

2004

Book Review Supplement Summer 2004

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholars.wlu.ca/cmh>



Part of the [Military History Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

"Book Review Supplement Summer 2004." Canadian Military History 13, 3 (2004)

This Book Review Supplement is brought to you for free and open access by Scholars Commons @ Laurier. It has been accepted for inclusion in Canadian Military History by an authorized editor of Scholars Commons @ Laurier. For more information, please contact scholarscommons@wlu.ca.

CANADIAN MILITARY HISTORY

BOOK REVIEW

SUPPLEMENT

Summer 2004



Issue 17

J.L. Granatstein, **Canada's Army: Waging War and Keeping the Peace** (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2002), \$29.95 paper, 506 pages, ISBN 0-8020-8696-9.

“The central myth in the history of Canadian arms is, and always has been, that the colonists and citizens provide their own defence.” So begins *Canada's Army*, the authoritative account by one of the nation's foremost historians. As he argues in a comprehensively researched and pungently written book, the militia myth has been the source of the army's greatest strength, and the seeds of its own demise. Time and time again over more than two centuries, Canada's citizen-soldiers have proven that they can hold their own against the best professional armies in the world. However, this very success has convinced successive generations of politicians that the peacetime army can safely be kept on a starvation diet – after all, if war comes, hasn't history proven that our citizen-soldiers can be relied upon to pull the government's chestnuts out of the fire?

Given Granatstein's reputation as an historian of the twentieth century, it is hardly surprising that the pre-1914 sections occupy only

some 50 of the more than four hundred pages of text. Still, perhaps because the subject matter is less familiar to the author, those chapters have a freshness about them which makes for particularly enjoyable reading. His discussion of the Battle of the Plains of Abraham highlights Montcalm's failure to appreciate the differences between regular soldiers and militiamen in his handling of the units under his command; later, Granatstein cuts through the militia myth of the War of 1812 to draw judicious conclusions about the effectiveness, or rather more frequently the ineffectiveness, of the Canadian militia in meeting the American threat. These conclusions may not be especially new, but Granatstein's real *forté* is distilling a mass of scholarship on these subjects into a few convincing and eminently readable pages. And through it all is that charming turn of phrase that Granatstein is so adept at. He refers, for example, to the Sedentary Militia, calling it “a wonderful phrase that perfectly captured the worth of most of the militia” (12).

The bulk of the book covers the twentieth century and here, in the time period he knows so well, Granatstein gives us a model of narrative history. The text moves

effortlessly between high-level policy matters and the situation at the sharp end; cabinet directives mingle with first-person accounts from individual soldiers, the overarching theme of the citizen-soldier providing a connecting thread. Take, for example, his account of the actions after the capture of San Leonardo, in Italy, in December 1943. We have the well known engagement that earned a Victoria Cross for Captain Paul Triquet, one of Canada's few professional soldiers from the interwar era, and then Granatstein gives us the story of one of Canada's legion of citizen-soldiers, Private Alton Kjosness of the Saskatoon Light Infantry, who was killed on 15 December 1943 when his tank ran over a mine. In a moving passage, Granatstein writes that Kjosness' mother had a vision of her son at the time he died; as the inscription for his gravestone, she chose “Alton was a poet” (237).

The book's final chapter, on the current state and future prospects of the Canadian Army, echoes what Granatstein has written in many commentaries in the national press. Successive governments have downgraded Canadian military professionalism through budget cuts, creating an army without the resources to do the tasks which are

given to it (Canadian Forces Lite, as satirist Rick Mercer so aptly puts it). The solution, he believes, is for the nation and its government to admit that military preparedness is essential and to commit the necessary resources. The average eighteenth-century *habitant* could pick up his musket to defend his farm, but a twenty-first-century farmer could not climb into a main battle tank and go right off to war. The Revolution in Military Affairs has rendered the mythic, idealized Canadian citizen-soldier obsolete, argues Granatstein, and the sooner governments realize it, the better.

Not everyone will agree with the conclusion to *Canada's Army*, but few will deny Granatstein's skill at weaving the story of the institution. In 1999, Marc Milner wrote a fine, single-volume history of Canada's navy. This book is fully up to the same high standard, meaning that the air force volume has a hard act to follow.

TV

* * * * *

Terry Copp, **Fields of Fire: The Canadians in Normandy** (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2003), \$29.95 paper, 344 pages, ISBN 0-8020-3780-1.

Without controversy there is no history, or so the saying goes, and military history buffs savour controversy more than most. Put a group of ex-soldiers and military historians together and a fight is sure to break out. Quelle surprise.

Fields of Fire, based on Copp's 1998 Joanne Goodman lectures at The University of Western Ontario, will spark many a spirited engagement. Two generations of military historians argued that the Allies stumbled to victory by virtue of their enormous materiel advantages, burying the more skillful Germans in an avalanche of men and materiel. By the mid-1980s, economic determinism was everywhere regent in the military history of the Second World War. Historian Paul Kennedy wrote in 1987 about the "consensus" among historians that the Germans were simply bet-

ter soldiers than the Allies. Such views reached their high water mark with John Ellis' *Brute Force* in 1990 and remain widely held. I cringe to think of my own contributions (some of it in *Canadian Military History*, no less) to this body of literature.

I say "cringe" because *Fields of Fire* is the latest in a series of nails in the coffin of the "brute force" thesis. Other nails have been hammered down in the past half-dozen years by Peter Mansoor, David French, and David Glantz, whose studies came to much the same conclusion about the American, British, and Soviet armies respectively that Copp arrives at about the Canadians. Copp argues that the Canadian Army in Normandy, generally described as tactically uninspired and burdened with middling leadership, in fact rapidly adapted to modern warfare, matching and often surpassing the tactical proficiency of the Germans.

Copp never argues that materiel factors were unimportant, only that in the real world of small-unit actions the margin of Allied numerical superiority on the ground was often very narrow, while tactical airpower was all sound and fury, signifying, if not nothing, then certainly very little. Armoured blitzkriegs like Operation Goodwood almost invariably met with disaster, and so it was left up to the infantry to do in 1944 what it could not in 1916.

In contrast to the layperson's perception of the Second World War as a cut and thrust of mechanized armies across Europe, Copp emphasizes that the battle of Normandy was hard-going, bloody, attritional warfare. In the end, the Allies scored what Copp calls one of the great military victories of all time, destroying two German armies and inflicting half a million casualties on the enemy, and it puzzles him how other historians have come to regard Normandy as a tactical defeat.

Copp's book moves quite effortlessly between analysis (often based on the important but underutilized Operational Research reports of

Monty's 21st Army Group) and a narrative account of the battle at the strategic, operational, and tactical levels. He has a better ear for narrative prose than most other historians these days and he ably captures the fear, confusion, and, indeed, the excitement of battle.

In a recent review of *Fields of Fire* in *Canadian Military Journal*, Donald Graves argued that Copp has failed to prove his central point, that the Canadian army fought very well in Normandy. But I would say that Copp's argument, if not always one hundred percent convincing, is nonetheless far more credible than the "brute force" thesis. I regret only that the book, being Canadian in focus, might not be widely read by Americans who sometimes need to be reminded that we were there too.

It hardly bears mentioning that this will not be the final word on the subject. If I may be permitted to paraphrase Churchill, *Fields of Fire* is not the end of debate over the Canadians in Normandy. It is not even the beginning of the end. But it might be the end of the beginning.

GB

* * * * *

Jean Boudriot and Michel Pétard, **Marine Royale XVIIe-XVIIIe siècles: Uniformes, Equipement, Armement** (Paris: privately published [available from the author at 15 avenue Paul-Doumer, 75116 Paris, France], 2003), •200.00, 280 pages, ISBN 2-903178-29-1.

It must be said at the outset that this is the most handsomely produced book seen by the reviewer in recent years. Removal of its attractive dust jacket reveals gold-tooled dark blue buckram covers stamped with the royal arms of France and the top edges of its pages are gold-leafed, a rare detail in publishing nowadays. The real treat is yet to come within this very generously illustrated 24 X 31 cm book devoted to the uniforms, accoutrements, and weapons of France's royal navy from the 1660s to 1789. Therein one finds over 100

color reproductions of portraits, details of original paintings, uniforms, badges, buttons, firearms, swords, and polearms. It should be very much stressed that the illustrations were extremely well chosen and reproduced, often as full pages, from contemporary plates and drawings in public and private collections. Thus, for example, one leafs through page after page of Vassé's peerless early eighteenth-century renderings of naval officers' and troops' uniforms which are an artistic treat on their own.

Nearly every uniform of every unit is shown by fifty-one double page color plates by Michel Pétard, many of them folding, each having several figures of officers, NCOs, drummers, and private soldiers of the unit shown. In all, some 230 figures in uniform are shown. These are a far cry from the boring computer-generated affairs one sees nowadays; every plate, every figure has its own personality shown by one of France's best military artists renowned for his exactitude in rendering. Each figure has a supporting text. Covered are the uniforms of naval officers and naval cadets, marines of the various organizations, including the galley fleet, and of naval artillerymen which existed during the reigns of Louis XIV, Louis XV, and Louis XVI. It should be stressed that the *Compagnies franches de la Marine* shown in this book are the marines serving on board warships and *not* those serving in colonial America although the uniforms, weapons, and accoutrements are closely related to the colonial troops, making this book an essential source for their study. The text consists of an account of the organization of each corps, followed by many pages quoting or summarizing regulations, clothing bills, and descriptions, most of them from the archives and many published for the first time. If one can't read French, the serious researcher should get a French-English dictionary to access this valuable documentation. All in all, this superb book is attractive in all aspects and a peer-

less reference work for decades to come.

