do believe you want to do Christ's service, but feel that you just lack that discretion, so necessary to missionaries to carry on the work here." 74 Nevertheless, a letter written to Holmes a few months later indicated that Young had not given up completely on the man: "Burton should spend more time to reading and self-improvement -- But improvement must be marked and decisive before I reconsider his future career." 75 But in the winter of 1890-91 Burton sealed his own fate. His letter to the CMS stating that "They [the Indians] say -- don't leave us, do stay with us we want some one to teach us and our children, the Bishop won't do it and never will be able to do it" 76 was not consistent with the

73 Young to CMS, September 20, 1888, CMS/A-121. The young Indian taught Burton primarily Beaver and Young taught him Cree whenever possible.

74 Young to Burton, March 4, 1890, ADA/32, p. 269.

75 Burton was assigned to St. Peter's Boarding School at Lesser Slave Lake as a lay teacher for the winter of 1890-91. Young to Holmes, October 25, 1890, ADA/32.

76 Young to Harrison, May 25, 1891, ADA/32, p. 464.
information contained in a letter from Holmes informing Young that Burton "Had broken up the school and scattered about half these scholars thro' his indiscretion as usual."77 Afterward, in a letter to Rev. W.H. Grove, secretary of the SPCK, Young refused to support an application for a grant toward a studentship at St. John's College for Burton, saying:

Certain traits of character, while not affecting his moral or religious character, has rendered the advisability of his becoming a clergyman a little doubtful.78 Consequently, Burton, an individual who initially showed good promise, was tried and found wanting. His inability to work compatibly with his fellow missionaries, his refusal to adapt to his situation, and his complete lack of judgment precluded his being an asset to the Anglican cause in the Diocese of Athabasca.79

Henry Robinson's request to serve in the diocese without remuneration was accepted by Young in 1888.80 Assigned to Rev. George Holmes, who hoped to establish missions north of Lesser Slave Lake, Robinson was

77 Ibid., pp. 464-465.
78 Young to Grove, November 24, 1891, ADA/32, p. 355.
79 Showing his inability to adapt to various aspects of missionary life, Burton objected to part of his work with Holmes because he was consigned to the position of cook. Young disagreed with Burton's objection because he considered a missionary had to possess the ability to "make bread and cook". Young to Harrison, May 25, 1891, ADA/32.
80 Report of the Diocesan Synod of Athabasca, 1888; and Young to Fenn, December 4, 1888, ADA/30, p. 215.
charged with building a mission at Atikameg. Subsequent to his ordination as deacon in the autumn of 1891, Robinson was assigned to Atikameg on the understanding that his expenses "for provisions, freight, or for anything" were not to exceed $365 per annum. With Brick's resignation from Christ Church Mission, Robinson was sent to Shaftesbury to take charge of the mission and the farm. A year later, Brick wrote to Young saying: "I am exceedingly doubtful in regard to Mr. Robinson running that Mission Farm, now that he has got the whole thing in his own hand, -- he has neither brains nor energy for that." Apparently, Brick's remarks possessed some merit because David Curry was directed to assume management of the farm as of March 31, 1898. Young's explanation for the altered arrangement was contained in a letter to Robinson: "I see you cannot run the farm and keep within limits of what is coming to you from the diocese, and other grants."

81 Young to Burman, September, 1889, ADA/32, p. 271.

82 Young also stated "I expect you to act as an example of cleanliness and order in keeping the house clean and in good repair". Young to Robinson, October 21, 1890, ADA/32, p. 295.

83 Brick to Young, April 17, 1895, ADA/32.

84 Young to Robinson, December 6, 1897, ADA/30. Substantiating Young's opinion, Burman commented "Mr. Robinson not only seems quite unable to understand accounts -- but must proclaim that fact to the world." Burman to Young, February 15, 1898, ADA/incoming correspondence.
During his tenure at the Christ Church Mission, Robinson used the mission as a base for his visits to the Indians at Dunvegan, Spirit River, Atikameg, Fort St. John, Hudson's Hope, and other points in the region. The importance he placed on itinerancy among the Indians was undoubtedly a reaction to the Anglican work being emphasized at Christ Church Mission. In a letter written to Young in December, 1897, Robinson clearly indicated that in his opinion the Church of England had reversed its priorities at the mission: "The result of our labor last year is not many converts for we have neglected to preach the gospel, but, instead, have good crops, lots of food, sufficient to feed sixty children."\footnote{Robinson to Young, December, 1897, ADA/30.}

After his reconnaissance of the Fort St. John area in search of a suitable site for a future mission,\footnote{Robinson to Young, June 27, 1898, ADA/30.} Robinson was sent to St. John's Mission at Wapuskaw as a replacement for Rev. C.R. Weaver who had been granted a furlough for 1901-02. Convinced that Weaver had been shortsighted in the distribution of supplies, Robinson immediately instituted a more rigorous distribution policy in an attempt to maintain a stable Indian settlement near the mission. According to Eva Young, the bishop's sister, the new system achieved results:

Under the present sterner rule the people are gathering around the Mission and already an increase is plain to be seen in attendance at the service. The men themselves have asked for a week-day evening meeting to explain the Church Service.\footnote{Eva Young to Young, July 11, 1901, ADA/31.}
Despite his fifteen-odd years of service in the Diocese of Athabasca, Robinson was never ordained a priest. Nor did he pursue missionary training, although Young had offered to send him to Wycliffe College for two years. Described by Young as "a plain, earnest, Christian man who possessed the qualities needed for pioneer work in the country," Robinson's efforts obtained few converts for the Church of England. While serving to expand Anglican missionary activity, his zeal, proficiency in Indian languages, adaptability, and dedication to the propagation of the Anglican faith failed to extend the Church's influence in the diocese.

Reeve's elevation to Bishop of Mackenzie River in 1891 prompted Young to appeal to the CMS for two missionaries to serve in the Fort Chipewyan area. The CMS complied with the request and despatched James Lucas and A.J. Warwick to the diocese as replacements for Reeve and to relieve Young who had labored among the Chipewyans during the former's furlough from 1889-1891. Although Lucas soon acquired a degree of proficiency in the Chipewyan language, he failed to respond to Young's plea that he make a point of visiting the Chipewyan camps to bring the Gospel to them with the result that after the bishop's departure in 1891 not a

88 Young mentioned that the training at Wycliffe would benefit Robinson in two ways. First, he would receive Biblical training from Dr. Sheraton. Second, he would qualify for a first position as a missionary instead of being a subordinate. Robinson refused Young's offer, insisting on more than two years at Wycliffe.

89 Young to Gould, May 12, 1898, ADA/30.
single convert was won to the Anglican faith. In attributing his inability to obtain converts to Roman Catholic competition and the migration of the Chipewyan westward in search of new hunting grounds, Lucas ignored another reason -- his failure to visit the existing camps regularly.

Having determined that missionary work at Fort Chipewyan would be unrewarding, Lucas requested reassignment within the diocese, preferably at Sturgeon or Spirit River. However, upon discovering he would have to surrender his European connection in order to undertake what he referred to as "real Indian missionary work" in the diocese, he cast his eyes further afield and announced a preference for a station in southern Alberta, British Columbia, or northern Japan. In the end, Lucas was granted a furlough for 1899 and subsequently transferred to the Diocese of Mackenzie River.

A.J. Warwick did not fare much better than his co-worker. After spending two years as a teacher at Fort Chipewyan, he was reassigned to Fort Vermilion where, during his six year tenure, he was ordained deacon

90 Young to Holmes, March 21, 1898, ADA/30.
91 Lucas to CMS, August 14, 1897, CMS/A-121.
92 Young to Holmes, March 21, 1898, ADA/30; and Lucas to CMS, December 30, 1899, CMS/A-121.
93 Lucas was not anxious to go to the Mackenzie River Diocese as he thought it also lacked the opportunity for "real" missionary work. However, Young recommended that he be transferred to the Mackenzie River rather than another diocese because he already possessed some mastery of the Chipewyan language.
Warwick's service at Fort Vermilion prompted Young to observe that he lacked spirituality and much preferred the company of HBC employees to working among the Indians. Believing that he possessed neither the zeal nor that quality of self-sacrifice requisite to Indian missionary activity, Young recommended to the CMS that he be sent to work among the white settlers and that a replacement be sent to work among the native population. When the Society refused the request for a replacement, Young was left with little choice but to send Warwick to Fort Chipewyan as the missionary in charge.

At Fort Chipewyan, Warwick faced the same difficulties as his predecessor. Like Lucas, Warwick did not travel extensively in his territory. CMS statistics on native church membership and school attendance from 1893 to 1904 indicate that Anglican strength did not increase at the rate which Young desired. Native church membership from 1893 to 1904 varied between forty and sixty and school attendance between ten and fifteen. Many, if not all, of the children taught were English métis because St. Paul's School did not receive a grant from the Department of Indian Affairs for teaching Indian children. In any case, the Anglicans were not able to increase their influence in the Catholic stronghold of Fort Chipewyan.

The station established among the Cree Indians inhabiting that area between the Athabasca and Peace Rivers was the last major mission founded

94 Young to Gould, September 21, 1898, ADA/30.
by the Anglicans during Young's episcopate. With the exception of Irene Training School at Fort Vermilion, St. John's Mission differed from all other Anglican missions in the diocese in that its main objective was to provide a boarding school for native children in the Wapuskaw district. The missionary in charge, Rev. C.R. Weaver, a graduate of Wycliffe in Toronto, boarded six Indian children for the first three months of the school's operation.

