

Consensus

Volume 36
Issue 1 *History of the Lutheran Theological
Seminary in Saskatoon*

Article 2

5-25-2015

Identity Lost and Found

Adrienne Jones

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholars.wlu.ca/consensus>



Part of the [History of Religion Commons](#), and the [Practical Theology Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Jones, Adrienne (2015) "Identity Lost and Found," *Consensus*: Vol. 36: Iss. 1, Article 2.

DOI: 10.51644/VJZH1269

Available at: <https://scholars.wlu.ca/consensus/vol36/iss1/2>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by Scholars Commons @ Laurier. It has been accepted for inclusion in Consensus by an authorized editor of Scholars Commons @ Laurier. For more information, please contact scholarscommons@wlu.ca.

Identity Lost and Found

Adrienne Jones*

As the only Lutheran parish in Peterborough [Ontario], people at Christ were worried about losing their Lutheran identity. Their fear has subsided and their experience has brought new hope to the congregation.¹

A subtle note in Canadian ecclesial history reveals itself in this quote from the December 2014 *Canada Lutheran*. Once acknowledged, the above quotation from a national newsletter article about four Anglican congregations and one Lutheran congregation covenanting as one ministry becomes disturbing. If, as the nation of Canada developed, the issue of identity became something imposed rather than organic, then the threat of losing identity becomes a genuine fear. The history of Canadian Lutheranism, from the earliest days of Canada to Confederation, can be described in terms of identity found, identity imposed, and identity lost. As one commentator on German immigration to Canada would write that the German culture in Canada, having lost its “objective criteria of ethnicity, namely language and cultural aspirations ... ceased to be a genuine ethnic group.”²

The history of the relationship between the Anglican Church of Canada (and its parent, the Church of England) and the Evangelical Lutheran Church In Canada (and its various parent synods) indicates that it has not always been the receptive friendship of mutual ministry it presents itself to be. The two identifiably distinct denominations have been at odds with each other; so much so, that it should come as absolutely no surprise to the Anglicans engaged in the practical application of the *Waterloo Declaration*³ to congregational life that they and their actions are at times viewed with suspicion. This suspicion is neither paranoia, nor confusion, nor even misunderstanding: it comes directly from the socio-political creation of this entity called Canada, and it is something that needs an objective and proactive acceptance of the combined missional work.

Since this is a part of rich history of Canada, limitations must be placed. This study focuses primarily on German Lutheran immigrants and their descendants during the time between 1750 and 1867, in the geographical regions of Halifax and Lunenburg in Nova Scotia and Williamsburg in Eastern Ontario. During this time, “the Maritime provinces were founded in an era in which religion was still considered a matter of critical importance, the state assuming that an established church in turn depending upon state support.”⁴ There were other Lutheran cultures actively immigrating to the Canadian colonies at this time, and these immigrants settled in the same and other regions of the burgeoning nation. They in their own experience and time may have endured the same as their German counterparts. The decision made to only discuss the German experience here comes from

* Adrienne Jones is a PhD candidate at Wycliffe College in the Toronto School of Theology. Her studies are focussing on the lived experience of the Waterloo Declaration, signed in 2001 between the Anglican Church of Canada and the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Canada.

the direct connection between the German region in Europe and England in the same time period.

Background

Beginning in the earliest days of discovery, Lutherans had a brief ecclesial presence in Canada, when the Lutheran pastor Rasmus Jensen ministered to the crew of the Jens Munk expedition, who were wintering in Churchill while on their quest for a northwest passage to India via Hudson Bay.⁵ While this 1619 expedition venture would fail for reasons now obvious, Lutheran involvement in the formation of Canada began with some key players in the European politic of the day. In 1602, Henry IV of France had granted privileges for the fur trade to French capitalists; England, a little behind in the venture in 1627 “approved the formation of the Company of Merchant Adventurers of London to drive the French out of Canada.”⁶ Amongst the English expedition members was an unnamed Lutheran clergyman.⁷ At first it may strike the student of Canadian history as being odd, but it would be important to remember that “there were many connections between the English and the Germans at the time,” primarily due to the marriage of Elizabeth, the daughter of James I to Frederick, the Palatine Elector. Both men were also members of the German Protestant Union, with Frederick as its head: thus, it was highly plausible for England to have German support in war efforts, with German Lutheran clergy among the the British expeditions.⁸

It was also not unusual for Anglican and Lutheran clergy to visit England and the European continent during this time. There were British congregations in places such as Bremen, Hamburg, and other places along the Baltic coast; and there was a Lutheran presence in London. Lutheran clergy developed an appreciation for both Anglican and Puritan devotional books, Anglican patristic scholarship, and pastoral practice.⁹ This is found in the devotional literature that had been edited for the Lutheran parishioners, as their clergy were “chiefly interested in the Anglican church’s devotional and pastoral contribution, in the Puritan emphasis on good works, and individual moral entrenchment implicit in one’s duty to God, oneself, and one’s neighbour.”¹⁰ Lutheran clergy adapted some Anglican liturgical practices as well as appreciated the particular psychological care used when writing prayers. With the devotional books’ emphasis on faith instruction, observance of Sunday, and regular Bible reading, it was not surprising to find these books being printed and reprinted on a regular basis.¹¹ The popularity of these books and their frequent use popularized Bible reading, printing, and selling after 1700.¹² These devotional books may or may not have had a direct role in the results of Anglican interference with Lutheran congregations in Nova Scotia or Eastern Ontario, but it is interesting to note that some Lutherans who immigrated to Canada would have had exposure to these books in their faith formation. An increase in piety and rationalism from various points in the Protestant world were influencing religious life in the German region and in England during the first half of the eighteenth century.