RC

* * * * *

Audrey and Paul Grescoe, **The Book of War Letters: 100 Years of Private Canadian Correspondence** (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 2003), \$34.99, 455 pages, ISBN 1-55199-105-5.

Reading a volume like this could easily make one curse the invention of email, for so much of the personal correspondence which circulates today does so electronically, and leaves no paper trail. Had email been available during the two world wars, it is quite possible that this volume would not exist.

The Grescoes have trolled through published, archival, and private collections to assemble a powerful and effective selection of letters covering every imaginable aspect of the wars. The choices are nicely balanced – Private Orville Fleming's letter home in May 1917 urges his family to oppose conscription, while Private Edward Sargent's letter of September 1917 observes "Well you said they didn't like conscription much in Trenton but perhaps if they were just where I am just now, they would think of it a little more serious ... the few boys that are here can't live forever, and if there are no more come for reinforcements what are we to do?" (153). Through it all, we are reminded of the essential eloquence of the average soldier – in spite of (or perhaps because of) the poor spelling and lack of punctuation, these are very moving accounts of war.

Regrettably, the interjections by the editors are less satisfying, for they are riddled with factual flaws and spelling mistakes. Most of them are trifling matters that someone well versed in military history could have corrected, but they do detract from the reliability of their sections. So, skip the editorial interjections and focus on the letters, like this one which concludes the section on the First World War: "At

last, the day has come, that for so long was a mere dream and matter of jest – the day we should enter Germany. Not many of us ever imagined that we would be here, but here we are ... We travelled a long time before we saw anyone. Presently we passed a number of men of all ages working on the road. They stood back and regarded us with an indifferent curiosity. By this time the feeling of strangeness had worn off and we settled down to go on our way in a perfectly indifferent manner. No bands played" (201).

JFV

* * * * *

Briton C. Busch, ed., **Canada and the Great War: Western Front Association Papers** (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2003), \$24.95 paper, 240 pages, ISBN 0-7735-2546-X.

Founded in 1980, the Western Front Association has since developed into an international organization with dozens of branches around the globe. As part of its commitment to honour and remember those who fought in the First World War, the United States branch organizes an annual seminar on the history of the Great War. Held in Ottawa, the 2001 installment focused on Canadian participation in the war with the published results now available in *Canada and the Great War*.

The twelve chapters comprise a broad and eclectic mixture of contributors and topics. There are offerings on nation-building in Canada and Australia, John McCrae, the Halifax Explosion, Canada-US naval cooperation, Newfoundland's war, and the battle of Amiens. The coverage also extends beyond the temporal boundaries of 1914-1918 with Owen Cooke's fascinating account of Canadian airmen during the Allied intervention in Russia and Laura Brandon's article on the Canadian War Museum's recent art exhibition, *Canvas of War*. However, it is the contributions of Andrew Horrall, Tim Cook, and Patrick Brennan that stand out.

Through the lens of Charlie Chaplin's career and wartime entertainment, Horrall investigates the often conflicting messages broadcast by popular culture and the soldiers' reaction to them. Tim Cook explores the mercurial Lord Beaverbrook's role in actively shaping the image of the Canadian soldier through the publications, proclamations, and exhibitions of the Canadian War Records Office, while Patrick Brennan's essay on Brigadier General William Griesbach is a welcome study of a senior Canadian commander other than Sir Arthur Currie and superbly chronicles the Canadian Corps' transition from an amateur to a professional force.

Overall, this is a useful volume, despite its lack of a central theme to tie the work together and link it to the broader issues concerning the Canadian experience in the Great War. Currie, however, died in 1933 and did not, as stated in the foreword, hold senior posts in Canada and Britain during the Second World War.

WG

* * * * *

Tom Killebrew, **The Royal Air Force in Texas: Training British Pilots in Terrell during World War II** (Denton: University of North Texas Press [distributed in Canada by CSPI], 2003), \$26.95 US, 182 pages, ISBN 1-57441-169-1.

The British Commonwealth Air Training Plan is surely the most famous aviation training scheme of the Second World War. The training schools operated in Rhodesia come a distant second, and even less heralded is the program that trained British pilots in the United States. Even before the attack on Pearl Harbor, the first British pilots-in-training were on their way from Canada to the US, travelling in civilian clothes to circumvent American neutrality laws. By war's end, some 2200 cadets had trained at Terrell, Texas, and another 4400 at British flying schools elsewhere in the United States.

Killebrew's book is equal parts military, political, and social history. There is the story of creating a British military structure in the US, and of making it function according to standards that were acceptable to both sides. There were also the many political issues involved in establishing and administering the scheme, particularly before the United States entered the war itself. Perhaps most interesting, though, is the interaction between the young British cadets and their Texan hosts. This represented a culture shock for both sides, but perhaps more for the British, who were thrown into a very foreign environment where people spoke differently, ate differently, and thought differently. Still, the cadets were welcomed with open arms, and came to have deep affection for their temporary home. A number of them even left Britain to take up residence in Texas after the war.

Twenty British cadets died in training at Terrell, and many more were later killed while flying in operational squadrons. Of the 38 graduates of Course 3, for example, only fourteen survived the war. The No. 1 British Flying Training School Association continued to meet until October 2000, convening for the last time in Terrell, where it had all begun over sixty years earlier. They will find in this book a very fitting tribute to the cooperative spirit that made this training experiment work so well.

CA

* * * * *

Shelby Scates, **War and Politics by Other Means: A Journalist's Memoir** (Seattle: University of Washington Press [distributed in Canada by UBC Press], 2000), \$37.95, 213 pages, ISBN 0-295-98009-5.

Shelby Scates has written a memoir about his thirty-five-year career as a journalist for such reputable news organizations as the Associated Press and the *Seattle Post-Intelligencer*. Whether covering southern race riots, dodging Syrian artillery fire, or climbing

K2, Scates shares his tales of impeccable timing, sheer good fortune, and zest for getting the scoop. The spectrum of topics, however, is a bit ambitious for such a short book, leaving this reviewer feeling as though the title promised more than the book delivered.

The chapters can be clustered into three sections: his formative years, domestic politics, and foreign wars. From his rural Tennessee roots, Scates bounced around early Cold War America dabbling in a number of jobs that ranged from merchant mariner to US Army officer, until finding his niche in journalism. Some of his early assignments brought him face to face with the politics of racial integration. In Little Rock, where cowardly white mobs protested school desegregation, Scates was appalled by the racism then turning the city into a symbol of that national disgrace. It was an equally uncomfortable topic for Senator John F. Kennedy, whom Scates interviewed off the record during a pre-election swing through the South. The future president is just one of the famous names that spice the narrative; others include Jack Ruby and Earl Long.

By the late 1960s, Scates' assignments began to mix politics with wars. Lyndon Johnson's demise in the wake of the Vietnam War is explored along with the 1968 presidential election. When tension mounted in the Middle East, Scates was in Israel getting the story from front-line outposts. In 1984, Scates traveled to south-east Asia to cover Vietnam's war with Cambodia. Often overlooked, the author's jungle patrols remind readers that the region remained a war zone long after Vietnam's reunification.

Disappointingly, the book seems rushed on several levels. It is poorly served by the lack of an introduction, weak historical context, and a style that favours anecdotes over reflection. When compared to memoirs by journalistic greats such as Arthur Krock and James Reston, this book adds little to our understanding of the events that shaped the Cold War era. Still, readers interested in the

trials of combat journalism will find parts of this memoir enjoyable.

BC

* * * * *

Emily S. Rosenberg, **A Date Which Will Live: Pearl Harbor in American Memory** (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003), \$24.95 US, 248 pages, ISBN 0-8223-3206-X.

Pearl Harbor and the “date which will live in infamy” now occupy positions as bona fide American icons. But as Emily Rosenberg demonstrates in this fascinating work of cultural history, it was not always so. After 1945, interest in the Pearl Harbor attack was strong but sporadic, peaked by things like the publication of Walter Lord’s best-seller *Day of Infamy* in 1957. Even the *Arizona* Memorial in Pearl Harbor itself was little more than a minor tourist attraction in the first two decades of its existence.

But beginning in the 1990s, interest in Pearl Harbor began to snowball. The growing appeal of witness history, sparked by Studs Terkel’s *The Good War* and Tom Brokaw’s *The Greatest Generation*, the ceremonies to mark the fiftieth anniversary of the attack, the continuing politicization of history as various sides argued over who should shoulder responsibility for the fact that America was apparently caught sleeping (was FDR behind it, or was it simply the failure of Kimmel and Short, the senior naval and army commanders in theatre?), and finally the publicity surrounding the premiere of the blockbuster *Pearl Harbor* in 2001 all raised the profile of the immense immeasurably. The fact that it was immediately linked to the 9/11 attacks (George W. Bush referred to the attacks as “the Pearl Harbor of the 21st Century”) brought the sixty-year-old event firmly into the present.