Young's initial impression of Weaver was of "a large, strong man accustomed to hardship and a diligent worker; a man who though slow in learning possessed a certain knowledge of agriculture." Although Weaver's performance in educating Indian children and attending to the spiritual requirements of the native population was satisfactory, his expertise in financial matters left much to be desired. Perhaps it was owing to his desire to teach as many Indian children as possible and to dissuade those Indians who suggested that they might withdraw their children from the school that he distributed many gifts of food and clothing. Despite Young's desire to see the school succeed, he was unwilling to alter his stance concerning the need for economical management of diocesan affairs. Weaver's rather haphazard distribution of

95 The mission was located on a height of land facing toward the narrow channel that connected the two Wabiscaw lakes.

96 Young to Laird, September 25, 1900, ADA/31.

97 Young to Richardson, September 21, 1898, ADA/30.

98 Eva Young to Young, July 13, 1901, ADA/31.
supplies among the Indian population failed to coincide with Young's financial policies with the result that in 1896 Weaver was instructed to limit the expenditures of the mission to $1,000 per year "until some of the present debt is extinguished." However, according to Eva Young's report on the mission's financial affairs, the bishop's instructions were not heeded. Weaver did not keep a record of the supplies he received and distributed supplies to anybody who requested them. Indeed, had it not been for the Finlayson bequest and the generous donations of the Women's Auxiliary in eastern Canada, the mission's existence would have been in jeopardy.

As the Anglican missionary team in the Diocese of Athabasca expanded, retirements and furloughs necessitated not only reassignments but also the appointment of additional agents. The White brothers -- William Grove, Alfred Speechly, and Charles Dewe -- were of the latter category. W.G. White was brought from the Diocese of Calgary in 1894 to replace Robinson at Atikameg. Two years later he was reassigned to St. Peter's Mission at Lesser Slave Lake while Holmes was on furlough in England. Upon Holmes' return, White returned to Atikameg in September, 1898.

While stationed at St. Peter's, he wrote to Young complaining "I am left

99 Young to Robinson, July 22, 1896, ADA/30.

100 Eva Young to Young, July 13, 1901, ADA/31. Eva Young, sent to the mission by Young during Weaver's furlough, was in charge of all household matters and supplies for the school.

here alone with two missions to look after and no possible opportunity of getting away to Whitefish Lake." As a result, C.D. White arrived to undertake the instruction of native children at St. Peter's in November, 1897, enabling W.G. White to travel to Atikameg when the need arose.

A.S. White, former Vicar of Albrighton Parish near Wolverhampton, England, arrived to assist Weaver at Wapuskaw in 1895. In September, 1896 he was transferred to Atikameg to take charge of St. Andrew's Mission. A.S. White provided Young with the opportunity to realize his dream of sending a man with a few years' experience in the diocese to a missionary college for formal training. Having observed his progress for two years, Young considered White to be "Of good missionary qualifications, earnestness, a desire to win souls, a strong constitution capable of hardness and fatigue and a fair mastery of the Cree language." As well as theological training, White's two years at Wycliffe College afforded him the opportunity to contact the various Anglican churches in

102 W.G. White to Young, July 16, 1896, ADA/30. In addition to the absence of Holmes, A.S. White left Atikameg in July, 1897 for further training at Wycliffe College.

103 C.D. White, born in India in 1863, passed a course at Sandhurst for the army, but failed to receive a commission. He received instruction at the Dominion Government Agricultural College near Ottawa. Peace Messenger, May, 1938, p. 4. Young to Holmes, March 21, 1898, ADA/30.

104 Peace Messenger, May, 1938, p. 4.

105 Young's annual letter, 1897, ADA/outgoing correspondence.
rural Ontario in an attempt to convince church authorities of the importance of the missionary activity in Athabasca and of the need for increased financial assistance from the Church of England in eastern Canada. Although Young had hoped that White would be able to attend Wycliffe for the full three year course, Scott's resignation necessitated White's returning to Fort Vermilion.

Young was more than satisfied with the performance of the Whites. W.G. White's establishing a boarding school at Atikameg in 1903 augured well for progress in that area. C.D. White, who became principal of the school in 1903 and was ordained in 1921, was considered a good teacher, liked by the children, and able to supervise the boys in agricultural work. And finally, the presence of A.S. White assured Young that Anglican work at Fort Vermilion would proceed apace. The White brothers, brought to the area in the mid-1890's, faithfully served the Church of England in the diocese into the 1930's.

David Curry, described by Young as "a somewhat rough-hewn Canadian, the son of old God-fearing settlers in Ontario", was engaged from Huron

106 For a description of the type of training White received at Wycliffe see: A.S. White to Young, December 26, 1897, ADA/30 and March 25, 1898, ADA/30.

107 Young ordained A.S. White on June 22, 1900, explaining that any delay "would have deprived the people at Vermilion of the Lord's Supper for a whole year". Young to Machray, September 22, 1900, ADA/31. For White's comments on his progress at Fort Vermilion see: A.S. White to CMS, June 25, 1901, CMS/A-121.

108 Young to Holmes, March 21, 1898, ADA/30.
College in London, Ontario and placed in charge of St. Andrew's Mission at Atikameg in the latter half of 1897. The following year he was ordained and reassigned to Christ Church Mission.  

The unfavorable reports he received of Curry's work must have distressed the Bishop. It was alleged that Curry exhibited what Bompas had described as "a Canadian repugnance toward the metis." William Taylor of the HBC wrote to Young in October, 1900 warning that: "If Mr. Curry remains in charge of this mission, you might as well close it up." The Bishop visited the mission to investigate the complaints and to his surprise discovered that "Everything about the mission looked neglected and out of order." A delegation of Indians waited on Young and complained that they could not understand Curry and that he could not understand them. Young terminated Curry's connection with the church and gave him notice to quit the mission the following summer.

With Curry's failure to establish Christ Church as a self-supporting mission, Young was again faced with the problem of attempting to locate an individual capable of fulfilling the requirements of the mission and operating it successfully. The Bishop wanted Christ Church to develop

109 Young to _____, May 12, 1898, ADA/30.
110 William Taylor to Young, October 8, 1900, ADA/31.
111 Young to Curry, October 9, 1900, ADA/31.
112 Ibid.
113 Young to Holmes, September 20, 1900, ADA/31.
beyond that of simply a mission farm and believed Murdoch Johnston, a lay reader stationed at Wapuskaw, to be the man for the task. After his ordination, Johnston was assigned to Christ Church in January, 1901 with instructions that:

> While not shunning controversies, I would advise you not to correct it but try rather by a plain and simple setting forth of the truths of God's Word and the pressing upon their attention the gracious offers of salvation set before us in the Gospel.

However, by this time, much of the area had become one of white rather than Indian population. Of eight children Johnston brought to the mission school in 1902, none were Indian.

Near the end of his episcopate, Young engaged the first Anglican missionary of Indian extraction to serve in the Diocese of Athabasca. Educated at Battleford Industrial School, Benjamin Couteau had been confirmed by Young during a visit to Battleford in 1897. Described by Rev. Matheson as "a printer, and has considerable knowledge, as a young lad, of carpentering. He is well versed in Cree, his mother tongue, and he is a good honest Christian lad ...", Couteau was sent to Fort Vermilion to assist Rev. A.S. White. Although Couteau was a native

---

114 Eva Young to CMS, January 6, 1899, CMS/A-121.
115 Young to Murdoch Johnston, January 31, 1901, ADA/31.
116 Johnston to Young, October 2, 1902, ADA/incoming correspondence.
117 Matheson to Young, February 16, 1901, ADA/incoming correspondence. Young to Matheson, January 29, 1901, ADA/31. Young thought that Couteau might have some stature among the Indians because his grandfather was a Cree chief in the Battleford district. There are no indications that this was the case. Young to Gould, December, 1901, ADA/31.
missionary, the Church of England's popularity with the Indians did not increase. The Irene Training School was closed in 1912 owing to a lack of Indian pupils. Couteau became of greater assistance to the Anglicans as a printer of publications distributed within the diocese rather than as a missionary.

The attributes and performance of those Anglican missionaries labouring in the Diocese of Athabasca have been assessed solely on the basis of Young's criteria. But were the attributes Young considered essential to successful missionary activity indeed relevant? Owing to its intangibility, a missionary's spiritual conviction is one of the most difficult attributes to evaluate. If zeal and itinerancy were the components of spiritual conviction, few of Young's missionaries need be ashamed of their record. Garrioch, Robinson, and Scott travelled extensively throughout the diocese preaching the Gospel and administering to the native population. The White brothers also fulfilled their duties zealously. George Holmes' exceptional energy and zeal warrants special mention -- it was he who pioneered Anglican activity at Atikameg and Wapuskaw where the Church of England established boarding schools among the Indian population. Had its missionaries not possessed this spiritual conviction, the Church of England undoubtedly would not have achieved in the Diocese of Athabasca the success it did.

Although both Young and Bompas recognized formal missionary training as a valuable asset, Bompas emphasized its importance to the extent of rejecting the application of a missionary, who had served in California, because he possessed no formal theological training.118 While the

118 Bompas to CMS, January 23, 1886, CMS/A-121.
majority of missionaries who served under Young had the benefit of formal training at Islington, Wycliffe, or St. John's, Robinson, Brick, and Burton were exceptions and A.S. White entered Wycliffe College only after serving several years in the diocese.