Devotional books and certain liturgical practices may have been adapted to Lutheran use, but the style of Anglican governance was not. It is unlikely that the visiting Lutheran clergy would have had much exposure to how the Church of England governed itself or what its cultural role was in the British society. This was perhaps due to the Lutheran focus to their congregations’ spiritual well-being after the Great Northern War

(1700-1721) and the War of the Spanish Succession (1701-1714).¹³ As such, it meant Lutheran clergy were more inclined to appreciate the lessons in the devotional books than governance matters: if they could use items from outside their tradition to benefit the congregation life,¹⁴ the thought would be to take those items from a tradition that was so close in doctrine to their own.

Reasons for Immigrating

A devoted sense of piety was only one aspect of the Lutheran life, but it may have been the only part of their life where Lutherans were united in the 18th century. As most students of European history will know, there was not a political entity known as Germany at this point; rather, it was only a collection of provinces and states bound by a common language. The greatest fragmentation in daily life could be found in the central and southwestern region – where the Palatine region is located – which were “suffocated by dues and tolls at the innumerable borders,” where the cottage industry was stifled due to jealous and competing guilds, and agriculture was slow to receive the benefits of new technologies.¹⁵ Widespread hardship and stagnation in productivity was common, and many Germans headed elsewhere for survival; some headed to England. When the English triumphed over the French for the colonies in North America,¹⁶ the movement for migration to the New World began. The French colonial policy had been to give “a social and religious structure completely identical to that of the motherland,” whereas the British policy involved “the acquisition and retention of colonial territory [through] people,” so emigrants to England from foreign nations were given ownership of land provided they pledged allegiance to the British throne and flag.¹⁷ Though this policy had both political and economic benefits, it would come to serve the British and their church well in the future interaction between Anglicans and Lutherans.

With the colony of Nova Scotia acquired through the Treaty of Utrecht in 1713, England gained a foothold in the Canadian colony. Part of the treaty specified that France retained Ile St-Jean (Prince Edward Island) and Cape Breton. On Cape Breton in 1719, France constructed the naval fortress Louisbourg to protect its remaining colony, New France, and other settlements along the St. Lawrence River. This obviously threatened British interests because it hindered access to the American colonies as well as to the rich fishing banks; thus “to offset Louisbourg’s strategic influence and the uncertain loyalty of the Acadians [-] Halifax was founded in 1749 and some twenty-seven hundred ‘foreign Protestants’ – German and Swiss... who were fleeing religious persecution in Europe – were settled at Halifax and Lunenburg in 1750 and 1751.”¹⁸ As long as the Maritimes were insecurely Britain’s, the immigration of Protestants was “as a matter of principle.”¹⁹ The majority of Germans who arrived in Nova Scotia were Lutherans. After some had settled in Lunenburg, they formed a congregation, but it would be nearly twenty years before they were able to call a pastor.²⁰ An unpublished document from 1760, referred to as the ‘Jung Manuscript,’ “gives no impression that the leaders, at any rate, of the Lutheran element ever contemplated absorption by the Church of England.”²¹

In the Canadian Maritime colonies, between the years 1749 and 1807, the Church of England was experiencing a period of insecurity: not only was it the established faith in Nova Scotia, Prince Edward Island, Cape Breton, and New Brunswick, it had “succeeded in maintaining its position of dominance despite a relative failure to maintain popular

support among the inhabitants.”²² Despite the obvious and known fact that Anglicanism was by law the established faith tradition, it held no position of power.²³ In the early development of the colonies, the Britain government had established the Commissioners of Trade and Plantations to include the provision of clergy and schoolmasters to look after the various needs of the settlers. These men were also part of a larger political scheme: the Anglicans, while holding most of the political clout, were the minority of the population. To resolve this problem in their favour, the decision was made to financially support Anglican clergy only; faced with the “alternative of having to provide personally for the support of their own clergy if they did not become part of the established church, the authorities reasoned that most dissenters, including German Lutherans, would prefer to become Anglican.”²⁴ Unlike the French policy where the attempt was made to have only French Roman Catholics populate the colony, thus alleviating the loyalty amongst the colonists, Britain had welcomed all Protestants to their colonies. The other denominations present in North America, while obvious extensions of their parent communions in Europe, began to develop differences that were unique to the colonial context. As such, one would expect this common Protestant heritage to create an ecumenical environment of mutual support and ministry. However, ecumenical support came when there were general crises as the denominations showed little interest in each other otherwise.²⁵