Rosenberg’s analysis ranges over an impressive variety of subjects: monuments and other commemorative elements; film and best-sellers; historiographical debates; the politics of the veteran movement; political rhetoric; even

the internet as a site in which social memory is negotiated. She has brought in all the most important theoretical elements, but never lets them overwhelm the narrative – this is a book which is as enjoyable as it is informative.

The list of books which examine the iconic status of battles is growing (see, for example, Malcolm Smith’s *Britain and 1940: History, Myth, and Popular Memory*) – *A Date Which Will Live* is fully up to the standard.

JFV

* * * * *

David W. Edgecombe, **Defending the Dominion: Canadian Military Rifles, 1855-1955** (Ottawa: Service Publications, 2003), \$59.95, 168 pages, ISBN 1-894581-15-6.

There can be no doubt that this is one of the most important studies as yet published on the types of longarms carried by Canadian volunteer militiamen and regular soldiers for a century from 1855. That year, important legislation was passed which organized the volunteer militia and also provided for the importation of thousands of Enfield rifles to arm Canadian volunteer units. The author’s peerless research in the National Archives of Canada tracks pertinent data down to serial numbers and unit markings in his first chapter and for every other of the book’s eight chapters, which ends with the FN C1 rifle. This is supported by fourteen appendices featuring excellent supporting data. The text is illustrated by over eighty photos, mostly of the various types of rifles and their markings.

While the majority of the longarms in Canadian service were British, American readers might be surprised to learn that, especially in the late 1860s, thousands of rifles were imported from the United States, notably Spencer and Peabody breech-loading rifles, because of a shortage of modern arms. These were later joined by a few thousand Winchester and Garrand rifles. Because it is so well documented and pleasingly pre-

sented, this book is recommended by the Company of Military Historians in the United States as “a standard reference in North American Military History.”

RC

* * * * *

Roger Sarty and Doug Knight, **Saint John Fortifications, 1630-1956** (Fredericton: Goose Lane Editions / The New Brunswick Military History Project, 2003), \$14.95 paper, 112 pages, ISBN 0-86492-373-2.

This is local history at its best, because it is much more than local history. Sarty and Knight relate the story of the defences of one Canadian city, but the experience of Saint John provides something of a microcosm in which one can view the defences of Canada as a whole.

The story begins with the construction of Fort La Tour in 1632, a wooden palisade that had the misfortune to be attacked five times and captured thrice during its brief, twenty-two-year life. A succession of similar forts followed until Fort Howe (1777) upped the ante by attempting defend a much larger area (the inner harbour and trading post). From then, the defences of Saint John grew incrementally until the Second World War, when the most powerful and complex fortress ever built in New Brunswick came into being. But it was dismantled just as quickly after 1945 – in 1956, the militia coast artillery unit at Saint John was disbanded and fortress Saint John passed into history.

As Sarty and Knight remind us, the traces of Saint John’s military past remain in the remnants of the fortifications – through these, it is possible to see the impact of centuries of war on the Canadian landscape.

KS

* * * * *

J.L. Granatstein, **Who Killed the Canadian Military?** (Toronto: HarperCollins, 2004), \$24.95 paper, 249 pages, ISBN 0-0020-0675-8.

Jack Granatstein has made himself an integral part of Canadian

historiography by authoring over forty books, and weighing into debates on Canadian policies regularly during more than thirty years of service in academia and the public sector. He brings these assets to bear in *Who Killed the Canadian Military?*, yielding a highly readable and cleverly argued monograph. Granatstein's book cites few sources specifically, but points to his early days as an army lieutenant and years as a historian and expert in Canadian military affairs as the foundation for his analysis.

The answer to the question *Who Killed the Canadian Military?* is given in six chapters, with a seventh to show how it can be resuscitated. Granatstein points to a string of politicians as the culprits who dismantled the military, using Canadian history as a backdrop and weaving in strains of our perceived national identity (or, negative identity – to be Canadian is to be “not American”) and popular social/political movements (anti-Americanism and an obsession with the illusion of peacekeeping, as two examples). Granatstein argues that this combination has resulted in a dangerous mentality that has put Canada in the tenuous position it currently holds – its forces are overextended, its identity is practically non-existent, it lacks the policy to enforce its sovereignty, and it has brutalized its relations with the global hegemon located on its doorstep. Responsible for this state of affairs were the politicians who helped deliver the Canadian Forces its mortal wounds: Lester Pearson, John Diefenbaker, Paul Hellyer, Pierre Trudeau, Brian Mulroney, and Jean Chrétien. Lest we, the voting public, be spared our deserved culpability in electing and supporting these men, the illustration on the cover and the accusation on page 202 make perfectly clear that we have all had a hand in killing the Canadian military. And weighing Granatstein's political, historical, economic, and social arguments makes this hard to deny.

In many ways, *Who Killed the Canadian Military?* builds on

Granatstein's earlier work, *Who Killed Canadian History?*, again pointing to the Canadian weakness in defining a national identity as having significant ramifications. Granatstein shows that Canadians want to see themselves as peacekeepers, when that very notion had limited effectiveness and is downright impossible in the current global climate. Moreover, with its mandate, budget, and kit, the Canadian military is not suited for efficient action in today's hot spots. Furthermore, the author illustrates the hopeless fantasy of many Canadians in believing that our military is irrelevant, for the United States for its own sake will always rally to our protection. A history of anti-Americanism and bridge-burnings, from a prime minister criticizing Vietnam on American soil to opting out of the Iraq affair of 2003, has soured relations with our most important ally, and left the country in a position where values outran reason. The Canadian Forces are stretched so thin, *Who Killed the Canadian Military?* shows unarguably, that they would be hard-pressed to answer national, let alone international, crises. The combination of these factors leads to a dire picture indeed.

However, Granatstein carefully outlines a plan of action in his conclusion, providing an optimistic and feasible solution to this dilemma, provided voters choose to support a decade-long plan that would cost tens of billions of dollars. The keys lie in defining our national interests, including looking out for our safety, sovereignty, and prosperity, and building up a military that can do three things: defend Canada in cooperation with the US; protect domestic order and assist in disasters; and work with coalitions and alliances in international peace-making efforts. This is a problem and solution that should be considered by all conscientious Canadians. The second *Who Killed?* book steps in to provide an urgency the first could not; while losing our sense of selves and our history is lamentable, failing to rise to

Granatstein's challenge in *Who Killed the Canadian Military?* has far more dire consequences. Few would argue in the post-9/11 world that security is not a critical issue. Jack Granatstein has eloquently described Canada's lack of preparedness and role in the world, and offered a solution that any literate Canadian could easily digest – and should digest, in the interests of keeping Canada strong and free.

SC

* * * * *

John C. Fredricksen, **Green Coats and Glory: The United States Regiment of Riflemen, 1808-1821** (Youngstown, NY: Old Fort Niagara Association, 2000), \$12.95 US paper, 80 pages, ISBN 0-941967-22-0.

The text of this book originally appeared in the *Military Collector & Historian*, spring and summer 1998 issues of its Volume 50. Its excellence earned it the Harold L. Peterson Award – unfortunately mistakenly given as ‘William L. Peterson’ on the book's cover. Re-issued as an attractive small book, several illustrations including four color plates are added to this publication. The color front cover is H. Charles McBarron Jr.'s plate of the Regiment of Riflemen in 1812, and the color back cover is from his American Soldier plate showing an officer and men of the regiment in 1814. The inside front cover shows the 1812 uniform again and the inside back cover shows a rifleman wearing a rifle frock in 1812, both plates by Alan Archambault. The appendices reproduce the text by H. Charles McBarron Jr. and John R. Elting that accompanied the plate of the regiment in 1812 when reproduced in *Military Uniforms in America, Volume II, Years of Growth 1796-1851* (San Rafael, 1977). Curiously, the data on the 1814-1821 period uniforms is sparse and, it must be noted, slightly erroneous as the black braiding should be on the chest of the officer of McBarron's 1814 plate reproduced on the back

cover. Besides the color plates, the generously footnoted text is enhanced by 20 illustrations in black and white that mostly show portraits of officers to round out this fine regimental history of the US Rifle Regiment.

RC

* * * * *

Geoffrey Wellum, **First Light** (London: Penguin, 2002), \$19.00 paper, 338 pages, ISBN 0-141-00814-8.

Sixty years after the fact, one would not expect to see a brand new memoir of the Battle of Britain. And if one did, one might expect a cookie-cutter, vanity press memoir which is over-burdened with details of the author's sexual conquests. So, it came as a very pleasant surprise to discover that *First Light* is as good a fighter pilot memoir as you'll get, right up there with Richard Hillary's *The Last Enemy* and Johnnie Johnson's *Wing Leader*.

