

11-1-1993

Mary for All Christians

Peter C. Erb

Follow this and additional works at: <http://scholars.wlu.ca/consensus>

Recommended Citation

Erb, Peter C. (1993) "Mary for All Christians," *Consensus*: Vol. 19 : Iss. 2 , Article 20.
Available at: <http://scholars.wlu.ca/consensus/vol19/iss2/20>

This Book Reviews is brought to you for free and open access by Scholars Commons @ Laurier. It has been accepted for inclusion in Consensus by an authorized editor of Scholars Commons @ Laurier. For more information, please contact scholarscommons@wlu.ca.

literary theory and interpretation in the humanities as a whole. In these carefully translated essays (Jüngel was not so fortunate in the accuracy of the translation of his *God's Being*) the English-speaking reader can gain a much fuller appreciation of Jüngel's insights into the function of metaphor and a novel, positive approach to anthropomorphic language, according to which Jüngel refuses to accept the human speaker as a "fixed point", but rather as "a subject of movement, a process of self-transcendence, not 'fixed and set in... actuality, but... aligned to the possibility of the world'" (Ibid., 8). The remaining five essays develop the implications of the positions put forward for anthropology, natural theology and the Protestant doctrine of the sacraments.

Those fascinated by Julia Kristeva's critique of the transcendental ego will have in the first three essays in particular much to consider, but all of them have wide importance, not only for Christian theology and religious practice, but for many other dimensions of contemporary life. One might hope, for example, that Webster, who makes some interesting comments on the relationships between Jüngel and Ricoeur, in both the *Introduction* and the *Theological Essays* will expand his comments at some future point to include reflections on "later" French deconstructionist and Lacanian theories. The latter, albeit for the most part in popular forms and sometimes in popular caricatures of themselves, are peculiarly "modern" apologetics for the tradition which Jüngel characterises in *God as the Mystery of the World* as responsible for the "linguistic displacement" of God, and for which his work can almost certainly provide an antidote, taking seriously as it does the roots out of which such post-modernist doctrines have grown.

Lutherans might make one additional request of Professor Webster: Jüngel's reflections on Luther's "Freedom of a Christian", originally printed in 1977 has just appeared in its third German edition; an English translation of the work (*Zur Freiheit eines Christenmenschen: Eine Erinnerung an Luthers Schrift* [München: Ch. Kaiser, 1991]) would be appreciated not only for those interested in Jüngel, but especially for all concerned with the implications of traditional theological positions for our contemporary world.

Peter C. Erb
Wilfrid Laurier University
Waterloo, Ontario

Mary for All Christians

John Macquarrie
London: Collins, 1991

One of the subjects which has raised continued discussion in Anglican-Roman Catholic dialogue and which has serious implications for Anglican-Lutheran dialogue as a result, is the place of Marian theology and devotion in Christian faith. Contemporary interest in women's issues has, in

a sense, forced the topic upon us, but even a general review of literature on the Virgin makes it immediately obvious that the Marian tradition has much broader implications for Christian life than the gender question alone. Macquarrie's book is especially helpful in establishing some primary points for discussion and is intended for *all* Christians.

The six chapters are written in a broadly popular style. For the most part they were initially presented as lectures or seminars of the Ecumenical Society of the Blessed Virgin Mary. The first, entitled "God and the Feminine", takes up several matters directly related to women's concerns: the Judaeo-Christian rejection of goddess worship, Freud and Jung on women's psychological make-up, inclusive language, and the Genesis account of male and female. In this chapter the author separates Marian devotion from pre-Christian goddess worship, develops a modified Jungian theory of female-male balance in society and the individual, and attempts in a somewhat out-fashioned way to explain, yet once again, that Christian theology and the English language do not engender God in their use of the referent "he".

On the latter point Macquarrie's philology may be right, but unfortunately he does not deal with the central question: that of the psychological implications of exclusive language for women and men in our present situation. Ruth Page once suggested that feminists made God male; whether she is correct or not, the fact remains that, although certain English terms may have functioned inclusively throughout earlier ages, they clearly no longer do so, even among persons enclosed by the protective walls of Tom Quad in Macquarrie's Oxford and certainly not on the New York streets outside Union Theological Seminary where he taught for eight years.

In his discussion of Mary in the New Testament, Macquarrie treats the tensions which must have existed between Jesus and his mother and which are specified in a highly realistic way in Mark, applying the implications of his analysis there in his treatment of the conception and birth narratives in Matthew and Luke and in the Gospel of John.

The third, fourth and fifth chapters are devoted to those central Marian doctrines, critical for any ecumenical discussions: the Immaculate Conception, the Glorious Assumption, and Mary as Coredemptrix. On all these topics Macquarrie, as might be expected, is concerned with "explaining" the point at issue for a late twentieth-century audience, enunciating as he does so, Mary's role as demonstrative of the positiveness of human nature. Mary's immaculate conception is first treated in the context of her election within the mind of God, then as her manifestation as the fulfillment of God's chosen people, Israel, and, finally, as her physical conception by her parents "without sin", that is, in full union with God's will, not sinfully estranged or separated from God (Macquarrie rejects any notion of sin as "stain"). The treatment of the assumption follows somewhat similar lines: As the Church, Mary is "taken up" by the divine, body and soul into heavenly glory.

The chapter on Mary as Mediatrix will be of most interest to Protestants, particularly to Lutherans, dealing as it does with the vexed question

of nature and grace. Mary represents the human element in the Incarnation and, thus, the "natural" assent to grace. Does not a strong Marian theology, then, result in Pelagianism? Macquarrie thinks not (He supports his teaching in the final chapter "Mary and Modernity" by a fascinating commentary on Goethe's Gretchen). He notes Sander's emphasis on the importance of grace in the Judaism of the pre- and post-Christian eras, and, in good *Via Media* style, upholds a position on the nature-grace relationship close to that which McSorley in his *Luther: Right or Wrong?* suggested as Luther's, that is, that the Christian tradition has upheld, from the New Testament era to our own, a doctrine of human salvation as "resulting" fully from both God's grace and human free will. But whether the conclusions of a Roman Catholic Luther scholar and a Canon of Christ Church Cathedral, Oxford, can be made to fit a pure Protestant teaching remains an open question, a question which may perhaps only be answered after such Protestant piety risks its own nature by using the excellent liturgical models for ecumenical Marian devotions printed as the second part of the Macquarrie book.

Peter C. Erb
 Wilfrid Laurier University
 Waterloo, Ontario

The Achievement of John Henry Newman

Ian Ker

Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1990
 x + 209 pages

The year 1990 marked the centenary of the death of John Henry Newman (b.1801) whose life and work distinguished him as first among English-speaking theologians. Entering Trinity College, Oxford as a teenager, he was awarded a fellowship at Oriel following his graduation, was appointed Vicar of the University Church of St. Mary's, and stood from the beginning among the leading figures of the Oxford Movement until his eventual reception into the Roman Catholic Church in 1845.

From then until his death, he lived, for the most part, as an Oratorian priest at Birmingham continuing his theological and apologetic work. He is perhaps best remembered today, as he was in his own time, for his analysis of the nature of Christian tradition, *An Essay on the Development of Christian Doctrine* (1845, 1878), his autobiography *Apologia pro vita sua* (1864), his treatise on education, the *Idea of a University* (1873), and his philosophical study of faith and reason, the *Grammar of Assent* (1871).

Newman's writing, as Ker points out at several places, was "occasional", and because of this it is difficult for the beginner to gain a sense of the author's work and thought as a whole. Ker's volume serves as a good