German Loyalists

The most significant crisis between the years 1749 and 1807 was the aftermath of the American Revolution when the population of the Maritimes and Eastern Ontario increased due to the arrival of the expelled Loyalists. Whatever the arrangements were in religious toleration between the Church of England and the German settlers, these would now be changing. The British government “assumed the validity and intrinsic usefulness of a religious institution which was intimately connected with the civil authority... After the American Revolution, the necessity of a state church appeared even more important.”²⁶ Loyalty to the British Crown became connected to the obvious attendance and communicating sign of membership in the Church of England. Despite the importance of this, it was left to voluntary movements and societies such as the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (SPG) to “provide the first Anglican parsons even for British settlers. One might, then, hardly expect them to provide free passage, and a salary after arrival for a German Lutheran minister.”²⁷ The SPG missionaries, the first ordained Anglican clergy in the region were not in abundance nor were they wealthy despite having better financial support than the other missionaries present. SPG missionaries were paid by the Society rather than by the settlers who were barely surviving and making a living for themselves.²⁸ Thus, like many of their other Protestant brothers and sisters, the Lutherans found themselves being pastorally served by Anglican clergy: the cultural and denominational distinctions would become difficult to maintain. It was the British government, and not the Church of England, that had oversight of the spiritual matters in the colonies, which unnecessarily complicated matters.²⁹

Between 1775 and 1787, confusion and transition was prominent in the culture of Maritimes. In this twenty-two year period, a growth in evangelical pietism developed to separate religion and faith from political matters.³⁰ For the Loyalists, who were not only British in origin but also from a variety of places in Europe including the German region,

they were starting over with little more than what they could carry as they were expelled from their homes in the United States. "They brought with them their traditions, beliefs and knowledge of farming or knowledge pertaining to another occupation ... If they did not try to maintain their unique identity in the secular realm, in the spiritual they stubbornly refused to give up their faith."³¹

Regardless of whether they came directly to the Maritimes from Europe or had spent a portion of their lives in the colonies, cultural identities were important to the immigrant community. Both the community and the culture identified each member as belonging to a particular group, and the church was no exception to this rule. However, the heightened expectation of being loyal to the British Crown for the maintenance of public order would prove this endeavour to be difficult. Those who were not already communicative members of the Church of England and other "Protestant dissenters from Europe, especially the Lunenburg Germans, were to be converted and educated to assimilate them into British America and to prevent further ethnic divisions beyond those already present" such as the remaining Acadian population.³²

For the British Loyalist, the change to life in the Maritimes invoked shock and dismay. These Loyalists were more a social cross-section than from any one particular social class: most of the exiled principal leaders and business people went back to England or to the West Indies; whereas Quebec and Nova Scotia saw an influx of farmers, artisans, and a few intellectual thinkers and officeholders.³³ One of the more painful results of the American Revolution for the Loyalists, in terms of their sense of self and identity, was that while Americans now had symbols, heroes and an "ideologically-based definition of citizenship," the Loyalists who came to Canada had none of that as the 'losers' of that conflict.³⁴ Instead, they brought with them "broken dreams, a distorted image of their experience, and a profound sense of indignation bordering on rage."³⁵ Thus, in the hierarchical pecking order of politics, the minority or those with the least amount of power became the true victims of the Revolution. These diverse groups – including German Lutherans – became problematic as they would not assimilate easily into this new non-identity; however, they "were all bound together by the experience of migration [and]... a loose but lasting affiliation under 'the Crown'."³⁶ Unrealistic expectations came with a pressure to conform to as much of the immigrant culture as possible: "The state of being 'different' was harmful and would deter their integration with the rest of Nova Scotia and [it was] hoped that once the German's [sic] were offered the Anglican rites and were educated by the proper (Anglican) clergy, they would relinquish their divergent ideas."³⁷

Halifax, Nova Scotia

The process used was political in nature: only clergy ordained according to the Anglican rite were allowed to preside at the altar for communion. As such, the Lutherans were served by Anglican clergy, some of whom would fail in their endeavour to alienate them from their faith.³⁸ For example, the Lutheran community in Halifax called Pastor Peter Christian Berger,³⁹ who had been first ordained in Holland according to the Lutheran rite; he was "evidently restricted to functioning as a deacon to assist the Anglican incumbent [William] Tutty in ministering to the Germans."⁴⁰ Berger assisted Tutty by tutoring the Anglican priest in German, so Tutty could preside at Communion – teaching him to pronounce it well enough so that, in Tutty's opinion, the rite was "intelligible to the

foreigners.”⁴¹ It was Tutty’s recommendation that Berger be sent to England to be ordained in 1751; however, nothing further was heard of Berger again.