Young's preference for missionaries trained at these colleges was predicated upon his desire to avoid the "High" and "Low" church rivalry which permeated the Church of England. Stating that there was no room for distrust and misunderstanding in the diocese's isolated missions, Young dispensed with the services of two lay teachers at Wapuskaw, J.A. Bruce and H.A. George, who favored the "High" church doctrine and who were in constant disagreement with Weaver who subscribed to the doctrine espoused by the "Low" church. ¹¹⁹

Although Young did not construe spiritual conviction, scriptural knowledge, and missionary training as subordinate to those qualities of adaptability, self-reliance, and good health, it must be admitted that at times greater emphasis was placed upon the latter qualifications than on the former. This is not to imply that secular activities were deemed

¹¹⁹ Young to Richardson, September 21, 1898, ADA/30. Young's position was similar to that of Bishop Robert Machray:

I do not in the least object to a moderate High Churchman who is a good worker, but should be glad to have him if loyal to the Church as Reformed, that is, if willing to conform to our ritual, and not a man who would introduce the modern innovations of bowings, crossings, etc. I believe, apart from my dislike of these ways theologically, that they would be fatal practically to the Church here.

Robert Machray, p. 315.
more important than spiritual duties; it merely indicates that Young held a realistic view of the role to be played by the Anglican Church in Athabasca. Limited financial resources necessitated the establishment of self-sufficient missions and, if this goal were to be achieved, men with the ability to adapt to the harsh, remote, sparsely populated environment were needed -- men capable not only of constructing mission buildings but also of growing grain and produce to meet their own food requirements as well as those of a nomadic and starving native population. Missionaries who failed to adapt to the environment or to acquire a degree of proficiency in the Indian languages were the exception rather than the rule. Garrioch and Robinson, for example, quickly learned the language of the Cree and Beaver and were recognized as "jacks of all trades" capable of performing any duty required of them.

The emphasis Young placed on engaging missionaries possessing agrarian backgrounds resulted in an unusually large number of missionaries with agricultural experience being brought into the diocese. Their purpose was two-fold -- in addition to establishing self-sufficient units, it was anticipated that these men would instruct the native population in agricultural techniques and, by example, demonstrate the advantages that would accrue to the Indian if he were to forsake his nomadic way of life for a more stable agrarian lifestyle. However, with the exception of St. Luke's Mission at Fort Vermilion, the Anglican missions in Athabasca were never self-sufficient and relied completely on the church's financial resources for food and supplies.\textsuperscript{120}

\textsuperscript{120} Christ Church Mission at Shaftesbury Settlement has not been included as a self-sufficient mission because initially it was heavily subsidized by the Dominion government. Also, the amount of self-sufficiency the mission achieved resulted from an emphasis on agricultural enterprise rather than missionary endeavour by J. Gough Brick.
Despite Young's attempts to introduce sound financial management, several of his missionaries, Robinson and Weaver in particular, demonstrated total ineptitude in the performance of their financial responsibilities.

Realizing the rigorous life which faced missionaries destined to serve in the diocese, Young accorded good health a prominent place in his criteria for successful missionary work. Despite his insistence on physical fitness, service in Athabasca took its toll -- Holmes and Scott, Young's most successful missionaries, and even the Bishop himself were forced to leave the diocese for short periods of time to recover their health. That a number of men eventually resigned owing to ill health is testimony to the hardships they encountered. Men less fit could have rendered little service to the Anglican Church in Athabasca.

Despite having developed a set of criteria upon which to assess the suitability of missionaries for service in the Diocese of Athabasca, Young was frequently guilty of permitting emotional factors to influence his judgment. His concern for Mrs. Scott's health and happiness and the educational opportunities of the Scott children resulted in Rev. Malcolm Scott's being assigned to Fort Vermilion rather than Lesser Slave Lake, a region yet unoccupied by the Anglicans.\footnote{Young to CMS, December 24, 1885, CMS/A-121.} For the same
reasons, Young failed to reassign Scott -- a man possessing the necessary experience and ability to assume the task -- to replace Brick at Christ Church Mission. Although Young's sympathy and understanding are to be admired, his failure to utilize Scott's capabilities to the best advantage indicates questionable judgment if not dereliction of duty. The patience he exhibited in his treatment of the incompetent Burton and his decision to continue Garrioich's salary for a year after his departure must also be placed in one of these two categories.

Unfortunately for the Anglican missionaries serving in the Diocese of Athabasca, the effort they expended was disproportionate to the number of converts they secured for the Church of England. To a greater or lesser extent and in varying combinations, these missionaries possessed those qualifications which Young believed prerequisite to successful missionary work. And yet, the anticipated extension of Anglican influence in Athabasca failed to materialize. This failure certainly cannot be charged to Young's inability to attract suitable missionaries. Almost without exception, the men who served in the diocese did all in their power to further the Anglican cause in Athabasca. Nor can this failure be charged to Young's development of and adherence to an irrelevant set of criteria upon which to assess suitability for service. Young engaged agents who satisfied his criteria -- men who under ordinary circumstances should have -- indeed, would have -- made Anglican dreams for Athabasca a reality. However, the circumstances were not ordinary.
CHAPTER FOUR
Christianizing and Civilizing

Competition, effective opposition, denotes a striving for the same objective, whereas rivalry implies keen competition between opponents more or less evenly matched. If unqualified, rivalry often suggests unfriendliness or even hostility. Denominational rivalry for the souls of non-Christian populations is almost universal — and Athabasca was no exception. Writing in 1872, W.C. Bompas expressed the opinion that:

"a bitter or vexatious opposition in trade is much to be deprecated, the same as bigoted intolerance in religion but fair and honourable competition may be very allowable in matters of trade and religion."

However, "fair and honourable" competition would be an elusive commodity in an atmosphere in which "la lutte est sérieuse entre la vérité et l'erreur"², and both religious denominations prayed that "God graciously overrule all to His glory and defeat the designs of the enemy."³

Despite the intense efforts of the Anglican missionaries, the Roman Catholic Church retained and even increased the number of Indian converts to Catholicism. Several reasons for this phenomenon have been advanced: (1) the goals and attitudes of the Romanists were superior to

---

1 Bompas to MacFarlane, February 28, 1872, MacFarlane Papers, I, pp. 242-243.

2 Grouard, p. 273.

those of the Anglicans; (2) the Indians looked more favorably upon the priests than on the missionaries sent by the Church of England; and (3) the Church of Rome possessed more money and personnel for christianizing and civilizing activities in Athabasca. This chapter will attempt -- by analyzing the goals and attitudes of both Churches, native attitudes towards both factions, and the resources of Catholics and Anglicans alike -- to show that these reasons frequently have been overemphasized or misrepresented.

The goals of the Catholics and Anglicans in Athabasca were identical -- both denominations sought to bring Christianity and civilization to the native population. At the 1896 Provincial Synod held in Regina, Young declared: "The Church of England girds herself to the great work of winning souls and extending Christ's kingdom among those who would otherwise remain in heathen darkness." Writing in a similar vein, Faraud concluded that only Christianity could rekindle the burnt out fire and regenerate the Indian. Ab Uno Sangiunis, the motto of the Aborigines' Protective Society, was derived from a passage in Acts (17:26): "[God] hath made of one blood all nations of men for to dwell on the face of the earth." Similarly, Faraud wrote that the Indian and the European were brothers in Christ, regardless of their origins.

4 Young's Sermon at the Provincial Synod of Rupert's Land, 1896, p. 17.
5 Fernand-Michel, p. 282.
7 Fernand-Michel, p. 253.
Accepting the concept of "progress" as the law of Christianity, both denominations employed Christianity as a vehicle with which to deliver European civilization to the native population. Faraud asserted: "Mais que le Christianisme pénètre où la sauvagerie habite, l'homme acquiert alors le sentiment du vrai et du bien, il cultive les arts, et la civilisation apparaît."\(^8\) That the approach of teaching both the Bible and the arts of civilization was apparently successful in some areas is evident in a publication produced at an Anglican industrial school and printed by Indian students:

> It may be true that, when viewed in prospect by the Indians they may not covet the advantages of civilization for themselves, nor for their children, but no civilized nation can justify itself in leaving ignorant savages, whose country it has taken possession of, to determine their own course and follow the blind promptings of their natural impulses.\(^9\)

It is indeed ironic that despite their belief that contact with European civilization would divert the Indian from his nomadic existence and into a more stable way of life dependent upon agriculture, working on the river boats, or employment with the Dominion government, these churches recognized that "Settlement opened the eyes of the Indian to the white man's generally double life."\(^10\) In Northern Alberta, the

---

8 Ibid., p. 255.
9 The Work of a Few Years Among the Indians of Manitoba and the North-West Territories, Canada (Middle Church, Manitoba: Rupert's Land Indian Industrial School, 1893), p. 14.
10 The above quotation appeared in a reply to a questionnaire circulated by the Methodist Church in the 1900's. The question asked was "Are Indians generally improving or otherwise in their devotion to Christian forms of religion?" Charles Huestis, The Problem of the Indian [c. 1911], p. 9.
behavior of gold seekers on their way to the Klondike via the all-
Canadian route and of speculators purchasing scrip subsequent to the
signing of Treaty No. 8 did not exactly typify the way of life taught
by the Anglicans and Roman Catholics. Both missionary groups were
convinced that increased contact with the white man was responsible for
the decline in church attendance after the signing of the treaty. As
early as 1893, Young concluded that "Wapuskaw offers a good field for
building up a purely Indian mission pretty free from the contaminating
influences of evil living white men so often a stumbling block and
hindrance to our missionary work."11 Possibly the missionaries accepted
so many very young Indian children into their missions, in comparison to
those in other age groups, on the premise that Christianity and European
civilization could be best taught to children isolated not only from
Indian but also white society.