Geoffrey Wellum was terribly young – just seventeen – when he left school to join the Royal Air Force. Before long, he was thrown into the Battle of Britain with 92 Squadron, and he couldn't have found himself in a better unit with more illustrious comrades. The narrative follows Wellum through training and into battle, and we see his gradual transformation from a wet-behind-the-ears teenager, the youngest pilot on the squadron, to a battle-hardened veteran and one of the squadron's most senior pilots. If the Battle of Britain aged Wellum, so too did the fighter sweeps he flew over the continent in 1941, and the process was completed by a tour of duty over Malta. Then, having put his mind and body through enough psychological and physical strain to last a lifetime, Wellum was sent back to England for a change of duty, eventually as a test pilot with the Gloster Aircraft Company ... but that might be the subject of another volume.

Readers looking for a memoir that is long on specifics may be disappointed. Dates are not especially

relevant to Wellum's story, and one often has only the vaguest sense of when events occurred. The emphasis instead on what it was like to be a fighter pilot – the pressure of trying to make it through the training process, the desire to be accepted by more senior squadron mates, the first brushes with the enemy, the exhaustion of going up against that enemy day in, day out, and the growing realization that one's body and mind was no longer up to the task. And running beneath it all is Wellum's enduring romance with flight, a sub-theme that elevates a fine memoir up with the very best of the genre.

JFV

* * * * *

Lawrence Cane, **Fighting Fascism in Europe: The World War II Letters of an American Veteran of the Spanish Civil War** (New York: Fordham University Press, 2003), \$29.95 US, 268 pages, ISBN 0-8232-2251-9.

Before the Second World War even began, Lawrence Cane had seen a good deal of combat, with the Mackenzie-Papineau Battalion in the Spanish Civil War. That experience stood him in good stead during training, when he was often called upon to lecture on battlefield tactics or weaponry to his fellow trainees. However, the experience didn't help him get to the front any faster. Instead, he was stuck in what he thought were a series of dead-end jobs (one of the appendices is his request for transfer to a combat role) until he finally got overseas in early 1944. He was the only American veteran of the Spanish Civil War to go ashore with the first wave at Utah Beach on D-Day (as an officer with the 238th Engineer Combat Battalion), and served through the rest of the campaign in north-west Europe.

Cane comes across as a keen observer and an articulate commentator. But more than that, one is always aware of his politics. The same commitment that took him to Spain is never absent from his let-

ters (his wife was also a fervent Communist) – injustice troubles him, whether committed by his own side (he has much to say about the racist policies directed against African-American soldiers) or by the enemy, and he never loses sight of the fact that he is fighting for a more equal, equitable world. His letters are revealing and moving – one hopes that his correspondence from Spain might be published one day.

KS

* * * * *

Dianne Marshall, **Georges Island: The Keep of Halifax Harbour** (Halifax: Numbus, 2003), \$29.95 paper, 191 pages, ISBN 1-55109-457-4.

Georges Island lies in the mouth of Halifax Harbour. Retreating glaciers formed the drumlin that became one of the keys to the defense of Halifax. Like many similar locations, the island had been used by humans in a variety of ways. Originally known from its oval shape as Ile Raquette (Snowshoe Island), Georges Island served as a place to dry fish before the arrival of the Duc d'Anville with his battered fleet in 1746. With the coming of the British settlers under Edward Cornwallis in 1749, the island – named for the British king – took on strategic importance during the English-French wars. Fortified with earthworks and seven 32-pounder cannon, it became the Keep of Halifax Harbour.

The newcomers built larger fortifications and barracks, and the island became home to the "redemptioners" – Foreign Protestants who arrived in 1750-52. Between 1755 and 1764 Georges Island served as a detention centre for the Acadians en route to their exile. When war broke out between France and Britain in 1793, Prince Edward, son of George III, came to Halifax as commandant. He built Fort Charlotte on the island, but it fell into neglect after hostilities ended. Rising tensions in mid-century Britain and the United States led to its rebuilding. To prevent

ironclads from entering Halifax harbour and shelling the town, Georges Island later became the site of a Submarine Mining Establishment. During the First World War, several contingents of the Canadian Garrison Artillery occupied renovated and newly-built barracks. In the Second World War, only a single Bofors anti-aircraft gun defended Georges Island.

Dianne Marshall has done an excellent job of telling the story of Georges Island in this beautifully illustrated book. The second half of the book, however, consists of a series of chapters strung together with no connecting links, and in some cases duplicating what has already been covered: His Majesty's Gaol, the Harbour Light, the Restoration, the island's snakes, the quarantine station, the Halifax Explosion, and even the tunnels under the downtown of Halifax, one of which, falsely, was alleged to run to Georges Island. The restoration of Fort Charlotte, begun in 1992, is covered in five pages; it merits broader discussion.

Georges Island is a valuable record of a fortress that once played a key role in Canadian military history and has now become a part of our heritage.

JL

* * * * *

Joan MacDonald, ***Our Mornings May Never Be: Memoirs of a WAAF Sergeant ... and Beyond*** (Burnstown, ON: General Store Publishing House, 2003) \$19.95 paper, 132 pages, ISBN 1-894263-73-1.

Joan MacDonald writes an accessible, emotionally charged account of her experiences as a young woman in the Royal Air Force during the Second World War and reminds us that even today the war remains a central part of veterans' lives. The coming of the war altered MacDonald's life forever, as it must have done to many others like her. Assisting in the British war effort as a volunteer nurse's aid brought her into contact with various casualties and inspired MacDonald to

do more to help her country. She left nursing to join the Women's Auxiliary Air Force, where she met her Canadian husband-to-be and became a Canadian war-bride. Her tale goes beyond the war years and demonstrates how her squadron's motto, "Resolve," and her unforgettable wartime experiences remained with the couple as a source of strength to help them through life.

MacDonald does not provide a lot of detail about the daily routines of life in the WAAF, although she includes enough information to provide a good context for the experiences that she does describe. What makes this book important is its honest discussion of emotions and reactions to the world of war and beyond. MacDonald fearlessly discusses the high death rate of air crew and the implications of the death rate for those who survived and continued to fight. The knowledge that each night could be their last created intense ups and downs as dances, tea, and dates were savoured and love was felt with urgency. She recounts nervously waiting for the return of "Mac," fearing that each mission would be his last, and the ways in which she dealt with her fears and tried to push them aside, all culminating in the joy of knowing that they survived the war.

But the end of war brought more hardship as the couple was separated for almost a year while MacDonald and her newborn son, John, waited for passage to Canada, on the ships reserved for war brides, to join her husband. Once they were reunited, the MacDonalds lived a happy life together; but they never forgot their wartime experiences. The influence of the war on their lives is seen in trivial things, like silver icicles for the Christmas tree that bring memories flooding back, and in important events such as the reunions of 76 Squadron in which the family took great joy. Former wartime friends make up a large part of the MacDonalds' post-war lives.

Our Mornings May Never Be recounts "happiness and terror, laughter and tragedy" and is "a nostalgic combination of reflections

about life and love" written with astonishing honesty and emotion that allows the reader to feel the war and understand why to this day it remains such a vital part of the memories of veterans to this day.

HM

* * * * *

John C. Fredriksen, ***America's Military Adversaries from Colonial Times to the Present*** (Denver, CO: ABC-Clío, 2001), \$85.00 US, 620 pages, ISBN 1-57607-603-2.

In 1999, Fredriksen wrote a two-volume reference set entitled *America's Military Leaders*, with the aim of educating the general reader about the country's military past. This book is a companion volume to that earlier set, and tries to give readers a starting point from which to learn more about the military leaders who have faced American soldiers, sailors, and aviators over the past few centuries. Given our nations' collective past, Canada is well represented, with entries on Isaac Brock, William Hamilton Merritt, John Harvey, Tecumseh, Joseph Brant, the de Vaudreuil, and a handful of other English, French, and native soldiers who fought American troops in the pre-Confederation period (the Fenian Raids do not, however, merit a mention). There are also some unusual characters included, like the Baroness von Riedesel, whose husband was one of the Hessian generals of the American Revolution and whom Fredriksen regards as "exemplary as a soldier's wife" (429). The entries are carefully and judiciously written, with extensive bibliographical notes and cross-referencing. There are also cross-listings by conflict and occupation (ie. German soldier, British sailor). It all makes for an extremely user-friendly volume.

The reader will immediately note, however, that a revised edition is already necessary. Missing from this volume are more recent entries, like Al-Qaeda and Osama bin Laden.

TV

* * * * *

Richard Rohmer, **Raleigh on the Rocks: The Canada Shipwreck of HMS Raleigh** (St. John's: Creative Publishing, 2003), \$19.95 paper, 212 pages, ISBN 1-894294-46-7.

On 8 August 1922, at 1539 hours, a new British cruiser hit the shore at Amour Point, near Forteau in Labrador. A midshipman described the grounding as: "Bump. Crash. Bump." Commissioned on 23 July 1921, HMS *Raleigh* displaced 9,750 tons and carried a crew of 750. On passage through the Strait of Belle Isle, the vessel ran into fog. Commander Bott, the Navigating Officer, made an error and his ship struck the rocks. Ten sailors drowned as the crew struggled to shore. Attempts to salvage the warship failed; it was decommissioned then blown up in 1926. A large quantity of ammunition remained in the hulk. A ten-year-old local lad died when he threw a shell into a fire. The locals scavenged everything useful from the wreck. In recent years, members of the Fleet Diving Unit (Atlantic) have removed most of the ordnance. A live, fused 7.5" shell was recovered from a local museum.