The Lutheran congregation in Halifax remained despite not having Berger as their pastor, building and founding their first church, St. George’s, in 1761. They called their first pastor that year as well, despite some noticeable interference from the Anglicans. Perhaps it was because of the previous relationship of Berger and Tutty ten years earlier, or Tutty’s continued service to the Lutherans; either way, “the Anglicans of St. Paul’s... became more and more interested in the German Lutherans. They knew that according to British law anyone, including the Germans, belonged to the one Anglican congregation in Halifax and saw no need to argue with the Germans about this.”⁴² With the obvious intention of winning the Lutherans to the Church of England, Dr. Breynton (who officiated at the dedication of St. George’s in March of 1761), offered to conduct worship until their called pastor arrived.⁴³ It was determined by the leadership at St. George’s that the congregation remain both German and Lutheran. “Whether the German language or the doctrinal position of the Lutheran Confession was more important to them is irrelevant. For the German Lutherans in Halifax, at the time, the two issues were intertwined.”⁴⁴

In the calling of ministers, the appeal went through the Provincial Assembly of Nova Scotia. The Assembly asked for a German-speaking cleric of the Church of England be sent, clarifying that while the offer should be held open for a Lutheran pastor, an Anglican would be preferred.⁴⁵ The list of issues in support of this political move are unfortunately well related to the New World: the immigrants lacked resources, there were problems with settlements, much of the country could not be farmed successfully, and there was a lack of sympathy for clergy making demands – especially Anglican missionaries – to get support from parishioners.⁴⁶ This was more so after the influx of Loyalists to the area after the American Revolution.

For the Lutheran congregation of St. George, this influx and political situation would mark their journey into becoming an Anglican congregation. One of the important people in the arrival of Loyalists was Pastor Bernard Michael Hausihl,⁴⁷ who arrived 32 years after being first called to serve them in 1784. He would be their only German minister.⁴⁸ Like so many of his clerical colleagues, he could not support himself and his family on what the congregation was providing. “In order, therefore, to qualify as a missionary for the subsidies of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, he had himself ordained as an Anglican chaplain in 1785, without ceasing to be the Lutheran pastor for his congregation.”⁴⁹ However, in agreeing for Hausihl to become the Anglican missionary, the congregation in Halifax began to accelerate its movement to becoming a Church of England congregation. By this time, they had been served for over forty years of receiving communion according to the Anglican rite from Anglican clergy,⁵⁰ having had their spiritual needs met by SPG missionaries starting in 1749.⁵¹ The transition was so subtle that neither Hausihl “nor the congregation realized that absorption by the Church of England might jeopardize their German ethnic heritage.”⁵²

Williamsburg region, Ontario

Similar events would happen in Eastern Ontario, starting roughly when St. George’s Halifax ceased to be Lutheran. About 30,000 German mercenaries who had been sold into service to the English for the War of Independence settled permanently in Canada,⁵³ and

those from New York State settled in the two oldest permanent non-Aboriginal settlements in Eastern Ontario: present-day Dundas and Stormont counties, and the Bay of Quinte.⁵⁴ In the Dundas area, the Williamsburg, Matilda, Osnabruck, and Cornwall settlements were given to the First Battalion of the New York Loyalist Regiment, of which nearly all the members were German Palatine farmers.⁵⁵ The first Lutheran minister to serve was Rev. Samuel Schwerdtfeger who arrived in 1790, followed by Rev. A. Meyer, who served from 1803 to 1807. Their successor, Rev. Wiegand, “secretly joined the Church of England in 1811 and tried, on instruction of his superiors (although in vain), to take his Lutheran congregation with him into the Anglican Church.”⁵⁶ As seen in Halifax, this phenomenon of Lutheran pastors becoming Anglican was not new: “while in both instances the congregations themselves clung stubbornly to their Lutheranism, the Anglicans managed to win over their ministers”⁵⁷ with the financial benefits. It would be safe at this point to conclude the Anglicans were interested primarily in making congregational life difficult for Lutherans for political reasons and not spiritual: at the community level, “as early as 1760 the British instinctively applied the most effective means in disputes with foreign ethnic groups, namely the closure of the foreign-language schools.”⁵⁸

Once Wiegand’s position had been discovered, the Lutherans in Williamsburg and surrounding area separated themselves from him. They called Meyer a second time in the winter of 1814-1815. With the support of the Anglican Church, Wiegand “took recourse by force. He barred the church to all who did not recognize the thirty-nine articles of the Church of England,” but a compromise was established where the Lutherans could use the building every two weeks⁵⁹. Supporters of Wiegand would form an Anglican congregation, and those who did not formed a Lutheran congregation. Perhaps it was inevitable that for financial reasons, Rev. Meyer, who returned to look after the spiritual needs of the Lutherans, became an Anglican priest himself⁶⁰.

Whether in Williamsburg, Halifax, or in Lunenburg, one of the greater complaints about the Lutheran pastors becoming Anglican priests (aside from the personal financial benefits of having a guaranteed salary from the SPG) was that the pastors did not acknowledge the church’s “designs on the material possessions of the German congregations, which may have been justified by the English view that the pastor, not the congregation, had the right to dispose of the church property.”⁶¹ The colonies’ primary financial and political support came from the British: small ethnic congregations could not support both themselves and their pastor. Thus, as much as these pastors would have remained Lutheran, they converted for the sake of their survival. For some pastors, “the transition into the Anglican camp [was] purely religious matter, without considering the inevitable risk of exposing their congregation to the loss of their German ethnic identity.”⁶² This divisive position was one among many that prevented pioneering German Canadians from becoming a united community in defense of their traditions, so it became one of the causes for retention of their cultural heritage – the Germans with the Germans, and so on. The methodology of the British was simple: take away the church, and you take away the obstacle to assimilating the foreigner. This had worked well for the Church of England in Halifax and in Williamsburg. However, events in Lunenburg Nova Scotia, coinciding with the events in Halifax, indicate that this method was not always successful.