Sharing identical goals, the two religious denominations also
paralleled each other in their attitudes toward the Indian. Bishop
Bompas declared:

It is pitiful to see the comparative simplicity of the savage
imbibe the allurements to vicious pleasure which he learns from
more civilised races, without possessing that self-restraint
which enables those of a higher intellectual grade to moderate
their indulgence even in vice.12

In a similar vein, Mgr. Faraud stated that:

11 Young to Holmes, March 21, 1893, ADA/32, p. 669.
12 W.C. Bompas, Northern Lights on the Bible (1893).
Ainsi que tant d'autres peuples, avant que la vraie religion les éût éclairés, les sauvages encore infidèles ont tous les vices, toutes les corruptions; le sentiment de la retenue leur est inconnue; ils sont méchants plus par ignorance que par instinct. Leurs vices sont moins le résultat de leur nature que du milieu abject où ils vivent; ils sont égoïstes, et cela s'explique par la nécessité où ils sont de ne s'occuper que du soin de leur existence.  

Although missionaries tended to exaggerate the difficulties encountered in working among the Indians, the negativism of Bompas' and Faraud's attitudes toward the native population cannot be dismissed simply as dramatized accounts designed to foster increased financial support for missionary activity in Athabasca. Because the native population of the district failed to conform to the value system governing white society, the missionaries, unfamiliar with Indian customs and mores, unequivocally concluded that the Indian was at best an inferior member of the human race. However, the Indians' station in life could be greatly enhanced through the magic of conversion to Roman Catholicism. As non-Christians they were described by a Catholic priest as a naive and credulous people who live and die as children.  

After conversion, the Indian was depicted by many Catholic priests as endowed with the qualities of acuteness, intelligence, and common sense.

Bishop Young's attitude remained unchanged despite his becoming more familiar with Indian ways. Even as his episcopacy drew to a close,

---

13 Fernand-Michel, p. 257.
14 Ibid., p. 268.
he retained the belief that "The best way to regard them is as you would nominal, ignorant and godless Protestants, needing to be told of their sinfulness and of salvation through Jesus Christ." Remarking that "I am most concerned about the Indians", Young, in the same letter, wrote: "They have been faithfully dealt with and if they love darkness rather than light we can only feel grieved on their account." His apparent disenchantment with the Indians can be attributed in part to their unwillingness to convert from the Catholic to Anglican faith. The hostility to the Church of Rome which was a by-product of his religious training and missionary experience even precluded Young's accepting Indian converts to Catholicism as Christians:

In nine cases out of ten: nay I might say in all ten, except that they have been baptized and wear beads and with the disappearance of their medicine men have ceased to practice heathen rites in knowledge of the most elementary xlian truths, they are heathen still.

The Anglicans chose only to recognize the "weak, sensual minds" of Indians duped by the "painted images, gorgeous vestments, arrogant claims, and pomp" of the Roman Catholic Church.

15 Young to Lucas, April 21, 1898, ADA/30.
16 Young to Warwick, April 26, 1901, ADA/31.
17 Young to Fenn, August 1889, ADA/32, p. 177. Also see: Young to Fenn, November 18, 1890, ADA/32, p. 328.
Both groups of missionaries felt vastly superior to the Indian. Both denominations felt that the Indian could do nothing better than accept the European way of life and the "true" religion. In attempting to christianize and civilize the Indian to the European standard the Roman Catholics and Anglicans displayed paralleling goals and attitudes toward the native population. Since both denominations were so similar in their outlook, neither faction can claim superior goals and aims relating to Indian missionary work.

An assessment of missionary activity in the area would be incomplete if it failed to take into consideration Indian attitudes toward missionaries -- attitudes which constituted a realistic appraisal of the deteriorating position of the native population in the Athabasca and Peace River districts. With game on the decrease, disease on the increase, and their nomadic way of life affording an increasingly precarious existence, the Indians soon recognized that the missionaries offered more than eternal salvation. They were a reliable source of castor oil, eye wash, iodine, vaseline, boracic powder, cough syrup, and other medicinal compounds. Food, clothing, fish hooks, net twine, and other essential commodities were also available. "Leur attachment, leur dévouement même pour le missionaire, n'a souvent pour motif que l'intérêt"\(^\text{19}\) was an accurate assessment of the prevalent Indian attitude toward missionaries. One traveller observed that "In many places the Indians

---

\(^{19}\) Fernand-Michel, p. 265.
are Protestant in the winter when the times are hard, and Catholic when there is nothing to be gained." Because they were unable to match the Anglicans gift for gift, the Oblates feared their converts would be drawn to the Anglican faith not by a superior spiritual message but by an apparent abundance of material goods.

The spiritual message certainly did not produce a profound effect on the native population. Although one missionary declared that "We long to see them come in the spirit of enquirers after the light," even those Indians who attended church services regularly demonstrated little enthusiasm for the rite -- they viewed the service primarily as a social function. The message of salvation was meaningless to a people without any concept of sin. Such words as "sin", "heaven", and "hell" did not exist in the Cree, Beaver or Chipewyan vocabulary. How could the Indians be expected to value the missionaries' "saving health" when their bodies were being racked by the white man's dreaded diseases? They were more concerned with what the missionary could do to alleviate their physical suffering than what he could do for their spiritual welfare.

20 Somerset, p. 17.
21 On Bompas' missionary zeal, one priest commented: "So far the natives do not mind him, because he has arrived without his baggage; but behold, he is to receive in a few months ten or twelve bales of goods and one box of remedies weighing 120 pounds. Morice, I, p. 343.
22 A.S. White to Young, May 26, 1896, ADA/incoming correspondence.
In general, the Indians were not greatly influenced by the missionaries of either denomination. For maximum effectiveness, cultural change had to be both total and rapid.\(^{23}\) Because conditions in the Diocese of Athabasca prevented a complete isolation from his traditional way of life, the Indian was in an excellent position to govern the extent to which he adopted the principles of Christianity and European civilization as taught by the missionaries. A nomadic people, the Indians, many of whom considered agricultural pursuits degrading, preferred the life of their ancestors. A few chose to abandon their former way of life and settle permanently around major fur trading posts in the diocese. Others, especially the aged and infirm, found security at the various missions, performing odd jobs and generally relying on charity for their existence.\(^{24}\)

The arrival of government commissioners with treaty payments lessened Indian economic dependence on the missionaries. As a result, native congregations became fewer in number and church attendance at both Anglican and Catholic services decreased. In the majority of cases, despite continued exposure to the teachings of the missionaries, the Indian retained a preference for the customs of his forefathers -- customs he was hesitant to exchange either for assurances of eternal life or advanced civilization.


\(^{24}\) At Wapuskaw, a Cree woman named Catherine preferred to live outside the mission, going to the mission half a day once a week to do the rougher washing for fifty cents. Her two daughters brought water to the mission at the rate of seventy-five cents per week that was paid in food and clothing. Eva Young to Young, July 13, 1901, ADA/31.
Missionaries of both denominations were constantly in contact with the stolid apathy of the Indian to Christianity. Perhaps the harsh conditions in Athabasca dictated that non-essentials, even if they were introduced from without, could not be tolerated. Food, clothing, and shelter were all-important. If one denomination announced that it would distribute flour after a Sunday service, the other denomination in the area would have to postpone its services for that day owing to a lack of attendance. For religious purposes, the Indian attitude was one of indifference -- a distinct preference for either the Roman Catholic or Anglican missionary was undistinguishable.

Although Anglican missionaries frequently made reference to the unlimited finances of the Oblates, their resources were not as great as the Anglicans presumed. The Franco-Prussian War of 1871 represented so severe a drain on the financial resources of French charitable organizations that Roman Catholic missionary activity suffered considerably for a number of years after the war. L'Oeuvre Apostolique, the Society of the Propagation of the Faith, and the Society of the Holy Childhood, charitable associations approximating those which financed Anglican activity in Athabasca, were far from extravagant in allocating funds for use by the Vicar Apostolic of Athabasca-Mackenzie River. Just as the CMS local finance committee governed the expenditures of Anglican missions, the vicariate of missions controlled the financial administration of Oblate missions. Oblate priests and Anglican missionaries alike
were compelled to operate within certain financial guidelines.\textsuperscript{25}

Because its missionaries received no salary, the Catholic Church enjoyed a slight financial advantage. Unlike their Anglican counterparts, the Catholics were able to engage a sufficient number of lay helpers to perform manual tasks, thereby releasing the priests to pursue only their spiritual duties.\textsuperscript{26} Although utilization of lay helpers undoubtedly reduced certain construction costs, there is little evidence to substantiate a belief that missionaries devoting their time and efforts exclusively to a propagation of the Catholic faith obtained a greater number of converts than did missionaries who apportioned their time between temporal and spiritual duties. It is apparent that by engaging Henry Robinson and other laborers to perform duties approximating those of the lay brothers in an effort to free their missionaries for "higher" work, the Anglicans did not appreciably increase the number of converts to their beliefs.


\textsuperscript{26}For a portrayal of the role of lay brothers see: A. Gauthier, \textit{Heros dans l'ombre, mais heros quand meme} (La Société Historique de Nouvel-Ontario Sudbury, 1956). For a criticism of the system of lay brothers see: Young to Oldfield, December 7, 1892, ADA/32, pp. 630-631.
Nevertheless, because they were sent to the diocese, the Roman Catholic Church encountered little difficulty in obtaining and maintaining priests. The Anglicans, on the other hand, discovered that the salaries paid and the hardships experienced by missionaries laboring in the North-West made it exceedingly difficult to attract suitable candidates to the Diocese of Athabasca. In the 1850's, the wage of clergy in local connection had been £100 per annum. Although the cost of living had quadrupled by the 1880's, the standard wage remained unchanged. Young, as financial agent for the Athabasca diocese, wrote to the CMS in 1883 and reported that unless agents were assisted in their training and granted £100 and travelling expenses, it would be almost impossible to engage Manitobans to serve in the northern missions. Because the Church of England required missionaries for the Algoma Diocese in northern Ontario, eastern Canada was incapable of supplying as many missionaries for service in the North-West as the CMS anticipated. Six years later, in 1889, Young informed the Society that the greatest difficulty facing Anglican expansion in the Province of Rupert's Land was that of securing good men.