The author, a former RCAF pilot and Chief of Reserves, has compiled a valuable record of a little-known episode in naval history. He describes how he became interested in the ship. HMS *Raleigh* cruised around North America, showing the flag, before its untimely end. Rohmer tells much of the story through original documents, including those relating to the courts martial of Commander Bott and Captain Arthur Bromley, who was not on the bridge when his ship hit the shore. Both were "dismissed from His Majesty's Ship *Victory*" and reprimanded. Unfortunately, the author does not say what happened to these two officers after their courts martial.

Part of the fascination of this book lies in looking over the official records, and speculating how the matter would have been handled today. The courts martial records

are short, terse, and to the point. Some interesting information emerges from casual observations in a report from SNC*Lavalin, which organized a public meeting in November 2000 on Operation Raleigh, the Canadian recovery of the ordnance from the wreck. In 1932, the SS *Sandbeach* "salvaged the HMS *Raleigh* "and apparently exploded on its way to New York." Local folklore claims that the lighthouse keeper was not at the lighthouse when *Raleigh* ran aground "and that is why the fog signal was not heard." The people who emerge with credit from this British disaster are the local residents who looked after the shipwrecked sailors, the Rangers who worked with the Fleet Diving Unit, and the Canadian divers from that body who continue to clean up the dangerous mess in a tough environment.

JL

* * * * *

John Keegan, **Intelligence in War: Knowledge of the Enemy from Napoleon to Al-Qaeda** (Toronto: Key Porter, 2003), \$49.95, 443 pages, ISBN 1-55263-219-9.

Sir John Keegan's latest contribution to the annals of military history is *Intelligence in War*, a collection of case studies from Nelson's age of sail to contemporary times. It asks the question "how useful is intelligence in war?" and answers it succinctly: regardless how good the intelligence is, it "does not point out unerringly the path to victory" (1, 5). All of this can be gleaned in the book's first five pages, though the question and answer are often hard to locate in the next 394 pages.

Intelligence in War begins in the acknowledgments with Keegan's anecdotal trip down memory lane as he discusses how he flirted with real intelligence work throughout his career, then continues in the introduction by discussing fictional spy literature. It is obvious that Sir John had fun writing this book, and in turn it is often fun to read. However, the pleasure is best left to generalists and interested lay people,

because spotty footnoting will frustrate academics. Even worse is that Keegan relies solely on secondary works, and from his "select" bibliography, it is sometimes hard to tell which works were consulted.

Another problem for more specialist readers is the confusing organization. *Intelligence in War*'s introduction suggests case studies will follow, but the chapters reveal a more chaotic and inclusive structure. Chapter titles like "Chasing Napoleon" do not fall into the same category as "Wireless Intelligence" or "Crete: Foreknowledge no Help?"; within these often misnamed chapters, Keegan jumps around topics, themes, and time periods, adding to the confusion. Perhaps interspersing thematic chapters with case studies might have been a clearer way of giving order to this wealth of information, which is substantial for general consumption.

What Keegan does, he does fairly well, although his subtitle, "Knowledge of the Enemy from Napoleon to Al-Qaeda", might have more to do with marketability than prefacing the book he actually wrote. His chapter on Nelson's pursuit of Napoleon is artfully narrated, and his explanation of the science behind encryption and decryption is riveting, but it is hard not to feel somehow disappointed by what does not appear here, instead of excited by what does. In fact, Al-Qaeda is given roughly two pages of direct treatment, and the Cold War is somehow passed over entirely – after two Second World War case studies, Keegan moves on to the Falklands war of 1982, briefly skimming the War on Terrorism and the Second Gulf War, with only a passing mention of the nearly half-century standoff between the Soviets and the Americans. If the War on Terror is deemed war-like enough to warrant a mention, why not devote one case to the Cold War? Instead, intelligence since 1945 is lumped into the epilogue, which inexplicably appears before the conclusion. Rather than adding a new dimension with an examina-

tion of intelligence in the hyper-technological world, it just highlights the lack of attention paid to the generations between V2 rockets and the Internet world.

Unfortunately, Keegan's book offers nothing new for intelligence buffs, and is so desperately crying out for filtering to organize its content properly that it fails to constitute a solid collected work. It relies on counterfactual statements to provide shock and depth, but any amateur or professional historian recognizes the danger in such speculations. Still, the maps are very helpful and the stories are entertaining; for Keegan devotees, *Intelligence in War* will provide another satisfying read.

SC

* * * * *

Veronica Cusack, **The Invisible Soldier: Captain W.A.P. Durie, His Life and Afterlife** (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 2004), \$34.99, 256 pages, ISBN 1-55199-094-6.

When I wrote about the strange case of Captain William A. Durie in 1997, I got the ending wrong. Norm Christie set the record straight with his fine study of the Canadians at Passchendaele in the *For King and Empire* series. And now Veronica Cusack, in a book that builds upon a *Toronto Life* article from 2001, has fleshed out the story.

The bare bones of the case (so to speak) involve Captain Durie of Toronto, who was killed in action in December 1917 while serving with the 58th Battalion. His grieving mother Anna decided that the policies of the Imperial War Graves Commission, which decreed that Durie's body must remain in France, were unfair and unjust, and determined to bring his body home. After a first abortive attempt and a bitter campaign waged against Commission officials in England and France, she finally succeeded in hiring local labour to remove her son's bones (or most of them, at any rate) from Loos-en-Gohelle Cemetery and carry them back to To-

ronto for burial at St. James' Cemetery.

As a reader, I found that Cusack tells a compelling story. She is a wonderful writer, with a real gift for sketching vivid characters. But for that very reason, the historian in me found the book a little frustrating. Cusack located the Durie family correspondence in the City of Toronto Archives and reproduced some of the letters in full, but it is never made clear which elements of the narrative are based on the documentary record and which are inferred by the author. To cite just one example, did Anna Durie really come to regret her actions, and admit to herself that she was wrong to have disturbed her son's remains, particularly in such tawdry circumstances?

This is more than just academic pedantry, because as Cusack relates the story, neither William nor Anna Durie emerge as especially likeable people, and one wonders if those impressions are fair. Captain Durie seems to have been an insufferable prig who was teased by his fellow officers and whose one saving grace was that he at least had the wisdom to realize that he lacked the intestinal fortitude to command men in the trenches. His mother comes across as a pathetic figure who took mourning far beyond any comprehensible response; obsessed with her declining social station, she felt that someone of her class deserved better treatment at the hands of a government agency. Indeed, the only likeable member of the family is the sister, Helen Durie, a strong and sensible woman who nevertheless had to watch helplessly as her mother frittered away what little money the family had to bring back a few bones and scraps of uniform. One imagines that Helen would have performed rather better in the trenches than her brother did. Perhaps those are unfair conclusions to draw, but it's difficult to do otherwise without knowing where the evidence stops and the author's inferences begin.

In sum, *The Invisible Soldier* makes for fascinating reading, but

is also a book that would benefit from a few reference notes.

JFV

* * * * *

Bryan D. Cummins, **Colonel Richardson's Airedales: The Making of the British War Dog School, 1900 - 1918** (Calgary: Detselig, 2003), \$31.95 paper, 209 pages, ISBN 1-55059-248-3.

While sorting through some old lantern slides from the First World War a number of years ago, I came across one showing a dog with a Red Cross banner draped over it that was pulling what looked to be a kind of stretcher on wheels. The slide (which I thought was some sort of odd joke) was brought back to me when reading Cummins' book, which shows that dogs were indeed trained to play key roles on the battlefield.

Edwin Richardson emerged as the acknowledged expert in training dogs for military purposes (he also trained animals for police work), although the British Army, and individual field commanders who were sent dogs, were slow to recognize their utility. However, the dogs soon proved that, properly trained, they could be immensely useful, especially in two roles. In the first place, they could serve with human sentries, for their senses of hearing and smell were much keener than the human, and they were able to detect unusual sounds and scents in No Man's Land much sooner than their human handlers could. Properly used, then, they could give a few precious minutes' extra warning that a trench raid was coming over from the enemy side of the lines. Secondly, they also proved invaluable at carrying messages. Once they were trained to ignore bomb bursts (this involved a process of sound desensitization) and got used to the conditions at the front, they could travel much more quickly than a human messenger (one unit reported that its best dog had once covered about a mile in around seven minutes, a speed most battalion runners could never hope to approach). This speed

was obviously useful in getting messages to their destination faster, but it also made them less vulnerable to enemy fire, so it was more likely that the messages would get through at all.

Richardson never received the credit he deserved during or after the war. His training school graduated as many as 340 dogs per month, many of them received from the general public in response to appeals to people to donate their dogs for war work (given the impact of the submarine blockade on the food supply, thousands of people made the difficult decision to give up the family pet for a combination of practical and patriotic reasons). So don't be put off by what, frankly, looks at first glance like a rather odd book – this really is a fascinating story.