Lunenburg, Nova Scotia

The religious situation in Nova Scotia left little room for complaints as initially there was complete religious freedom for Protestants; however, in Lunenburg, the settlers were not yet self-sufficient enough to take serious advantage of this freedom.⁶³ The Calvinists were using St. John's Anglican Church for their worship, and when the Lutherans inquired about using the space, it was granted. In January 1760 a request came before the Governor of Nova Scotia and the Assembly for someone to serve the German Lutherans in Lunenburg: the problem with the request was that it was written without any sensitivity to what the Lutherans wanted. The suggestion was made to bring a missionary from the Church of England who spoke German as well as English – failing that, an English minister and schoolmaster should be provided. The request mentioned, however truthfully or not, that the “German settlers who were mainly Lutheran or Reformed (Calvinist) were prepared to become one congregation under the Church of England Government.”⁶⁴ In 1761, Robert Vincent arrived to take the positions of minister and schoolmaster in Lunenburg, speaking only English; but as he was serving in a missionary capacity, the Nova Scotia authorities drew from the stipend meant for a German minister. To assist, Vincent enlisted the help of German schoolmaster Gottlob Neuman.⁶⁵

The events in Halifax may have been known to the Lutheran congregation in Lunenburg, since they never withdrew their request for a German pastor. They were upset that “while the British government were still offering a salary, however meagre, for a German minister, and had not withdrawn their invitation to the Lutheran chaplains in London to furnish a man for the post, the Nova Scotia Assembly should petition instead for an Anglican parson.”⁶⁶ Vincent was conditionally accepted, until he presumed that because the Lutherans and the Calvinists were contemplating building their own church, there was little difference between the denominations and that they were receptive to English ministry. When he died in 1765, “it became evident he was wrong on both counts”; and the common church plans were scrapped.⁶⁷

In 1767, a German and English speaking pastor arrived in Lunenburg named Paul Bryzelius, sent by SPG. He had previously served in Pennsylvania, where he became problematic for Rev. Henry Melchoir Muhlenberg,⁶⁸ the leader of the Lutheran churches in the United States. Despite living a life and doctrine above reproach, Bryzelius had been rejected by the Lutherans in New Jersey and had a very large family to look after so he could not be sent to the frontier life of the opening mid-West.⁶⁹ It was still the goal to convert the Lunenburg Lutherans to the Church of England, so SPG put the request to Muhlenberg for a Lutheran pastor: he sent Bryzelius. The Anglicans examined him, found him fit as a candidate for ordination, and sent Bryzelius to London where he was ordained on March 15th 1767.⁷⁰ While in England, he was given a translation of the *Book of Common Prayer* by the King's German Chaplain, Friedrich Michael Ziegenhagen – coincidentally, the man the Lunenburg Lutherans had been depending upon for a pastor.⁷¹ Muhlenberg wrote to Ziegenhagen's associate F. W. Pasche, expressing his relief at finding a place for Bryzelius: “Thus, we are rid of him and the poor Germans [in Nova Scotia] are served. For it is better that they have something in their own language than nothing at all.”⁷²

The use of the German translated *Book of Common Prayer* revealed Bryzelius as an imposter to the Lunenburgers:⁷³ an imposter who had been properly trained in Sweden, examined in life and doctrine both by the Pennsylvanian Ministerium headed by

Muhlenberg and by the Anglican Bishop of London – his credentials could not have been more solid.⁷⁴ The concern was raised to Muhlenberg, who instead of agreeing with the Lunenbergers, chastised them for rejecting Bryzelius:⁷⁵ they were to be happy with Bryzelius as he would help them maintain the social structure and balance in their community. Not satisfied with this answer, the Lutheran Lunenbergers built their own church during the years 1770 and 1771, holding worship in it in the Fall of 1771; they called Rev. Friedrich Schultz from Baltimore⁷⁶ as their first pastor on November 1st, 1772.⁷⁷

Outcome

In these three congregations of Halifax, Williamsburg, and Lunenburg, we have examples of the fears expressed in the opening quote of this paper, both threatening, and in two places succeeding to various degrees. In all three, the German Lutherans kept themselves isolated as much as they could against the British culture that surrounded them, but it was only a matter of time and generations before the isolation would no longer be beneficial to them. There are other political and social factors at work that would have had an effect on these places during this time in the development of the nation of Canada, such as the Constitutional Act of 1791 (better known as the Family Compact):⁷⁸ but those having a direct impact has been the discussion at hand. Because Halifax was established in response to Louisbourg on Cape Breton, it logically was a very military-oriented and thus very British city: the absorption of the German culture into the British one happened at a faster rate there than in Lunenburg despite English being the everyday language in both places: the German language fell out of favour and was rarely used after the 1840s, remaining nowadays in the form of family surnames.⁷⁹

