

Alan Livingston MacLeod. *Remembered in Bronze and Stone: Canada's Great War Memorial Statuary*. Victoria: Heritage House, 2016. Pp. 192.

Alan Livingston MacLeod's *Remembered in Bronze and Stone: Canada's Great War Memorial Statuary* is a basic introductory survey into First World War soldier-statues located across the provinces that were built between 1918 and the late 1920s, with interesting commentary on the various ways Canadians attempted to remember the dead in the decade after the war. MacLeod defines soldier-statues vaguely as representations of soldiers, noting that he excluded other memorial statuary because "life-sized effigy of a Canadian soldier are the ones that most effectively meet the prescribed duty" to evoke sentiments that lead to remembrance (p. 18). This decision is perhaps expected given that recessive monuments (which are set into the ground, like Maya Lin's Vietnam Veterans' Memorial) were not conceptualised when First World War statues were created. However, given that the book was published in 2016 and there has been a shift to recessive monuments to represent conflict, MacLeod's approach could have been explained through either historical context or monument design theory, rather than a subjective argument like the one he chose. It should be noted at this point that MacLeod focuses exclusively on the provinces, excluding the territories and Newfoundland and Labrador as it was not part of Canada until 1949. He does not explicitly explain why he takes a regionalist approach, but it can be assumed that it is due to Canada's population largely residing in the provinces between 1918 and 1929.

The book is presented in a straight-forward manner, with the first chapter serving as an introduction to the kinds of war memorials found across Canada. The second chapter is focused on Italian-produced Carrera marble and notes that while there is slight variance among the statues, they generally look the same, all representing a sense of loss. Because he cannot locate records that would prove otherwise, MacLeod assumes that the sculptors of many of these statues are nameless sculptors from Italy, but I wonder about the extent to which MacLeod looked at city and local Legion records, rather than solely records relating to female-led community organisations, who likely had a large hand in pushing for the creation of the monuments

and would at least have the name of a studio. If these sources were consulted, it is unclear due to the vague source descriptions provided.

Chapter Three examines bronze memorials, noting that the majority of these were produced in Britain and the United States. Unlike the previous chapter, the majority of the statuary in Chapter Three can be connected to a sculptor or artistic tradition. MacLeod makes some interesting comparisons to sketches found in *Punch* magazine, but his analysis is superficial. His argument could have been enhanced with more detail and further comparison to other allegories of the Canadian soldier in art produced during the war, such as the Canadian War Memorials Fund paintings (now part of the Beaverbrook Collection at the Canadian War Museum) or other sketches circulated in magazines and recruitment posters.

Chapter Four explores the eighty bronze statues produced in Canada. More so than in the previous chapters, there is a strong emphasis on the artists and studios behind the works. MacLeod pays particular attention to McIntosh Granite and the Rogers-Tickle effigies located predominantly in Ontario, noting that these statues were created as part of the post-war commemorative process in towns and cities. He swiftly moves on to allegorical statues, with particular attention to Walter Allward, but limits himself to those that feature soldier effigies, under the presumption that the soldier-statue was the most effective at communicating loss and/or death.

There is a striking absence in *Remembered in Bronze and Stone*. MacLeod does not include an extensive list of sources, instead opting for a two-page summary of books that influenced him and a passing mention of files from Library and Archives Canada. As a result, the reader cannot follow up on his quotations and other information about the statues. This makes it difficult for an interested reader to conduct further research or find further information about the works mentioned. There appears to be heavy reliance on secondary sources like Jonathan Vance's *Death so Noble: Memory, Meaning and the First World War* and Tim Cook's volumes on Canada and the First World War. MacLeod notes his use of Library and Archives Canada's First World War personnel files, war diaries and death registers, but beyond this there does not appear to be an extensive list of primary sources that one might expect from other scholarly works. The lack of primary sources also calls into question the validity of some of the arguments made about the statues themselves, especially comments made about the artists and studios of origin.

The strengths of MacLeod's *Remembered in Bronze and Stone: Canada's Great War Memorial Statuary* are two-fold. The first is the elegant prose MacLeod employs to describe the monuments. His writing is eloquent and easy to follow, which would benefit a wide audience. It also makes it easier to understand the basic principles of the monuments and the ways in which stone and bronze communicate loss. The second strength of the book is the photographs of the monuments. Instead of relying solely on prose to illustrate his ideas, MacLeod includes detailed coloured photographs of the statues (some of which are his own, others I suspect are uncredited photographs taken by Veterans Affairs Canada). Placing the photographs alongside the text gives the reader a clear understanding of the visual elements MacLeod wants to highlight in his discussion and provides excellent reference points for visual comparison between all of the statues presented within the book.

This is the only book I am aware of that has created a comprehensive survey on the different renditions and types of soldier-memorials in Canada, but as an overall study of war memorials, McLeod does not offer profound insight into how Canadians commemorated conflict through art. Nor does the book offer great acuity into how statues reflect the sentiments of those who commissioned the works. With easy-to-follow prose, this is an excellent introductory book on war commemoration for an interested general audience or for undergraduate students who seek a starting point into the study of memorialisation in Canada. But for scholars, particularly those interested in commemoration and war art, this book offers few insights that cannot be gained either through more recently published works or their own study of war memorials.

SARAH L. HART, *CARLETON UNIVERSITY*