CA

Peter Pigott, **Wing Walkers: The Rise and Fall of Canada's Other Airline**, revised edition (Madeira Park, BC: Harbour Publishing, 2003), \$26.95 paper, 440 pages, ISBN 1-55017-292-1.

Peter Pigott is rapidly become one of Canada's most prolific aviation historians, and this updated version of the history Canadian Airways Limited / Canadian Pacific Airlines / Canadian Airlines International (and all its affiliates), first published in 1998, cements that reputation. Readers of *CMH* will be particularly interested in a number of elements of the story Pigott tells.

As part of the British Commonwealth Air Training Plan, the airline or its affiliates operated seven Air Observer Schools across Canada: Toronto Island, Edmonton, Regina, Winnipeg, Portage La Prairie, Ancienne Lorette, and St. John's, Quebec. Quebec Airways, which would later become part of CP Airlines, also operated #11 Elementary Flying Training School at Cap de la Madeleine, Quebec, with aircraft overhauls being done at the airline's St. Maurice Aircraft Repair facility. The airline was involved in

the operations of the Atlantic Ferry Organization, helped lay the groundwork for the Northwest Staging Route, which would eventually be used to supply American aircraft to the Russian air force, and flew supply operations for the construction and maintenance of the CANOL pipeline which brought oil from Norman Wells on the Mackenzie River for refining. One other little-known and sensitive task was carrying the raw material from Uranium City, Saskatchewan, to be used in the making of the first atomic bomb. During the Korean War, CP Airlines realized another windfall when it won a contract to transport American soldiers from Tacoma, Washington, to Tokyo. The contract lasted a little less than five years, during which time the airline flew 40,000 US military personnel, making a handsome profit in the process.

The airline's work with the military represents only a small part of its history, but an interesting one nonetheless. Its civilians operations make up the bulk of the book, and here too Pigott bolsters his claim to be one of Canada's best aviation writers. The new version of *Wing Walkers* is every bit as good as his recent history of Canada's other airline, Trans-Canada Air Lines / Air Canada.

DR

Colin K. Duquemin, **Niagara Rebels: The Niagara Frontier in the Upper Canadian Rebellion, 1837-38** (St. Catharines, ON: privately published [available from the author at 56 Highland Ave., St. Catharines, ON, L2R 4J1]), 2002), \$21.95 paper, 299 pages, ISBN 0-9698994-4-0.

The Niagara Peninsula saw some of the fiercest (in a purely relative sense) fighting during the rebellion of 1837-38 in Upper Canada: the attack on the steamship *Caroline*, which had been leased by the rebels and which a party under Allan MacNab captured and sent over Niagara Falls in flames; the bombardment of the rebel

stronghold on Navy Island (during which apparently hundreds of artillery rounds were fired, causing just a single casualty); the invasion of the Niagara peninsula by the Patriot Army; and the Battle of Short Hills in June 1838, when the rebels attacked a small party of the Queen's Lancers stationed just north of the site of present-day city of Fonthill. The rebels captured the Lancers, but their success was short-lived; within days, militia reinforcements had beaten the bushes and taken most of the Patriot Army into custody.

The second half of Duquemin's story details the trials of the rebels and their eventual transportation (only one of the rebels, James Morreau, was executed) to the penal colony of Van Dieman's Land (Australia). Here, as in the earlier portions of the book, he relies heavily on the primary documents, often reproducing at length trial transcripts, letters, and diary entries as a way to tell the story. This technique gives the story a nice sense of immediacy and authenticity; it is especially interesting, for example, to read what convicted rebel Benjamin Wait thought of his transportation to the other side of the world. Finally, Duquemin has found plenty of contemporary illustrations and graphics to enliven the tale.

CA

H.P. Willmott, **The War with Japan: The Period of Balance, May 1942 – October 1943** (Wilmington, DE: SR Books, 2002), \$17.95 US paper, 180 pages, ISBN 0-8420-5033-7.

Willmott's book is the first in Scholarly Resources' new series Total War: New Perspectives on World War II, which aims to provide brief, accessible, and affordable books that synthesize the best of recent scholarship on the war. For the inaugural volume, the publisher has chosen to cover the early period of the war in the Pacific, when American and Japanese forces, generally evenly matched, fought a series of fierce battles that,

more than anything else, wore both sides out. Using a nice metaphor, Willmott likens the strategic advantage to a gun lying in the street – it was there for either side to pick up and use.

He begins with the Coral Sea (May 1942) and Midway (June 1942), then turns to the fighting in eastern New Guinea and the Lower Solomons, which he believes represents the turning point in the Pacific war. The long and brutal fight for Guadalcanal was essentially a draw, but its very duration gave the US Navy the time to bring into service the large warships which would eventually swing the balance in the Far East.

The book's synthesis is capable and coherent, but Willmott makes his strongest points in the conclusion, with a version of the now famous "brute force" thesis. Whatever advantages they might have enjoyed, it was American industrial productivity that was the real key to victory. In 1943, the American manufacture of destroyers was ten times greater than Japan's, and Japan could only keep this pace by limiting the construction of merchant ships. The situation was the same in aircraft. Japan produced too many variants (ninety types against eighteen American) and not enough machines in total. American factories manufactured more than twice the number of front-line fighter aircraft (Zekes vs. Hellcats and Corsairs). Japan never did produce an effective long-range heavy bomber to match the B-24 or B-29, which the US manufactured in enormous numbers. In March 1944, American factories were turning out one aircraft every 294 seconds.

This, then, is the point at which Willmott concludes his excellent survey: with Japan slowly beginning to realize that it had started a war with a nation whose industrial might it could not hope to match.

CA

* * * * *

Michel Litalien, **Dans le tourmente: Deux hôpitaux militaires canadiens-français dans la France en guerre (1915-1919)** (Outremont: Athéna Éditions, 2003), \$19.95 paper, 160 pages, ISBN 2-922865-20-7.

It has been decades since the publication of a chronicle of one of Canada's First World War hospitals. A.M.J. Hyatt's history of #10 Stationary Hospital will soon be available, but in the meantime we have Litalien's fine account of the French-Canadian hospital units which served overseas.

There were two: #4 Canadian Stationary Hospital (later #8 Canadian General Hospital) was authorized in March 1915 and left for Europe in May, while #6 Canadian General Hospital (Laval University) arrived in England in April 1916. In addition to sketching the administrative histories of these units, Litalien provides social histories as well, examining the personnel who served (using impressing statistical analysis which takes into account military experience, place of birth, age at enlistment, and marital status), and training and discipline issues in the hospitals. The first generation of hospital histories tended to be immense volumes packed with arcane details. Litalien's, in contrast, is a model of conciseness. Having said that, however, the many appendices are very useful, giving biographies of commanding officers, nominal rolls, and lists of decorations.

These were not the busiest hospitals. Figures for #4 are not available but #6 treated nearly 18,000 patients with its 1400 beds – McGill's hospital unit, in contrast, treated some 134,000. In terms of the number of patients, #8 was on par with the hospitals operated by the University of Toronto, the University of Western Ontario, and with #1 and #1 Canadian Stationary Hospitals, the first to go to France. However, both units are all but forgotten in Canada – a single plaque

commemorates Laval's hospital, but there is no memorial to #4. This, as Litalien rightfully points out, is the ultimate irony. The French-Canadian medical effort in the First World War is better known in the Paris suburb of Joinville, where commemorative ceremonies were held in 1991 and 2000 to mark the presence of a Quebec hospital there during the Great War, than it is in Canada.

BL

* * * * *

Gavin K. Watt, **Rebellion in the Mohawk Valley: The St. Leger Expedition of 1777** (Toronto: Dundurn Group, 2002), \$28.99 paper, 429 pages, ISBN 5-55002-376-4.

Gavin Watt is known for his exhaustively researched and meticulously referenced (this one contains nearly a thousand endnotes) accounts of early Canadian military history. He never lets that get in the way of readability, however, and this account of one episode during the American Revolution follows in that tradition.

It concerns an attempt to British General John Burgoyne to invade New York and split the American colonies; at the same time, Brigadier Barry St. Leger would lead an expedition from Lake Ontario into the Mohawk Valley, to recruit the Iroquois and their allies along the way, to chase the rebel troops out of the valley, and eventually to meet up with Burgoyne's force at Albany. Things went well at first, with St. Leger's troops and Iroquois allies routing the Mohawk Valley militia at Oriskany, but the stout defence of Fort Stanwix held up St. Leger, and eventually forced him to retreat. An attempt to get through to Burgoyne to provide reinforcements also failed because of lack of transport, and St. Leger's adventure came to an end at Ticonderoga, where they learned of Burgoyne's surrender and the utter failure of his plan. With no other options available, St. Leger burned

Ticonderoga and returned to Canada.

After his comprehensive analysis of the campaign itself, Watt embarks on the difficult task of sorting out the mythology that grew up afterwards. To take one example, he looks at Oriskany, a defeat which was turned into a victory in revolutionary mythology to the point that the US Navy named an aircraft carrier after the engagement in 1945. Watt's real skill here is in judiciously weighing the many (and often conflicting) contemporary sources, and coming up with that must surely be the best available figures for casualties on both sides. For any historian who has dealt with eighteenth-century military records, this is no mean feat.