The establishment of the Church of England as the national church in the Canadian colonies had been the authoritative agenda from the beginning, but it had originally been unrealistic since the number of Anglican missionaries prior to 1812 had been seven. This scarcity of Anglican clergy was because few clergy in England were willing to leave for the New World.⁸⁰ While life in the colonies was difficult no matter what socio-economic class or country of origin a pioneer came from, their spiritual needs were arguably the same. Yet for the Lutherans in Nova Scotia and in Eastern Ontario the difficulties went beyond these: their very identity as Germans and as Lutherans was under threat despite the government's legislative promise to permit the liberty of conscience to all persons. Loyalty to the British Crown would guarantee survival; whereas loyalty to self would guarantee a clear conscience.

Since a number of German settlers would have inherited the pietistic movement, there is a possibility is that they would have been exposed to the Anglican ideology in the form of the devotional books used and issued by their clergy, who had in turn retrieved these books from England. This could have aided the permeation of the confessional borders between the two traditions, making adherence to one more in a formal sense than actual⁸¹, especially since the similarities between the Augsburg Confession and the Thirty-Nine Articles were so close that even the clergy could “reduce the difference [between] these two communions to a question of whether ordination was episcopal or consistorial.”⁸² After the War of 1812, the Anglican population ordained and lay increased as they emigrated from England. The establishment of the Church of England as the

national church became more and more a reality in practice though it never officially became such in Canada.

This study began with a quote about the fears of loss of identity, and the subsiding of those fears was used. If one takes into consideration the history of the various levels of involvement and interaction between the two denominations it becomes clear that the expressed fear is not paranoia but a religio-historical response. History shows that Anglicans and Lutherans worked together for the spiritual benefit of their congregations; but from the same history we learn how mutual ministry is a twentieth-twenty-first century phenomenon. In the eighteenth century, it was a survival tactic that it be a ministry of one, not many. It is far too simple to place blame or direct anger towards one denomination because of history. Moreover, one can examine the past in order to learn about possibilities for the future. As history is remembered and new patterns appear, the eighteenth-century colonial dream of one national established church will not take shape; but a shared national and established mission very well may emerge.

Endnotes

¹ Scott Schellenberger, "Anglican-Lutheran Covenant Excites Ministry in Peterborough." *Canada Lutheran* (December: 29, 2014), 29.

² Heinz Lehmann, *The German Canadians 1750-1937: Immigration, Settlement and Culture*. Gerhard P. Bassler, ed. and trans. (St. John's, Newfoundland: Jespersen Press, 1986), xxvi.

³ The *Waterloo Declaration* is the full communion agreement between the Anglican Church of Canada and the Evangelical Church of Canada, signed in July of 2001. The document itself can be found at <http://elcic.ca/What-We-Believe/Waterloo-Declaration.cfm>, or, with a commentary, at <http://www.anglican.ca/faith/eir/waterloo/>. Accessed April 22, 2015.

⁴ J.M. Bumstead, "Church and State in Maritime Canada," *Canadian History Before Confederation: Essays and Interpretations* (Georgetown, Ontario: Irwin-Dorsey Limited, 1979), 180.

⁵ Norman J. Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic: A History of Lutherans in Canada* (Vulcan, Alberta: Today's Reformation Press, 2006), 1-2.

⁶ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 4.

⁷ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 4.

⁸ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 4. The relationship between Lutherans and Anglicans goes even further back to the time of the English Reformation, when Luther's writings would be discussed by Cambridge theologians like Robert Barnes, William Tyndale, Nicholas Ridley, Hugh Latimer, and Thomas Cranmer. Later, Edward VI of England would issue a charter in 1550 "which gave continental Protestants the right to worship in their own language and according to their own customs;" this charter would be renewed by his sister, Elizabeth I, and become the legal basis for Lutherans to form congregations and worship in London. Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 5. There was a Lutheran presence in London by 1700, and it increased when George of Denmark, the prince consort to Queen Anne, established the German Court Chapel of St. James; this presence would continue to grow as the Elector of Hanover would come to the British throne as George I in 1714, as noted by Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 6. The Elector of Hanover, an empty yet honorific title, was obtained by the Dukes of Brunswick-Lüneberg after consolidating a large state in the north-west region of the German territory; his coming to the British throne was through "a combination of heredity and legislation" as stated by Winthrop Pickard Bell, *The "Foreign Protestants" and the Settlement of Nova Scotia: The History of a Piece of Arrested British Colonial Policy in the Eighteenth Century* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1961), 91. For further research on the ecclesiastical effects of a Lutheran inheriting the British

throne, the 1727 paper written by the then Archbishop of York, Lancelot Blackbourne, is an interesting read. The Archbishop glosses over the differences to assure the Anglicans, "For tho' he's a through Protestant without the least Tincture of Popery, either from inclination Example or Education, and no less agreeable to the Principles of the Reformation, as they are consistent with the safety of the National Church, yet he is for Worshipping God with Decency and Order not after the Slovenly way of the Calvinist." Lancelot Blackbourne, *An Exact Account of King George's RELIGION: with the Manner of His Majesty's Worship in the English and Lutheran Church* (Dublin: J. Churchill in Pater Noster Row, 1727), 7.