Freighting costs represented a major expenditure for both denominations. Anglicans and Oblates in the Athabasca and Mackenzie River districts experienced the same problem as St. Albert's Bishop Grandin, who

27 Machray to CMS, January 16, 1885, CMS/A-121. The salary for clergy in local connection in the Diocese of Athabasca was higher, being £150 a year. However, freight charges on goods shipped to the diocese more than made up the difference.
stated:

It is true I receive $600 for my school, but I am called upon to pay $1,500 for bringing into the country the articles which are given to the children we are educating, the old people who are destitute, and for the private use of those who are devoting themselves to this school.28

In 1893, shortly after the HBC doubled the tariff on packages, the Oblates purchased the "St. Joseph" to transport men and supplies on the Athabasca River above Fort McMurray and on the Peace River above the Vermilion Chutes. By 1902, the Oblates had four small steamers in service in Athabasca.29 For a variety of reasons, the Anglicans never contemplated the establishment of an independent freighting concern. Considering the HBC the most reliable carrier in the North, the Anglicans found it expedient to maintain good relations with the English company which served as a useful ally against the Romanists.30 Then too, at the time the general tariff was increased, Young had obtained the promise of the HBC commissioner that Anglican supplies would be carried at cost.31

28 Bishop Grandin to John A. Macdonald, January 24, 1881, Department of Indian Affairs, Black series, 19502, Vol. 1.


30 Young believed that "In the face of Romanist opposition, it was and is still urgently necessary to keep the Protestants united and friendly". Young to Harrison, May 25, 1891, ADA/32, p. 464.

31 J. Wrigley to Young, April 14, 1891, ADA/32. Wrigley referred to supplies purchased from the HBC. Realizing this, the general procedure was to purchase the goods required from the HBC wholesale warehouse in Winnipeg and have them manage all the arrangements for transport. The freight rates were approximately 8 cents per pound. Burman to Young, May 15, 1896, ADA/30.
These factors were undoubtedly a prominent consideration in the development of the Oblate freighting service -- a service which may well have strained Catholic financial resources.

Although Anglican missionaries stated that one of the reasons for their inability to gain converts in Athabasca was the presence of a veritable Roman army, Roman Catholic personnel, if lay brothers and sisters are separated from the missionaries, compared to Anglican missionaries does not indicate an overwhelming advantage for the former. During Young's episcopate, Roman Catholic missionaries outnumbered their Anglican adversaries twenty to fourteen. In the 1890's, as many as five Oblate missionaries were stationed at the Mission of the Nativity at Fort Chipewyan and an equal number manned St. Bernard's Mission on Lesser Slave Lake. The Anglican Church, on the other hand, maintained only one missionary at each of these posts. However, by consolidating their forces in those regions they had occupied prior to the advent of Anglican missionary activity in Athabasca, the Oblates failed to benefit from their numerical advantage. Instead, they were left to compete on a one to one ratio with the Anglicans at other locations within the diocese.

Their zeal and itinerancy, amply illustrated by the effectiveness with which they covered the diocese, did not render a significant advantage to the Oblates. Oblate strength enabled them to cover the Fort Chipewyan district so well that James Lucas experienced more than

32 Mgr. Faraud, stationed at Lac la Biche, was added to the Roman Catholic figure obtained from a survey of Le Canada Ecclesiastique, Saddler's Catholic Directory, and Hoffman's Catholic Directory.
a little difficulty in locating Indians to whom he could deliver the Anglican message. And yet, their zeal and itinerancy cannot be said to have exceeded that of the Anglican clergymen. Despite the Roman Catholic Church's well-established position at Lesser Slave Lake prior to the advent of the Anglicans, it was the Church of England that first extended itself northward to establish missions at Atikameg and Wapuskaw. The Catholic Church increased the number of priests at Lesser Slave Lake and established out-lying missions only as a response to the expanding Anglican activity in the diocese. Although Anglican missionary zeal may have been in part a reaction to their frustration at finding so many Indians already Catholicized, they continued their search for virgin territory. This quest was best exemplified by Henry Robinson's journeys to the western part of the diocese and the development of that region north of Lesser Slave Lake.

Nor is there sufficient evidence to indicate that the Oblates derived any particular advantage either from their missionary training or prolonged residency at a single mission station. As has already been shown, academic qualifications and theological training were unsatisfactory yardsticks with which to measure missionary potential. Spiritual conviction, zeal and itinerancy, combined with an ability to adapt to the environment appear to have been the determinants in the successful prosecution of Christianizing activities among the Indian population. Rev. George Holmes' service at Lesser Slave Lake was equivalent both in time and effort to that of Father A. Desmarais.  

33 Father A. Desmarais established a school at Lesser Slave Lake in 1865 and remained in the region until his death.
Nevertheless, Holmes did not enjoy as large a native Christian membership as his Oblate counterpart. Rev. Malcolm Scott labored fifteen years at Fort Vermilion without realizing the achievements his efforts warranted. The White brothers entered the diocese in the 1890's and devoted the rest of their lives to missionary work in the Diocese of Athabasca and reaped only limited reward. This inability on the part of Anglican clergymen to capitalize on continued residency at one mission suggests that Roman Catholic dominance was not a product of uninterrupted contact with the Indian population.

The strength of Roman Catholic financial resources and personnel does not indicate such a superiority over the Church of England that the overwhelming majority of converted Indians would be of the Catholic faith. However, Roman Catholic strength in financial resources and personnel did not give them the same overwhelming majority in the number of children taught. A brief study of the educational efforts of the two denominations will attempt to show that the Anglicans compared more favorably with their adversaries in work among the children rather than the adults.

Both denominations saw the advantages of educating the Indian youth rather than concentrating exclusively upon the adults in their efforts to bring Christianity and civilization to the native population. Believing that the Indian must eventually turn from nomadic habits to a more settled way of life which promised greater security, one priest commented that "to save the Indian we must start with the children. All
other expenses are a dead loss." His missionary experience in the field also brought forth the comment that "to wish to make grown up Indians farmers is absolutely labor lost." Day schools were also a comparative failure owing to the roving habits of the bands which enabled the missionaries to work with the children only for short periods of time.

Eventually, boarding schools came to be considered as the best means toward the goals of the "Christianization" of Indian children because of the barrier created between the pupils and their parents. The rules and regulations of boarding schools, such as the Anglican school at Wapuskaw, were specifically established to keep the children away from the "unwholesome" and "demoralizing" influence of camp life. Under these conditions, both denominations attempted to give their pupils abundant training in religion and citizenship.

34 Grandin to Langevin, Minister of Public Works, January 30, 1880, Department of Indian Affairs, Black series, 19502.
35 Ibid.
36 Bishop of Athabasca, C.R. Weaver, Henry Robinson, Eva Young, and Eliza Scott, "Rules and Regulations for the Indian Boarding School at Wapuskaw, 1902", ADA/32.
37 For examples of the objectives of their training programs see: The examination of Isadore Clut, Bishop Arindale, by the Select Committee of the Senate appointed to inquire into the resources of the Great MacKenzie Basin, Senate Journals, Appendix, 1888, p. 162; and Charles Riley Weaver, "Report of St. John's Mission, Wabiscow Lake, July 15, 1903", Sessional Papers, Department of Indian Affairs, XXXVIII, No. 11, 1904, p. 390.
Bishop Young was confident about the successful development of a strong boarding school program. In 1888, Young believed that "the fact that the priests do not employ themselves in education should give us an advantage which if wisely used ought to secure for us an influence over the children." Young proceeded to establish schools at Lesser Slave Lake, Wapuskaw, and Atikameg respectively. However, he underestimated Oblate work at Fort Chipewyan and did not realize that Father A. Desmarais arrived at Lesser Slave Lake in 1885 and taught approximately fifty children during the winter of 1886-87. Also, he did not foresee that a growing scarcity of game in the Fort Vermilion and Dunvegan areas would cause many Indians to move into different areas which would result in poor attendance at the Irene Training School and that Christ Church Mission would have considerable difficulty in obtaining students if the Shaftesbury Settlement was not a success.

Then too, Young could not have foreseen the injurious effect of the signing of Treaty No. 8 by the Indians of Athabasca on Anglican educational work in the diocese. Given the choice between scrip or treaty,

38 Report of the Diocesan Synod of Athabasca, 1888, p. 11. It was estimated that there were approximately 700 to 800 children in the diocese.

39 Young to Edgar Dewdney, Indian Commissioner, January 21, 1887, ADA/30. Young stated: "Nuns have school at Chipewyan and majority there half-breeds and not Indian children. They make no attempt to teach the Indian children of their own persuasion, but one of the priests teaches the daughter of the fur trader settled here."

40 For a list of the names of children that came to Desmarais' school see: A. Desmarais to Dewdney, April 20, 1887, Department of Indian Affairs, Black series, 39830.

41 Scrip was a certificate handed to metis or Indians which entitled them to property or cash immediately rather than the long-term benefits of treaty.
the majority of Indians and métis of the Anglican faith at Lesser Slave Lake, Fort Vermilion, and Wapuskaw chose scrip. Since the Dominion government limited their school grants to the children of treaty parents and made no provision for non-treaty children, Anglican schools were deprived of expected government support. Coupled with the reduction of CMS grants, government policy caused considerable financial hardship to the Anglicans in Athabasca.  