TV

Randall Whitcomb, **Avro Aircraft and Cold War Aviation** (St. Catharines, ON: Vanwell Publishing, 2002), 272 pages, ISBN 1-55125-082-9.

In the mass of books which have been published about the Avro Arrow, it is often difficult to find anything new. But Randall Whitcomb's book, which, by his own admission, began as an examination of the technical aspects of Avro's aircraft, does indeed bring some new twists to the story.

Whitcomb doesn't lose sight of his original aim, and the book is full enough of technical details – engine performance comparisons, schematic diagrams, charts and graphs, cutaway engine drawings – to satisfy even the most dedicated Arrowhead. But the added dimension involves the geo-political context in which Avro operated, specifically its position within the Hawker Siddeley group of companies, one of the largest aerospace consortia of the period. The fate of Avro's Cold War aircraft – the Jetliner, the CF-100, and the CF-105 – was tied not only to the American military-industrial complex, as most historians have long admitted, but to the British as well, something which had not yet been adequately

explored. Unfortunately, because of the British government's notorious reluctance to release military documents, it will likely be decades before some of Whitcomb's more interesting and provocative arguments can be tested in the archives.

In the meantime, the book can simply be enjoyed for what it is – a handsomely illustrated (with many paintings by the author) compendium of some of Canada's greatest aircraft and their stories.

SL

Brenda Dunn, **A History of Port Royal / Annapolis Royal, 1605-1800** (Halifax: Nimbus Publishing, 2004), \$29.95, 296 pages, ISBN 1-55109-484-3.

Although Canadians are often described as having a "garrison mentality," we have very few accounts of what life was like in the forts and communities built to protect the nation's shores. Brenda Dunn's book on the community that began life under the French and ended up as a quiet, attractive Nova Scotia village tells of sieges, battles, intrigues, and betrayals on the bloody frontier between the French and the English in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. The book could provide information for a dozen historical novels. Dunn, however, sticks to the facts, meticulously detailing the story of one small community.

Established by the French in 1605, the town suffered thirteen attacks and served as the capital of Nova Scotia from 1710 to 1749. Globalization in the past meant that when Britain and France went to war, Port Royal / Annapolis Royal became the site of battles and sieges. The fort protecting the townsite kept falling apart, despite its strategic location where a sheltered bay gave access to fertile river valley land. The soldiers, badly paid, had to take jobs to survive, and Dunn parades a rich range of commanders and officers who tried to defend the community. The upper levels of command, riven by disagreements over power, showed

little initiative. In April 1721, the Toilet Paper Incident caused bitter feelings among the fort's officers. The paper in question, a draft letter from Lieutenant Washington, the irascible Ordnance Storekeeper, criticized officials and fellow officers at Annapolis Royal.

Because of the shortage of professional soldiers, the French and British recruited aboriginals. On 10 June 1711, a party of Abenaki killed or captured all save one of a party of New Englanders fifteen kilometres from the fort. The Acadians, the "neutral French," strove to stay out of these conflicts. Paul Mascarene, a British officer of Huguenot origin, defended them and opposed their deportation. William Shirley, governor of Massachusetts, emerges as the *eminent grise* in this shameful act. He influenced the committee that recommended in 1745 that the Acadians "be transported out of the province of Nova Scotia and be replaced by good Protestant Subjects."

This history gives us the feel of what life was like long ago at the edge of two European empires. Annapolis Royal's Fort Anne, a National Historic Site, now lures tourists with its beauty and history. This book, better sipped than swallowed whole because of Dunn's dense writing style, has excellent black and white illustrations that complement the text and is splendidly documented. The endpaper maps, however, are inadequate as an aid to understanding who went where and did what.

JL

André Hue and Ewen Southby-Tailyour, **The Next Moon: The Remarkable True Story of a British Agent Behind the Lines in Wartime France** (London: Viking / Penguin, 2004), £17.99, 320 pages, ISBN 0-670-91478-9.

Professor M.R.D. Foot's foreword to *The Next Moon* compares it to other classic tales of the Special Operations Executive, like George Millar's *Maquis* and

Frederick Spencer Chapman's *The Jungle Is Neutral*. It is certainly an interesting memoir, although not quite in the same league as those earlier best-sellers.

Hue, the son of a French father and a Welsh mother, joined the resistance in south Brittany at a young age, and was spirited away to England when the Germans cottoned on to the fact that he had been communicating freight train schedules to British intelligence. Trained by SOE, he was parachuted back into Brittany in June 1944, with a mission to bring the local Maquis groups to full effectiveness in time for the Normandy invasion. The plan was to prepare local resistors for the arrival of Free French paratroopers, who would then take over operations in that part of France. But raids by German units and French collaborators dispersed Hue's carefully assembled Maquis network, forcing him to scramble to reorganize the affected units into a useful fighting force.

It's all gripping stuff, but the bulk of the narrative covers just a few weeks, when Hue was desperately trying to reorganize his forces. For most of that time, he was criss-crossing the region on a bicycle, trying to round up *maquisards*, root out the rogues, and find farms at which the units could be re-formed. The work was certainly essential and unquestionably heroic, but after a few chapters it all starts to sound the same.

And then it all comes to an end, when Hue was transferred to other duties. One is left wondering what impact all of his to-ing and fro-ing ultimately had on the war in that part of France.

It would have been interesting to read something along these lines, to provide some context, and then to hear about Hue's next posting, to the Nièvre area of France (a tantalizing epilogue hints at what he did there). The account of his Brittany adventure could certainly have been edited down considerably to make space for these other elements.

JFV

* * * * *

Laurence Motiuk, **Thunderbirds for Peace: Diary of a Transport Squadron** (privately published [available from the author at Larmot Associates, 39 Higwood Drive, Ottawa, Ont., K2E 5K9], 2004), 807 pages, ISBN 0-9683431-1-2.

In *Thunderbirds at War*, Laurence Motiuk gave us perhaps the best and most comprehensive squadron history, the story of 426 Squadron RCAF during the Second World War. This volume begins on 25 April 1945, when 426 and 408 Squadrons took part in 6 Group's last raid of the war. The Thunderbirds lost one aircraft that night, in a mid-air collision with a 408 Squadron Halifax. At 2006 hours Flying Officer J. Boyle brought his aircraft back to Linton-on-Ouse to end 426's career as a heavy bomber unit.

This volume brings the same meticulous research and attention to detail to 426's postwar service. After the end of the war in Europe, the squadron converted to Liberators and transported troops between Britain and India. Disbanded in late 1945, it was reformed in Canada in August 1946 and remained operational until 1962, when it was disbanded for the last time. During this sixteen-year period, it flew a wide variety of missions, including flights to resupply the weather stations and other Arctic outposts, the Korean War airlift, logistics and ferry support to Canada's NATO forces in Europe, airlift support (including troop transport) to the United Nations Emergency Force in Egypt and the peace support operations in the Congo and Indochina, and disaster relief operations.

The extensive footnotes reveal the depth of Motiuk's research, as do the appendices, which provide a complete schedule of operations, nominal rolls, honours and awards, squadron commanders, among other things.

Thunderbirds for Peace is every bit as good as its predecessor, but has one significant difference: Motiuk served with 426 Squadron in the 1950s and 1960s, and can now write of the unit with the authority of a veteran.

DR

Briefly Noted

Edmund Cosgrove, **Canada's Fighting Pilots** (Ottawa: Golden Dog Press [distributed by University of Toronto Press], 2003), \$24.99 paper, 168 pages, ISBN 0-919614-97-3.

In 1965, veteran journalist Edmund Cosgrove published *Canada's Fighting Pilots*, almost as a sequel to George Drew's *Canada's Fighting Airmen*, which had become a bestseller after its publi-

cation in 1930. Like Drew, Cosgrove was a skilled raconteur and brought to life the stories of Canada's greatest aviators, from Bishop and Barker to Beurling and Mynarski, of the two world wars. Long out of print, this new edition retains Cosgrove's original text but adds some excellent and rarely seen photographs, and introductory and concluding remarks by Brick Billings. The only weak spots in the new version are sloppy formatting in the bib-

liography, and the fact that the opportunity was missed to correct some of Cosgrove's basic errors (like spelling Adolf Hitler's name incorrectly).

* * * * *

Robert L. Dallison, **Hope Restored: The American Revolution and the Founding of New Brunswick** (Fredericton: Goose Lane Editions/The New Brunswick Military History Project, 2003), \$14.95

paper, 120 pages, ISBN 0-86492-371-6.

Part biographical dictionary, part regimental history, part travel guide, this is a fine primer for anyone interested in the impact of the American Revolution on New Brunswick. Dallison begins with an account of the defense of the Bay of Fundy coast, and then considers the movement of the British Provincial Corps into New Brunswick. The two largest sections of the book provide brief sketches of the Loyalist regiments that were disbanded in New Brunswick, and short biographies of leading Loyalist soldiers and the places in New Brunswick that are directly connected to them and may be of interest to tourists. Another chapter examines the long-term impact of the military Loyalists on the province, an impact that went far beyond giving New Brunswick its provincial motto – *Spem reduxit* (hope restored).

The book should also be commended for its high production values. A very striking cover design, numerous photos, and high-quality maps all make for a publication that is as visually appealing as it is interesting.