⁹ Nicholas Hope, *German and Scandinavian Protestantism 1700-1918* (Oxford: Claredon Press, 1995), 36.

¹⁰ Hope, *German and Scandinavian Protestantism*, 36.

¹¹ Hope, *German and Scandinavian Protestantism*, 36.

¹² Hope, *German and Scandinavian Protestantism*, 38-39.

¹³ Hope, *German and Scandinavian Protestantism*, 40.

¹⁴ It is likely, given the exchange and travel of the times, that English clergy were in turn exposed to the pietism of the German Lutheran, Philip Jacob Spener. His seminal book, *Pia Desideria*. Theodore G. Tappert, ed. and trans. (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1964), is still available today.

¹⁵ Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 92.

¹⁶ This would have occurred after the Battle of Quebec (also known as the Battle of the Plains of Abraham) in 1759.

¹⁷ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 7.

¹⁸ John S. Moir, *The Church in the British Era: From the British Conquest to Confederation*. Edited by John Webster Grant (Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Limited, 1972), 12.

¹⁹ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 36.

²⁰ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 36.

²¹ Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 589. The 'Jung Manuscript,' which is neither titled nor listed as such in Bell's bibliography, is an untitled booklet located in the Nova Scotia archives.

²² Bumstead, "Church and State in Maritime Canada," 180.

²³ Bumstead, "Church and State in Maritime Canada," 181.

²⁴ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 7.

²⁵ Moir, *The Church in the British Era*, 3.

²⁶ Bumstead, "Church and State in Maritime Canada," 179.

²⁷ Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 392.

²⁸ Bumstead, "Church and State in Maritime Canada," 184.

²⁹ There were a variety of reasons for this, but the most relevant one was the political state in England during this time. The Church of England was the established national church, and it was controlled "through political patronage like any other branch of government" as Moir, *The Church in the British Era*, 5, notes. Thus, in 1717, the British government suspended Convocation – the parliamentary body of the church – and for 133 years, the Church of England had no governing body, and "its spiritual functions were often subordinated to political purposes:" one these was the continual refusal to establish bishops in the American territories despite repeated demands. See here Moir, *The Church in the British Era*, 5. This period in British history is referred to as an Erastian period, in which both religion and clergy were civil servants. Anglican missionaries – such as those who would first serve the Lutheran congregations and communities in the Maritimes and elsewhere – were "especially directed by the politicians for what were essentially political ends, according to Bumstead, "Church and State in Maritime Canada," 182. Revolutionary spirit could have been avoided if bishoprics had been formed for the sake of keeping loyalty; Moir, *The Church in the British Era*, 5. However, in the light of history, the British colonies in the Maritimes would find difficulties in maintaining cultural distinctions.

³⁰ Bumstead, "Church and State in Maritime Canada," 182.

³¹ Ursula Bohlmann, "The Germans: The Protestant Buffer," *Banked Fires: The Ethics of Nova Scotia*. edited by Douglas F. Campbell (Port Credit, Ontario: Scribblers Press, 1978), 191.

³² Bumstead, "Church and State in Maritime Canada," 183.

³³ David V. J. Bell, "The Loyalist Tradition in Canada." *Canadian History Before Confederation: Essays and Interpretation*, edited by J. M. Bumstead (Georgetown, Ontario: Irwin-Dorsey Limited, 1979), 209.

³⁴ David Bell, "The Loyalist Tradition in Canada," 211.