The Oblates did not let the Anglican educational efforts pass un-noticed. In 1888, A. Desmarais applied for a government grant for his boarding school at Lesser Slave Lake after he realized that the two Anglican boarding schools at Fort Vermilion and Fort Chipewyan, though much smaller than the Catholic establishment at Fort Chipewyan and Lesser Slave Lake, had received teaching grants. Although Desmarais received a grant, the Oblates could not understand how the Anglicans continued to obtain greater financial assistance from the Dominion government. At Lesser Slave Lake, Holmes received a $1,000 appropriation for the year ending May 31, 1896, whereas Desmarais received only $200

42 For the effects of Treaty No. 8 on Anglican educational work: Holmes to Young, December 26, 1899, ADA/32; Young to , September 25, 1900, ADA/31, p. 224; Young to Reeve, December 17, 1900, ADA/31, p. 267; and Journal of the Proceedings of the Ninth Regular Meeting of the Provincial Synod, Church of England in Rupert's Land, August 20 & 21, 1902, p. 77.

43 Desmarais to Dewdney, January 2, 1888, Department of Indian Affairs, Black series, 39830.
even though their pupil enrollment was approximately equal. Believing that the Oblates were unfairly treated, one priest wrote that "If the Department of Indian Affairs do not grant us our legitimate request, we shall be compelled to make our complaint by public letters...."

By the end of 1903, the Roman Catholics received grants for five of their six schools, whereas the Anglicans received grants for only two of their six schools.

An increase in staff, namely the arrival of Sisters of Providence and of Charity, assisted the Catholic missionaries to expand their educational activity. Their arrival enabled the Oblates to establish a boarding school at Wapuskaw, an area where the Anglicans had first established a boarding school. By 1903, four sisters were working in newly established boarding schools at Wapuskaw and Fort Vermilion, six at Fort Chipewyan and Smoky River, and eleven at Lesser Slave Lake.

44 Although statistics are contradictory, the Department of Indian Affairs returns are taken as the most reliable. Returns to the Department of Indian Affairs showed 23 pupils on the rolls of Roman Catholic boarding schools compared to 22 pupils on the rolls of the Anglicans. However, the Oblates claimed that they had approximately 70 families at Lesser Slave Lake compared to three or four for Anglicans which totalled 82 Catholic children boarded compared to fifteen Protestants. On the other hand, the Anglicans claimed that they had thirty-three pupils. Grouard to Reed, September 9, 1896, Department of Indian Affairs, Black series, 134858. Statistics of the Diocese of Athabasca, ADA/25.

45 Clut to Reed, July 13, 1896, Department of Indian Affairs, Black series, 134858. Clut was asking for grants to Holy Angels at Fort Chipewyan and St. Augustine at Smoky River as well as an increased grant to St. Bernard's School at Lesser Slave Lake.
Compared to the Anglicans, who had a combined total of thirteen lay teachers and matrons, the Oblates had a distinct advantage in expanding their boarding school program. J.A. Macrae, Inspector of Agencies and Reserves, remarked that there were fewer Anglican teachers than Roman Catholic teachers and that the Anglican schools were small and, with the exception of the Lesser Slave Lake School, less efficiently operated.

Yet, the Church of England attained some success in their competition with the Roman Catholic Church for native children. Although the Roman Catholics could claim approximately nine out of ten converts in the Athabasca diocese, their ratio of pupils was much less than nine to one. At the end of Young's episcopate, the Roman Catholics had 130 pupils compared to 110 for the Anglicans. The ability of the Anglican missionaries to obtain a relatively large number of children for their boarding

---


47 J.A. Macrae, "Report on Education in Treaty No. 8", December 7, 1900, Department of Indian Affairs, Black series, 134858.

48 For the year ended June 1903 see: Sessional Papers, XXVII, No. 11, 1904, p. 241. There was no report for St. Henri at Fort Vermilion and the figure of nine pupils for 1902 was added to the Roman Catholic total. The Anglican returns contained in the Sessional Papers did not include the number of pupils at Vermilion, Shaftesbury Settlement, Fort Chipewyan, and Atikameg which were added to the Anglican total. New Era, Vol. 1, No. 1, January 1903. The returns to the department should not be considered as completely accurate owing to figures in the New Era and Le Canada Ecclesiastique which give both denominations a substantially greater number of pupils. If the totals were taken solely from Le Canada Ecclesiastique and Anglican reports, the Roman Catholic Church would have had 318 pupils compared to 157 for the Church of England.
schools suggests that the possession of financial resources and personnel is not an adequate indicator to explain the large number of Catholic converts in the Athabasca diocese. If Roman Catholic resources were accountable for that Church's ability to obtain nine out of ten converts in the diocese, why were Catholic missionaries unable to obtain nine out of ten native children for their boarding schools?

Unfortunately for the Anglicans, their greatest success was in obtaining children for their boarding schools. The overall effort they expended in the Diocese of Athabasca was disproportionate to their ability to obtain converts. Despite the debilitating effects of inadequate financial resources, the expansionism envisioned in 1884 reached fruition during Young's episcopacy. Bearing the onerous responsibility of superintending the propagation of the Anglican faith among a starving, diseased, and Catholicized Indian population inhabiting a vast, remote, and cruel territory, Richard Young performed the duties of the office of bishop with competence and dispatch. The Anglicans who served under Young exhibited, in varying degrees, those attributes considered prerequisite to successful missionary endeavor. And yet, the anticipated extension of Anglican influence in the Diocese of Athabasca failed to materialize.

Although competition between the Anglicans and Roman Catholics in Athabasca was intense, a brief comparison of their goals, attitudes, and resources indicates that neither denomination enjoyed an appreciable advantage. Both were striving to instill in a people they neither understood nor appreciated the principles of Christianity and the standards
of European civilization. Oblate and Anglican alike operated within the framework of a rather straitened financial position. Their missionaries were approximately equal in number, dedication, and ability. The native population was as receptive to the teachings of the Church of England as they were to those of the Roman Catholic Church. Why then did only ten per cent of the Indian population embrace the Anglican faith?
CHAPTER FIVE
Conclusion

The most significant factor in the Anglican missionaries' inability to acquire an imposing number of converts during Young's episcopacy was the historical advantage of the Roman Catholic Church owing to its earlier presence in the Peace River and Athabasca districts. Universal experience had taught the Oblate order that it was of utmost importance to precede Protestant groups and form a solid relationship with the natives of a given region.\(^1\) In the Athabasca diocese, Grouard asserted that the entry of the Catholics into the country before the Church of England probably accounted for the majority of the population being Catholic.\(^2\) Young frequently alluded to the consequent restricted sphere into which the Anglicans were forced owing to the prior occupation of the diocese by the Catholics.\(^3\) This chapter will attempt to illustrate that the historical advantage held by the Catholic Church not only prevented the Anglicans from realizing the success their efforts warranted but also directly influenced Anglican missionary policies in the diocese.

Upon entering Athabasca in the 1840's, the Oblates devoted themselves to the study of the customs, traditions, and languages of the native peoples. That Young learned the Cree language by studying Father Lacombe's Cree dictionary and grammar book rather than Watkin's Cree-English

\(^1\) Champagne, p. 191.
\(^2\) Grouard to Reed, December 4, 1895, Department of Indian Affairs, Black series, 134858.
\(^3\) Young to Fenn, August, 1889, ADA/32, p. 175; Young to Pinkham, December 28, 1897, ADA/30; and Young to CMS, 1899, ADA/outgoing correspondence.
dictionary testifies to the linguistic proficiency of the Oblates. Once they had acquired a sound knowledge of the language, they commenced publishing religious tracts in syllabics. Although the Oblates published works in the Chipewyan language at a much earlier date than the Anglicans, the two denominations produced translations in Beaver and Cree almost simultaneously. Because their translations were produced locally, at Lac la Biche, the Oblates enjoyed a definite advantage over the Anglicans, who had to rely on translations that were first attempts in other regions of the Canadian West, difficult to obtain, and, in many instances, unsuitable for their needs.  

It was only after they had established a rapport with the Indians and had acquired proficiency in the languages that the Oblates directed their attention to teaching the natives the Christian meaning of such involved concepts as virtue, sin, the commandments of God, and the coming of the Son of God. Catholic religious services appealed to the Indian taste for the grandeur and were celebrated with all due pomp and ceremony:

High mass was preceded by the singing of hymns and a sermon in one or more languages depending upon the case. At the mass, the community sang the Kyrie, the Gloria, and the Credo. The Sanctus and the Agnus Dei were more often replaced by hymns in the indigenous language.

---

4 For a list of Catholic linguistic publications relating to the Chipewyan, Cree and Beaver languages see: Champagne, p. 189; and Bruce Peel, A Bibliography of the Prairie Provinces to 1953 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1956). For a similar list of Anglican publications also see Peel.

5 Duchaussois, p. 28; and Champagne, p. 188:

In addition to emphasizing the significance of religious observances and ceremonies, the Oblate priests presented themselves as mediators between God and His Indian children. The initial emphasis placed on developing a rapport with the Indians paid valuable dividends -- the natives became accustomed to this dual role of the priests and came to trust them implicitly.

By baptizing all the children on their first visit to an Indian camp, the Oblates were able to secure a large number of "converts". Although the Catholic priests did prepare the natives for baptism with instructions consisting of the teaching of prayers, hymns, some fundamental truths, and the principal duties of a Christian, their approach to baptism was not as discriminatory as that of the Anglicans. To the Oblates baptism represented not so much a culmination as an essential preliminary to achieving salvation.