* * * * *

Bill Inglee, **The Half-Track in Canadian Service** (Ottawa: Service Publications, 2003), \$9.95 paper, 24 pages, ISBN 1-894581-17-2.

Another entry in the Weapons of War series, Inglee's book provides a thumbnail history of Canada's use of half-tracks, beginning with the acquisition of four American-made vehicles for the Royal Canadian Horse Artillery in 1936 and ending with the use of half-tracks in Korea. The bulk of the book deals with the vehicles during the Second World War. In May 1944 there were 407 half-tracks in Canadian units in the 1st Canadian Army – they had already proven their worth in the Italian campaign, and Inglee says their heyday was in the early days of the campaign in north-west Europe. The photos are excellent, as are the line drawings

by Christopher Johnson (this is an ideal book for the military modeller), and there are a few surprising details – like the suggestion that many Canadian half-tracks were probably purchased by Israel after the war, and saw action in the wars of 1948, 1956, and 1967.

* * * * *

Peter Pigott, **Taming the Skies: A Celebration of Canadian Flight** (Toronto: Dundurn Group, 2003), \$49.00, 226 pages, ISBN 1-55002-469-8.

In this fine, coffee-table style book, Pigott has provided brief histories of fifty of the most significant aircraft in the history of Canadian aviation, from the Silver Dart to the CH-149 Cormorant. Every machine that one would expect is here, but there are also a few surprises: the B-17 Flying Fortress (six of which were used to fly mail to Canadian troops in Europe from 1943 to 1945), the Boulton Paul Defiant (which few of its former crewmen probably recall with affection), the Northrop Delta, reluctantly accepted by the RCAF in 1936 and responsible for the first RCAF casualties of the war, when one aircraft disappeared over New Brunswick on 14 September 1939. Each chapter is enlivened by excellent photographs, and by Pigott's sense of humour – he reminds us of a saying in the American aircraft industry: "If it's ugly, it's British; if it's weird, it's French; if it's ugly and weird, it's Russian" (181).

* * * * *

Steve Guthrie, **The Sherman in Canadian Service** (Ottawa: Service Publications, 2002), \$9.95 paper, 24 pages, ISBN 1-894581-14-8.

Twenty-four pages isn't much space to tell the whole story of Canada's Sherman tanks, so Guthrie is forced to be very concise in this very brief history. Well illustrated, it covers the most significant modifications made to Canadian Shermans (official and otherwise), and provides a listing of

the units of the Canadian Armoured Corps which were equipped with Shermans. Guthrie really doesn't have the room to get into a critical discussion of the Sherman's performance (a bibliography would have been useful to direct readers to other sources), but he provides a good starting point for anyone who is not very familiar with the history of this important fighting vehicle.

* * * * *

Reinhard Nachtigal, **Die Murmanbahn: Die Verkehrsanbindung eines kriegswichtigen Hafens und das Arbeitspotential der Kriegsgefangenen (1915 bis 1918)** (Grunbach: Verlag Bernhard Albert Greiner, 2001), • 13.00, 159 pages, ISBN 3-935383-05-3.

During the First World War, the blockade of Russian ports on the Baltic and Black Seas forced the Tsar to rely heavily on Archangel and Vladivostok. The latter was on the other side of the continent and the former was blocked by pack ice for half the year, so the government decided in 1915 to begin construction of a 1400-kilometre-long railway to Murmansk on the Barents Sea. It eventually became one of the most brutal POW work projects of the war. The terrain was desolate and harsh and the prisoners (most of them ethnic Germans and Hungarians, on the orders of Russian headquarters) suffered badly from deficiency diseases like scurvy. News of the conditions brought reprisals, which continued until the railway was completed and all prisoners evacuated. All told, some 70,000 POWs worked on the railway, and as many as 25,000 may have died. Nachtigal's book, based on exhaustive archival research, is the only full account of the railway that, in many ways, was the precursor to the better known Death Railway in Thailand in the Second World War. One hope that *Die Murmanbahn* will soon be translated into an English edition.

* * * * *

Michael A. Dorosh, **Dressed to Kill** (Ottawa: Service Publications, 2001), \$29.95 paper, 87 pages, ISBN 1-894581-07-5.

As Dorosh states in the introduction, his title embodies a nice double entendre. Canadian soldier's battledress was indeed designed to make it as easy as possible for them to do the job of killing

the enemy but, in his view, they were also rather more attractive than the dress of many of our Allies. This is arguably the most complete account to date of what Canadian soldiers wore, with particular attention being given to the variants and "quiffs" that they were particularly prone to resorting to. Dorosh covers every imaginable aspect of the subject, from footwear

all the way up to headgear, illustrating as many examples as possible with photographs of material from collectors and archival and contemporary photos. One quibble about the latter, though – in almost none of these photos are the soldiers identified. If any of the names are known, it would have been nice to include them in the caption.

General

- America's Military Adversaries from Colonial Times to the Present**
by John C. Fredriksen 8
- The Book of War Letters: 100 Years of Private Canadian Correspondence**
by Audrey and Paul Grescoe 3
- Canada's Army: Waging War and Keeping the Peace**
by J.L. Granatstein 1
- * Canada's Fighting Pilots**
by Edmund Cosgrove 14
- Defending the Dominion: Canadian Military Rifles, 1855-1955**
by David W. Edgecombe 5
- Georges Island: The Keep of Halifax Harbour**
by Dianne Marshall 7
- Intelligence in War: Knowledge of the Enemy from Napoleon to Al-Qaeda**
by John Keegan 9
- Saint John Fortifications, 1630-1956**
by Roger Sarty and
Doug Knight 15
- * Taming the Skies: A Celebration of Canadian Flight**
by Peter Pigott 15
- Who Killed the Canadian Military?**
by J.L. Granatstein 5
- Wing Walkers: The Rise and Fall of Canada's Other Airline**
by Peter Pigott 11

Pre-1914

- Green Coats and Glory: the United States Regiment of Riflemen, 1808-1821**
by John C. Fredriksen 6
- A History of Port Royal / Annapolis Royal, 1605-1800**
by Brenda Dunn 13
- * Hope Restored: The American Revolution and the Founding of New Brunswick**
by Robert L. Dallison 14
- Marine Royale XVIIe-XVIIIe siècles: Uniformes, Equipement, Armement**
by Jean Boudriot and
Michel Pétard 2
- Niagara Rebels: The Niagara Frontier in the Upper Canadian Rebellion, 1837-38**
Colin K. Duquemin 11

- Rebellion in the Mohawk Valley: The St. Leger Expedition of 1777**
by Gavin K. Watt 12

1914-1939

- Canada and the Great War: Western Front Association Papers**
by Briton C. Busch 3
- Colonel Richardson's Airedales: The Making of the British War Dog School, 1900 - 1918**
by Bryan D. Cummins 10
- Dans le tourmente: Deux hôpitaux militaires canadiens-français dans la France en guerre (1915-1919)**
by Michel Litalien 12
- The Invisible Soldier: Captain W.A.P. Durie, His Life and Afterlife**
by Veronica Cusack 10
- * Die Murmanbahn: Die Verkehrsanbindung eines kriegswichtigen Hafens und das**

Book Review Supplement Editor

Jonathan F. Vance

Contributing Reviewers

Charles Aziz
Graham Broad
René Chartrand
Brian Clancy
Stephanie Cousineau
Wes Gustavson
Barb Lundrigan
Susan Lee
Jim Lotz
Heather Moran
David Rozanski
Kendra Sorensen
Jonathan F. Vance
Tom Vanderlaan

* Briefly Noted

- Arbeitspotential der Kriegsgefangenen (1915 bis 1918)**
by Reinhard Nachtigal 15
- Raleigh on the Rocks: The Canada Shipwreck of HMS Raleigh**
by Richard Rohmer 9

1939-1945

- A Date Which Will Live: Pearl Harbor in American Memory**
by Emily S. Rosenberg 5
- * Dressed to Kill**
by Michael A. Dorosh 16
- Fields of Fire: The Canadians in Normandy**
by Terry Copp 2
- Fighting Fascism in Europe: The World War II Letters of an American Veteran of the Spanish Civil War**
by Lawrence Cane 7
- First Light**
by Geoffrey Wellum 7
- * The Half-Track in Canadian Service**
by Bill Inglee 15
- The Next Moon: The Remarkable True Story of a British Agent Behind the Lines in Wartime France**
by André Hue and Ewen Southby-Tailyour 13
- Our Mornings May Never Be: Memoirs of a WAAF Sergeant...and Beyond**
by Joan MacDonald 8
- The Royal Air Force in Texas: Training British Pilots in Terrell during World War II**
by Tom Killebrew 4
- * The Sherman in Canadian Service**
by Steve Guthrie 15
- The War with Japan: The Period of Balance, May 1942-October 1943**
by H.P. Willmott 11

Post-1945

- Avro Aircraft and Cold War Aviation**
by Randall Whitcomb 13
- War & Politics by Other Means: A Journalist's Memoir**
by Shelby Scates 4
- Thunderbirds for Peace: Diary of a Transport Squadron**
by Laurence Motiuk 14