- ³⁵ David Bell, "The Loyalist Tradition in Canada," 211.
- ³⁶ David Bell, "The Loyalist Tradition in Canada," 223.
- ³⁷ Bohlmann, "The Germans," 193.
- ³⁸ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 36-37.
- ³⁹ Or Bürger, as he is known in Bell. For consistency, this study will keep with the spelling found in Threinen.
- ⁴⁰ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 8.
- ⁴¹ Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 390.
- ⁴² Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 38.
- ⁴³ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 38.
- ⁴⁴ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 10. "The ministers of St. Paul's Church continued to come and hold a communion service at little St. George's three or four times a year. Occasionally Mr. Breyton also conducted a full church service with a sermon, most often, it would seem, in English. The Germans recorded the giving of an honorarium to him on such occasions. They were also careful to preserve an evidence of the fact that he was there as 'guest', laying it down in their rules that their own elder should always preside and that the minister should not introduce any ceremony without the consent of the elder and the churchwardens." Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 626-627.
- ⁴⁵ Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 589; He states, "That the willingness of to unite in one congregation under Anglican regulation was at best somewhat reluctant seems implied pretty clearly by the Assembly's address itself, when it went on: 'which good disposition we are very apprehensive may not prevail so strongly amongst t hem when their circumstances become more affluent.' In other words, being unable to pay ministers of their own persuasions they were willing to accept a German speaking one provided and paid from Anglican sources rather than continue without any pastor of their own at all."
- ⁴⁶ Bumstead, "Church and State in Maritime Canada," 187.
- ⁴⁷ His name is spelled Houseal elsewhere. This study will keep the spelling used by Lehmann.
- ⁴⁸ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 18-19. Hausihl was "ordained in 1752 by the Lutheran authorities in Rotterdam prior to sailing via London to America. But the ship he was travelling was blown off course in a storm. As a result he ended up in Maryland and spent most of his ministry there." Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 9.
- ⁴⁹ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 39. "... although their community had recently grown by Loyalist arrivals, these were without means and the congregation was therefore still too poor to afford full support to a pastor, and asking the Society [SPG] to appoint Mr. Hausihl a missionary to them and grant him a stipend... And as he was without means to go to England for the Anglican ordination prerequisite to his serving as a missionary of the Society, they gave him a gratuity of £40 to enable him to make the journey." Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 628.
- ⁵⁰ Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 628.
- ⁵¹ Moir, *The Church in the British Era*, 12.
- ⁵² Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 39; At the time of Hausihl's death in 1799, St. George's could officially be declared Anglican, and all of its possessions – including their building – became property of the Church of England. See here Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 39.
- ⁵³ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 11.
- ⁵⁴ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 49. Dundas and Stormont are about an hour's drive south of Ottawa, and Bay of Quinte is near Kingston.
- ⁵⁵ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 49.
- ⁵⁶ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 50.
- ⁵⁷ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 50-51.
- ⁵⁸ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 37.
- ⁵⁹ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 51.
- ⁶⁰ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 51.
- ⁶¹ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 51; "When Wiegandt [sic] became an Anglican, he and his supporters assumed that the [church] property belonged to the congregation (now Anglican) of which he was the called minister. However the 'ticket of location' had been granted to the trustees of the congregation in 1793 while it was still Lutheran. Since this was a preliminary step towards granting the full patent for the land, the

Lutherans who dissented from Wiegandt's [sic] pastoral care contended that the property legally belonged to them," as noted by Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 33. On the next page, Threinen notes that a succeeding Lutheran pastor, Rev. Herman Hayunga, was equipped to take on the Anglicans in getting the original church back; however, the courts decided in favour of the Anglicans in 1832.

⁶² Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 51.

⁶³ Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 590.

⁶⁴ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 11.

⁶⁵ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 11.

⁶⁶ Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 591.

⁶⁷ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 12.

⁶⁸ "... the story of Lutheran churches in America really begins with organizing efforts by Henry Melchoir Muhlenberg (1711-1789). Muhlenberg, who had been sent from the pietist center of Halle to provide guidance for the German Lutheran immigrants in colonial Pennsylvania, quickly established himself as a forceful leader, blending orthodox and pietist emphases in strengthening the new immigrant churches." Mark A. Noll, *The Old Religion in a New World: The History of North American Christianity* (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 2002), 238.

⁶⁹ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 12.

⁷⁰ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 12.

⁷¹ Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 596.

⁷² Quoting Muhlenberg's letter to F. W. Pasche, dated May 23 1767. Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 12.

⁷³ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 13.

⁷⁴ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 14.

⁷⁵ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 14-15. Bell notes, "In connection with the change of denomination it is interesting to read what Rev. Heinrich Mühlenberg [sic], overseer of the Lutheran churches in the central American colonies, wrote to the Lutherans of Lunenburg, Nova Scotia, in 1771. He described the Anglicans as 'our closest and best friend and well-wishers... and in short, the doctrine of the English established church is the most similar and closely related of any in the world to our evangelical one...'... One can understand, under the circumstances, that there would be little resentment from such a source at Bryzelius taking orders in the Church of England in order to provide with a German-speaking pastor to a colony that was in need of one." Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 595.

⁷⁶ Moir, *The Church in the British Era*, 19.

⁷⁷ Winthrop Bell, *Foreign Protestants*, 598.

⁷⁸ "The Constitutional Act of 1791 acknowledged the Loyalist fact in Upper Canada by endowing the province with English institutions. Upper Canada would, as far as humanly possible, become another England beyond the Atlantic, with the image and transcript of the English constitution, civil and religious. Such was the plan for the St. Lawrence Valley in the post-Revolutionary era, but time and circumstances decreed that the future province of Ontario should become instead a religiously pluralistic society and, for its first generation at least, a society that seemed very American in many of its attitudes and habits." Moir, *The Church in the British Era*, 80.

⁷⁹ Lehmann, *The German Canadians*, 40.

⁸⁰ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 29.

⁸¹ Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 21.

⁸² Threinen, *A Religious-Cultural Mosaic*, 21. In this sense, and presumably that of the author as well, episcopal would mean following ecclesial oversight in the historical usage of apostolic succession (the historic episcopate, involving the laying on of hands during the consecration of a bishop as a sign of physical connection to the lineage of the apostles), and consistorial usage, meaning the missional sense of apostolic succession (the calling of a person to a particular office of ministry and the church, in recognition of this, ordaining or consecrating the person to that ministry; this puts the focus more on the ministry and fellowship of the apostles than having a historical connection).