The early presence of the Oblates in the diocese gave them the opportunity to learn the Indian languages before the Anglicans. Having acquired a firm knowledge of the languages, the Oblates were in a position to publish religious translations before the Anglicans. Equally important, they were able to present their concept of Christianity to the natives before the Anglicans. Also, they had a greater opportunity to perform baptismal rites than their counterparts. Like the Methodists,

7 For a summary of the preparation of the Indians for baptism by the Oblates see: Champagne, pp. 193-195.

8 Zaslow, Opening of the Canadian North, p. 65.
who had strongly entrenched themselves in the Alberta district of the North-West Territories, the Oblates regarded the Church of England's entry into the northwestern mission field as an unwarranted intrusion and prepared themselves to repel their forthcoming adversary. The historical advantage the Oblates had acquired became their most valuable weapon in their forthcoming competition with the Anglicans for the souls of the native population.

Richard Young was aware of the benefits enjoyed by the Catholics owing to this historical advantage throughout his episcopacy. Operating in a diocese consisting primarily of Roman Catholics and non-Christians, Young attempted to expand Anglican missionary work by locating in areas in which little missionary work had been done by the Catholics. Recognizing that the Roman Catholics were too strongly entrenched at Ile à la Crosse, he did not undertake expansion in the eastern portion of the diocese. Nevertheless the Anglicans did open missions at Atikameg and Wapuskaw. Conscious of obtaining the same type of historical advantage for the Anglicans in this area as the Oblates had obtained elsewhere, Young instructed his men to establish the Atikameg Mission with as much secrecy as possible in order to catch the Oblates off guard. Young also instructed his men not to participate in extensive itinerant work in the Lesser Slave Lake region during the development of Wapuskaw to ensure that it was not without a resident missionary whenever priests were in

9 Young to Reeve, January 20, 1887, ADA/30, p. 166.
The Church of England became the first denomination to establish missions, and later boarding schools at Atikameg and Wapuskaw. By 1930, Anglican missionary work among the Indian population was negligible except at these two mission sites.

The advantage that the Oblates had acquired by 1884, owing to their early presence in the diocese, forced Young to react in an attempt to improve the precarious Anglican position in Athabasca. Recognizing that "It is the weak point in our missionary operations and we are in this matter sadly behind the Romanists," Young attempted to equal or even surpass Catholic superiority in the knowledge of Indian languages and their ability to prepare linguistic publications throughout his episcopacy. He desired that Garrioch, Holmes and Lucas would master Beaver, Cree and Chipewyan to at least the same degree as had the Oblate priests, Grouard and Faraud. Although an earlier understanding by the Catholics of the native language spoken in the diocese resulted in various linguistic publications, Young thought that the Oblates were denying the Indians access to the written word of the Bible. If the Indians were able to read the Bible, Young believed that they would be less inclined to follow the doctrines of the Roman Catholic Church. To carry out such

10 Young to Holmes, October 25, 1890, ADA/32, p. 298; and Young to Holmes, January 29, 1895, ADA/32.

11 Young to Oldfield, December 7, 1892, ADA/32, p. 629. For Young's opinion on the importance and difficulty of learning native languages see: Young to Centenary Review Committee, April 30, 1897, ADA/30, p. 441.

12 Young, like most men associated with the CMS, believed that the ability of the Indians to read and understand the Bible in their own language was absolutely essential. "The great thing", Young presumed, "is to impress upon them the fact that it is God's word and that they can read that word for themselves and learn from it whether our teaching is according to it." Young to Weaver, June 17, 1897, ADA/30, p. 480.
a program Anglican translations would have to be improved and, more important, sufficient copies would have to be available for distribution to make the program effective.

The goal was to supply in Cree, the most common language in the diocese, a translation that would contain portions of scripture, such as the Gospels of St. Mark and St. John, the Creed, the Lord's Prayer, the Ten Commandments, and a few hymns.13 Syllabic characters, rather than Roman characters, were used in the translations for two reasons. First, the Oblates had established the precedent of using syllabics and it became popular. Young stated that "The Romanists are using the characters and unless we are willing to allow all the reading matter in the diocese to consist of their manuals and service-books we must do something in this direction."14 Second, the majority of adult Indians did not understand the Roman characters and those Indian children who were taught Roman characters usually forgot them owing to their short period at school.

Through the efforts of Bishop Young, the Anglicans established a printing press at Athabasca Landing that enabled them to provide a sufficient number of translations for wide distribution in the diocese.15

14 Young to Gould, December, 1895, ADA/32, p. 723.
15 For a summary of Young's involvement in printing see Chapter Two. For a list of religious translations published by the Athabasca Landing Mission Press see: Peel, 1008, 1145A, S136, S137, S143, and S166.
For example, 1500 sheets of hymns in syllabics were published in fifteen days in 1901. Recognizing the nomadic nature of the native population, translations as light and portable as possible were produced. St. Mark's Gospel weighed only 4 1/2 ounces and was bound in strong cloth.

When the Gospels were made readily accessible to the Wood Cree, the Anglican missionaries hoped that they would be willing to read the whole Bible in syllabics. To this end, a project of printing and publishing a revision of the Cree Bible was initiated. At the time of his resignation, Young was assured that the whole Bible would soon be ready for the Cree to read. In 1904 the revised New Testament appeared, the whole Bible four months later.

Yet the Anglicans' improved understanding of the language and the provision of adequate translations for the use of the native population did not seem to increase greatly their popularity. Despite increased proficiency in the Indian languages of the diocese by Holmes, Robinson, Lucas, Weaver, and the White brothers, as well as the placement of a missionary that was fluent in Cree at Christ Church Mission, there was little advancement in Anglican membership in the diocese. That the Indians received greater access to the Bible did not decrease Catholic support in the diocese. In arriving first in the country, learning the language, and maintaining contact with the natives, the Oblates obtained

16 Young to Matheson, May 15, 1901, ADA/31.
17 Bruce Peel, "How the Bible Came to the Cree", Alberta Historical Review, 6 (Spring, 1958), p. 19.
an historical advantage that the Anglicans, despite their commendable efforts, were unable to overcome.

The Catholic historical advantage played an important role in reducing the effectiveness of the Anglicans in their attempts to convert the natives to the Anglican concept of Christianity. One Anglican missionary commented that the Indians frequently visited him for their material needs, "but they never realize their spiritual needs trusting only in their Priests to save them". 18 Another missionary asserted that although the Beaver and Cree agreed that "There is but one God, that He is over all, and that we are all His offspring; ready enough to concur that we are saved by grace, and that there is but one Mediation between God and men, the man Christ Jesus," 19 they would not sever their connection with the Roman Catholic Church. Young's remarks concerning the worthiness of crucifixes and images as well as prayers to the Virgin Mary and the Saints appear to have had little impact on the Indian population. 20 The natives' apathy to Anglican pleas can only in part be ascribed to the Catholic presentation of Christianity -- that the Catholic faith succeeds better than forms of Protestantism because its

18 Robinson to Young, December, 1897, ADA/30.


20 Young to Baldwin, February 18, 1890, ADA/32. On attacks against the Oblates for excessively honoring Mary, Grouard commented that the image of the Mother of God was preferable to the image of Queen Victoria. Grouard, p. 138.
forms are more "primitive", and appeal more to the senses, whereas the forms of Protestantism are too "advanced". Indian apathy stemmed from an indifference to Christianity -- they were preoccupied with survival in a harsh land, not their spiritual welfare. They received Christianity from the Oblates, became accustomed to them, and felt no necessity to change their allegiance for the sake of vague doctrinal differences between the two churches. Despite numerous Anglican attacks on Roman Catholicism, the majority of the Indians continued to trust the priests.

The Catholic historical advantage was undoubtedly a major factor in Young's making decisions on the questions of baptism, polygamy and education that were contrary to the official position of the CMS. On baptism, Anglican missionaries were instructed by the CMS to baptize only those who fully accepted the Christian faith in place of their previous beliefs. However, many natives in Athabasca were already baptized by the priests and Young received reports from the field that Indians were reluctant to leave the Church that they were received into by baptism. The realities of the Oblate historical advantage demanded

21 Charles Huestis, The Problem of the Indian in Alberta, (c. 1911), pp. 9-12. The conclusion was reached after the Methodist Church received replies to their questionnaire relating to Indians in Alberta. Huestis concluded that the Methodist Church could learn much from the Roman Catholic Church about missionary work among the Indians.

22 For a summary of the CMS position see: Getty, pp. 90-92.

a relaxation on the baptismal rules of the CMS, especially those insisting that the missionaries not re-baptize children that were already baptized by another religious denomination. Because strict adherence to the CMS baptismal instructions would have resulted in the complete stagnation of Anglican missionary work, Young granted his missionaries permission to baptize or re-baptize whenever possible. Despite this liberalization of regulations respecting baptism, Anglican membership was not greatly affected.

The Catholic historical advantage also forced Young to abandon the CMS's position on polygamy. Faced with strong competition from a firmly entrenched opponent, Anglican missionaries discovered that most Indians were satisfied in their relationship with the Roman Catholic Church. Unsuccessful in attracting converts by explaining the theological differences between the two churches, Young was compelled to seek different means of attracting converts. The problem of polygamy, considered by both denominations as a major difficulty in attracting converts, gave Young an opportunity to possibly make inroads among the non-Christian population by adopting a position different from that of the Oblates. The Oblates, who were generally willing to admit natives to the Roman Catholic Church, did not accept polygamists and even delayed the baptism

24 Young asked Garrioch not to mention the re-baptism of children in his annual letter to the CMS. Young to Garrioch, April 11, 1891, ADA/32, pp. 415-418.

of former polygamists.26

Although the Anglican bishops, at the Lambeth Conference of 1888, resolved that "a converted polygamist should not be baptized, but should continue a catechumen until he should be in a position to accept the law of Christ,"27 Young disagreed with the written ruling. Circumstances in the field, rather than an unrealistic doctrinaire position established at headquarters, Young felt should be the criteria in ascertaining whether polygamists could be admitted into the Church of England. He noted that during Christ's time a polygamist was admitted into the Christian Church and observed that, in his diocese, the older wives suffered as the Indians, when forced to choose one wife, usually selected their youngest one.28 Although Young accepted polygamists into the

26 Champagne, p. 194. Naturally, the Catholics were perturbed about Young's opinion on polygamy. Only as a gimmick to secure converts could Grouard understand why, instead of combating the irregularities of Indian tradition, Anglican missionaries condoned the Indian practice of polygamy. How else could a Christian proclaim, "Gardez vos femmes, cela ne nous fait rien; venez chez nous avec elles, et nous vous recevrons avec plaisir dans notre église." Grouard, pp. 275-276 and 318-319.

27 Stock, p. 646. Bompas agreed with the decision and strongly objected to Young's point of view. It was Bompas's opinion that "When the heart of a polygamist is really changed and those of his wives also are really changed so that they are fit to be godly Christians then neither the man nor the wives will wish to remain together, but that they will voluntarily and gladly separate." Bompas to Young, July 18, 1896, ADA/32.

28 Young to Machray, March 30, 1888, ADA/30; and Young to Gould, April 2, 1895, CMS/A-121.
Church of England, he instructed his missionaries to inform potential converts that after baptism they could marry again only upon the death of their present wives and then only to one wife.  

Although Young's policy of condoning polygamy after baptism appears to have been a partial solution to a vexed social question in the Indian's changing world, it appears that few Indians considered it in deciding whether or not they would become Christians. The success the Anglicans enjoyed can probably be attributed to their itinerant work in the remaining virgin areas in the diocese rather than to religious practices and policies.

On education, the Catholic historical advantage was mainly responsible for Young's disregarding the CMS's position that the conversion of the adult population should take precedence over educational work among native children. A combination of two factors -- the inability to obtain many adult converts and an awareness of the potential of educational work among the children -- influenced Young's decision to develop a boarding school program.

Anglican educational efforts were relatively successful during Young's episcopate. Although the Roman Catholics could claim approximately nine out of ten converts in the Athabasca diocese, they had only 130

29 For an example of Young's instructions see: Young to A.S. White, May 10, 1902, ADA/31, p. 440.
pupils compared with 110 for the Anglicans in 1903. However, six years later departmental returns indicated that the Roman Catholics had 145 pupils compared with 85 for the Anglicans. For the year ending March 31, 1922, the Roman Catholics had 154 pupils compared with 39 for the Anglicans. Thirty years after Young had left the diocese, the Roman Catholics had 360 pupils compared with 54 for the Anglicans. Only the Anglican boarding schools at Wapuskaw and Atikameg, both of which had been built prior to Roman Catholic boarding schools in their immediate area, had survived.

The demise of Anglican missionary activity in all areas of the diocese except at Wapuskaw and Atikameg further indicated the importance of historical advantage. The Roman Catholics dominated the areas in which they preceded or began recruiting boarding school pupils at approximately the same time as the Church of England. Overall, the


31 Annual Report of the Department of Indian Affairs for the Year Ended March 31, 1922, (Ottawa: King's Printer, 1922), p. 67. The largest number of pupils attending one school was the Sturgeon Lake school which had 43 pupils.

32 Annual Report for the Department of Indian Affairs for the Year Ended March 31, 1933, (Ottawa: King's Printer, 1933), p. 52. The Anglican Boarding School at Lesser Slave Lake was closed on June 30, 1932.
educational efforts of both denominations illustrated that the denomination which initially established boarding schools in a given area held a considerable advantage over its rival.

The Catholic historical advantage compelled Young to establish policies better suited to the diocese on the questions of baptism, polygamy, and education in an effort to obtain more converts for the Church of England, but to no avail. Young found the Catholic position in the diocese so dominating that he went so far as to attempt to recruit an ex-priest who previously had labored in the diocese to assist him in persuading the Indians of the errors of their ways. 33 Throughout the diocese, Anglican success in obtaining adult converts became so limited that Young stated to his missionaries: "Could our efforts result in the conversion of two or three Indians at each mission station we might feel that this land may yet be won for Christ." 34

Historical advantage was indeed a most significant factor in assessing missionary activity in the Diocese of Athabasca. An authority on missionary approaches and methods suggested that missionary activity among a people scattered over a vast area stood less chance of success than did proselytizing in a concentrated area. 35 Yet, under similar conditions, the Catholics attained considerable success compared with

33 Young to Wigram, January 2, 1891, ADA/32, pp. 383-384.
that of the Church of England. Another authority stated that in the mission field "character counts for more than learning, for more than skill. Character, humanely speaking, is almost everything." Yet, the majority of Anglican missionaries, especially Young and Holmes, did not lack character and were still unable to obtain a significant number of adult converts. If the Church Missionary Society had realized the importance of the one significant advantage that the Roman Catholic Church enjoyed over the Church of England -- the historical advantage resulting from their being the first religious denomination to enter and maintain their strength in the Diocese of Athabasca -- it probably never would have engaged itself in supporting missionary activity in that remote corner of the world.

36 Sydney Gould, Inasmuch: Sketches of the Beginning of the Church of England in Relation to Indian Eskimo Races (Toronto, 1917). Statement was made by Eugene Stock, former national secretary of the CMS.
BIBLIOGRAPHICAL NOTE

The Letterbooks of Bishop Young, the Incoming and Outgoing Correspondence of the Church Missionary Society and the Diocese of Athabasca, the Department of Indian Affairs correspondence, the Diocesan Synod Reports, and the Sessional Papers proved the most productive sources of information for this study.

A.G. Morice's *History of the Catholic Church in Western Canada* provided the author with some valuable information pertaining to the financial and personnel resources of the Catholic Church in Athabasca and Grouard's and Fernand-Michel's works provided valuable insights into the goals and attitudes of the Catholic Church to the native population of Athabasca. The anthropological studies of Jenness, Mandelbaum, and Goddard contain pertinent information on the Indian peoples of the Athabasca region.

Abbreviations of Sources Cited

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PAC</td>
<td>Public Archives of Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMAA</td>
<td>Provincial Museum and Archives of Alberta</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BIBLIOGRAPHY

PRIMARY SOURCES

1. Government Documents


2. Government Records

Canada. Department of Indian Affairs. Correspondence relating to governmental and missionary activity among the native population of the Diocese of Athabasca, 1874-1904. PAC.

3. Church Records


Church of England, Diocese of Athabasca. Incoming and Outgoing Correspondence, 1884-1903. Originals and microfilm at PMAA, Edmonton.

Church of England, Diocese of Athabasca. Letterbooks of Bishop Young, 1884-1903. Originals and microfilm at PMAA, Edmonton.


Church Missionary Society, Records of. Incoming and Outgoing Correspondence, 1874-1903. Microfilmed by PAC. Copy in Glenbow-Alberta Institute, Calgary.

4. Private Diaries, Papers, and Manuscripts


Garrioch, Alfred Campbell. Correspondence, 1888. Anglican Church of Canada Archives, Toronto.


Macfarlane, Roderic. Correspondence, 1874-1904. PAC.

Richardson, Hugh. "Diary of a Trip with Annuity Party, Treaty No. 8, Athabasca District, 1902". Unpublished manuscript, PAC.


SECONDARY SOURCES

1. Books


Bompas, W.C. Northern Lights on the Bible. 1893.


Le Canada Ecclesiastique. 1891-1894, 1900.


Crockford's Clerical Directory. 1884-1904.


Garrioeh, A.C. A Hatchet Mark In Duplicate. Toronto: Ryerson Press, [c. 1929]


Huestis, Charles. The Problem of the Indian in Alberta. [c. 1911]

Hughes, Katharine. Father Lacombe, The Black-Robed Voyageur.


The North West Canada Missions. London: Church Missionary Society, 1907.


The Work of a Few Years Among the Indians of Manitoba and the North-West Territories, Canada. Middle Church, Manitoba: Rupert's Land Indian Industrial School, 1893.


2. Articles


Grouard, Emile. "Vicariat du Mackenzie". Missions De La Congregation Des Missionaries Oblats De Marie Immaculee. XXXVIII (Mars, 1900), 68-93.


Masters, D.C. "Patterns of Thought in Anglican Colleges in the Nineteenth Century". Journal of Canadian Church History, VI, (Dec. 1964), 54-68.

Peel, Bruce. "How the Bible Came to the Cree". Alberta Historical Review, 6 (Spring, 1958), 15-19.


3. Newspapers and Periodicals

The Church Missionary Intelligencer and Record. London, 1884-1903.

New Era. Toronto, 1903-1904.

The Peace Messenger. Peace River, April, October and November, 1934, and April, May, 1938. Microfilm at PMAA, Edmonton.

The Western Churchman. Winnipeg, September 3, 1896.
Missions De La Congrégation Des Missionnaires Oblats De Marie Immaculée. 
Paris, 1884-1903.

4. Theses


MacPherson, R.J. "The Influence of Civilization on the North American Indian". Submitted to the Board of Studies of the University of Manitoba, 1902.


